

- Compulsory military education at the age of 18
At this stage those who are not found fit for compulsory military education & further education will join the producer class.
- At the age of 20 there will be a test to filter those who have capacity for further learning, & rest will join the soldier class.

2nd stage : Stage of Higher Learning.

20-35

~~35-50~~

20-35

- In this stage, disciplines like mathematics, geometry, literature, philosophy, dialectics will be taught.

3rd stage . (35-50)

35-50 Age of practical learning.

- The person who completes 50 yr of education becomes eligible for philosopher king/queens.

How to select a philosopher to play role of King?

- According to Plato philosophers will be given responsibility by turn. Philosophers having real knowledge have no eagerness to rule. Their first love is knowledge & not power. However they will accept to become the kings as their moral duties towards their motherland. They will sacrifice their first love for the sake of motherland. Philosopher

king is a symbol of sacrifice. According to Plato, "Those states are best governed where the rulers are most reluctant to govern^o rather than eager to govern".

except censorship, good education system.

Evaluation of his theory of education:

- Plato should be appreciated for giving so much attention on the issue of education in such a comprehensive manner.
- Plato's thoughts have influenced the western countries where we find that almost every state has a provision for free & compulsory school education.
- What we cannot appreciate is his advocacy for complete censorship of the state of education system. According to the critics his education system aims at producing obedient citizens.

Theory of Communism

- What is communism?
- Comparison betⁿ Plato's Communism & Modern Communism
- Reasons for as to why Plato suggests communism
- Aristotle's criticism for Plato's communism.

The meaning of communism is common ownership against private ownership.

Plato's communism is about

1. Communism of property.
2. Communism of family.

Plato's communism is only for 2 classes.

1. Ruling class / Philosophers.
2. Soldiers

Why communism only for 2 classes?

- Karl Marx prescribes communism for everyone, but Plato does not prescribe communism for the producer class.

Reasons.

- The element of appetite dominates in this class so they will not be able to sacrifice their love for property.
- It is not needed because they will not be in the ruling structure.

Why communism for the ruling class?

Communism of property will tackle the problem of corruption & communism of family will tackle the problem of nepotism or favoritism of any sort.

Possibility of communism of ruling class.

- There will not be any difficulty because the ruling class have no lust for money

How important is communism?

Education is more important than communism. Communism is only a supplementary mechanism. Education system is a prime mechanism to produce a philosopher class.

- The philosophers already know the things which are desirable & undesirable.

- Communism is just a matter of extra precaution to offset any possibility of corruption.

Communism of family

3/8/14

Communism of Family:

- Plato does not allow ruling class to own private families
- For Plato, family is a bigger evil than property.
- Man accumulates property, primarily for its family.
- Communism of family also implies that all children will be taken care of by the state.
- This will ensure that the ruling class will treat all children equally without any favouritism.
- It will also allow women to participate in public sphere as state is taking care of the children.
- In Plato, we also see the proposal of communism of wives. Marriage will be controlled by the state. A state will decide who will marry whom. Plato also had eugenic purpose. He wanted to produce the best Athenian race, thus state is to decide the marriage partners.

Critical Evaluation of Plato's Communism

- Aristotle has criticised Plato for his views on family & private property.

Aristotle's views on private property.

- Plato neglects the functional aspects of private property & looks at only the dysfunctional aspects.
- Private property is a time tested institution.
- It provides sense of security, sense of achievement & motivation for better performance.
- For Aristotle, property is a sacred institution.
- Private property results into better upkeep of property.
- He held that "Everyone's property is no one's responsibility".
- Aristotle also criticise Plato for undermining the institution of marriage & family. Private family & marriage are also time tested institutions. Marriage not to be seen as simply an institution for procreation. Marriage & family provides emotional stability. According to him ending these institutions & going back to the system of communism of family is not moving forward but going back to barbaric ages.

Other criticisms of Plato

Karl Popper

- Karl Popper considers Plato as "Enemy of open society".

~~Bayles~~

- He considers Plato as forerunner of fascism as Plato constructs the myth of metals & believes in racialism /superior race, etc.

Conclusion of Communism

- It is true that property & family have corrupting influence. Plato's diagnosis is correct but his prescriptions are not acceptable.
- His theory goes against human psychology. We can think of other alternatives to tackle these problems.

Comparison betⁿ Plato's communism & Modern Communism.

Modern Communism	Platonic Communism.
- 20 th century phenomenon	Ancient Greece 337 BC
- Karl Marx - Father of Modern Communism.	Plato
- Marx communism is for the protection of working classes from the exploitation by the capitalist.	Plato's communism was to tackle the problem of corruption among the ruling classes.
- In Marx, communism is for all, no one is allowed to possess private property.	Communism is limited to only 2 classes, ruling class & the soldiers.
- Karl Marx does not talk about communism of family & marriage	Plato talks about communism of family & marriage also.
- For Karl Marx, state is an instrument of exploitation. Hence Marx's communism is a stateless society	Plato views state as a source of virtue & aims to create an ideal state
- Karl Marx believed in equality & aims to create a classless society	Plato believed in natural inequality. Plato's ideal state is a class divided society

ontology

- Marx's method of bringing communism is by violent revolution.

Plato's method is through education system.

- Karl Marx is materialist.

Plato is idealist.

Conclusion

- Similarities are superficial as both consider private property as an evil and talk about common ownership of property. However there are fundamental differences betⁿ the two.

Plato's Theory of Philosopher King

Purpose :

- to create an ideal state because he thinks that until philosophers are the rulers or rulers learn philosophy we can not achieve good governance.

The idea justifying the institution of Philosopher King

- Knowledge is Virtue.

If Athens is to become a virtuous state, it has to be ruled by the most knowledgeable person.

Who is Philosopher King & what are his qualifications.

- Philosopher king is a symbol of knowledge & sacrifice, - gone through the rigorous process of education
- Does not own property or family

Powers of Philosopher King:

- Philosopher King is supreme as far as the ordinary law of the land is concerned. He can't be restricted by public opinion or the book of the law.
- According to Plato it is not wise to restrict an expert practitioner of medicine with the book of medicine. Similarly, it is not wise to limit the philosopher king with book of law or public opinion.

Limitations on Philosopher King:

- He is above the ordinary law but not above the basic law or fundamental law or constitution.
- He can't change the constitution of ideal state proposed by Plato.

Advantage of the rule of Philosopher King over Rule of law according to Plato

- Law represents average wisdom whereas philosopher king has ultimate knowledge.

- Law is rigid whereas philosopher king can be flexible as per the situation.

- There are no. of issues on which law is silent & it is natural to use personal wisdom.

Critical Evaluation of Theory of Philosopher King

- Aristotle has criticised Plato for sacrificing good for the sake of best, because best is unachievable.

- Having a Philosopher King can be a good idea, but it is not a practicable idea. Even if we find a person who can be considered as the Philosopher in true sense, there is no guarantee that he will not go corrupt, as it is well known that

'Power corrupts. An absolute power corrupts absolutely'.

Hence there has to be separation of powers and system of checks & balances.

- There are many examples where authoritarian leaders have manipulated Plato's suggestions w.r.t. the powers of the Philosopher King & exploited their own people.

Plato himself realized the impracticalities of his ideas & modified his opinion & reestablished the supremacy of the rule of law in his book "The Laws".

"Aristotle is the greatest disciple of Plato as well as the greatest critic of Plato."

Explain the statement.

Aristotle as the greatest disciple of Plato

- Both belong to the Socratic tradition and are critics of sophists.
- Both consider state as natural & necessary
- Both consider that man is social by nature
- Both believe in natural inequality. Plato justifies the inequality among souls with the help of myth of metals & Aristotle considers slavery as natural.
- Both are ~~eth~~ethnocentric in nature
- Both are critics of democracy.
- It is said that Aristotle's ideal state is Plato's second best state.
- For both Plato & Aristotle there is no diff. betⁿ Politics & ethics.

Aristotle as the greatest critic of Plato

- Aristotle has criticised institutions like Philosopher King, communism of family & property.
- The perspective of two differ as Plato is perfectionist whereas Aristotle is moderate.
- Plato wants to establish an ideal state whereas Aristotle is concerned with "best practicable state".
- Plato is radical in his views whereas Aristotle is conservative in his views.

Plato as first feminist / Should Plato be regarded as a feminist thinker.

Who is a feminist thinker?

- Feminism is a school of thought which aims at ending discrimination against women & to uplift the status of women in society.

Reasons for considering Plato as feminist.

- He provides equality of opportunity to women in context of getting educated & to become the philosopher queens.

- His communism of family relieves women from responsibility of child rearing & give them opportunity to join the public sphere

~~- On the other hand -~~

On the other hand some scholars do not think him as feminist thinker because his main concern was the creation of ideal state. It is true that in his ideal state women will have better opportunities but it is the byproduct of his theory of state. Plato was much ahead of his times & must be appreciated for not making any discrimination against women in context of joining political offices.

Plato as forerunner of fascism

What is fascism?

- Fascism is not regarded as a political ideology or systematic school of thought. It is regarded as political opportunism. It is regarded as purely a power politics with no regard for ethics or humanity. It is difficult to deal with fascism in a systematic sense like other ideologies. Scholars define features of fascism on the basis of understanding the political system established by Mussolini & Hitler during inter-war period.
- Fascism is against democracy
- Fascism supports elitism
- Fascist believe that common man does not have ability to participate in politics.
- Fascists give importance to leaders. They project leader as superman. They support hero worship & unquestionable obedience to the leader.
- Fascists do not believe in rights & liberties. only talk about the duties of citizens towards the state.
- Fascist do not support equality of sexes & confine women to the traditional role. They pursue imperialist foreign policies.
- Fascism believes in irrationalism & politics of passion over politics of reason.

- Fascism is considered as a threat to humanity & international peace.

Plato as a forerunner of fascism is a matter of debate. Scholars like Karl Popper call Plato as Father of fascism. He considers Plato as an enemy of open society. He writes that Plato's political programme far from being morally superior to fascism was actually identical to it.

Reasons for treating Plato as fascist are

- Plato gives primacy to state
- Plato creates a regimented society with no scope of liberty.
- Plato expects supreme sacrifices from the citizens in the interest of the state.
- Plato is also ethnocentric in approach
- Plato's Philosopher King is a superman possessing ultimate knowledge & above the laws.

There are scholars like Levenson who adopt more sympathetic approach towards Plato suggest that we are comparing the uncomparables. There is a big gap of time & space betⁿ Plato & fascism. We can give following reasons to show that Plato's political programme was morally superior to fascism & not identical to it.

19-Plato gives importance to reason

- Plato's aim was to create an ideal state.
- Plato does not create & exploitative system
- Plato talks about equality of sexes.
- Plato's ideal state was not a threat to humanity.
- He does not talk about imperialist or aggressive policies.
- Plato's ideal state remains an utopia whereas world has witnessed negative repercussions of fascism.

To conclude we can say that similarities are superficial & differences are fundamental.

4/8/14

Plato as a forerunner of totalitarianism

What is totalitarianism?

Totalitarianism / Totalitarian state is which controls all spheres of human life, public as well as personal. ex. Afghanistan under Taliban govt. can be treated as an example of totalitarian state.

Difference betⁿ Totalitarianism & Authoritarianism

- Authoritarianism can be treated as anti-thesis to democracy, like govt. not recognising political freedom. However doesn't interfere in personal sphere.

• It is customary among western scholars to regard Communist regimes, Fascist regimes as Totalitarianism.

Liberal scholars like Karl Popper & contemporary scholar like Hannah Arendt has provided the analysis of totalitarian state. Karl Popper's book "Open Society & Its Enemies" project communism & fascism as an example of totalitarianism.

Hannah Arendt in her work titled "On Totalitarianism" has held that totalitarian regimes are sustained on the basis of political myths. She considers totalitarianism as a reign of terror & violence.

Grounds for considering Plato as forerunner of Totalitarianism

- state is supreme, citizens have no political freedom, neither with respect to their occupation, nor with respect to their family & marriage.
- State controls both, the public & the personal sphere of citizens' life.

However it will not be justified to call Plato a totalitarian thinker. There are some superficial similarities. But Plato's ideal state can not be equated with the Stalinist regime or Hitler's regime.

Plato does not advocate terror & violence. The concern of Plato was the wellbeing of the citizens & to make Athens a virtuous state.

Position of Plato in the history of Western Political Philosophy

- Plato as a father of Political Philosophy
- Entire western Political Philosophy is nothing but footnote to Plato.
- You can be either Platonic or anti-Platonic (Karl Popper) but can never be non-Platonic.

Plato as a father of Political Philosophy

• Plato can be regarded as the father of Political Philosophy for following reasons.

→ He was concerned with understanding the essence of governance. He wanted ruling class to understand that public offices are not for private ends. Thus he was trying to understand the philosophy of governance.

- He has developed the theory of Ideas.

He has shown that how idea is superior to matter. He has shown that why it is more important for the ruling class to understand the idea of governance.

- Plato has shown the use of dialectical approach to explore the philosophy of governance which became the prominent methodology in the discipline of Political Science or Politics.

→ Dialectics, concept of true knowledge & the theme of Idea emerges in Socrates. But Socrates has not dealt with the issue of governance in particular. Hence instead of Socrates, Plato to be regarded as Father of Political Philosophy.

Entire Western political philosophy is nothing but footnote to Plato

Above statement explains the contribution of Plato in the field of western political philosophy. He is regarded as Father of Political Philosophy. We see origin of many schools of Thought from his works like, Political Idealism, Communism, Feminism, Fascism, etc. Hence it is said that entire western Political Philosophy is nothing but footnote to Plato. Plato's contribution is recognized even by his greatest critics. ex. Aristotle & Karl Popper. Aristotle was greatest critic of Plato but at the same time greatest disciple of Plato & incorporates many ideas of Plato regarding state, society, relation betⁿ ethics & politics.

Karl Popper, who is considered as the greatest contemporary critic of Plato has acknowledged that one can be either Platonic or anti-Platonic but can never be non-Platonic. No student of political science can overlook Plato. He is a father of political philosophy, source of many schools of thoughts. One may agree with Plato or disagree with him but cannot overlook him. Political philosophy developed further in response to Plato's thoughts.

Reality is the shadow of ideas - Plato

Comment.

- Plato's view of reality.

- What is his conception of reality.

- 2 types of reality material & idea.

- why he is saying so: idea is real

- sources of influence

- Your understanding of his purpose. ↗

- Explain political purpose.

- This is Plato's conception of reality.

He classifies reality into 2 types

First the material reality which he calls as a world of appearances. Plato considers

material reality not as a reality but the shadow of reality.

- He considers reality as the idea. Reality belongs to the world of ideas. He establishes

the supremacy of idea over reality (material things).

- He applies Socrates' Theory of Knowledge to support his Theory of Ideas. We can't

have ultimate knowledge about the things which are changing in nature. We can have

ultimate knowledge about the things which are eternal. Plato wants that the ruling

class should understand the idea of governance

It is because of the ignorance of the ruling class, that the problems of corruption arises.

Once Ruling class gets the true knowledge or idea of governance, we can resolve the

problems of political life. Thus he builds his Theory of ideal state on the Theory of Ideas & justifies the rule of Philosopher King.

- There are 2 aspects in the statement. First is the nature of reality & Second the necessity of understanding the idea of governance.
- The nature of reality remains a debatable issue among political scholars. However Plato is to be appreciated for his emphasis on the necessity of understanding the idea of governance by the ruling class.

State is individual writ large - Plato

- ~~what is he trying to say?~~
- A state is magnified version of individual. It implies that a state is the collection of individuals. A state represents the collective ^{what?} life of individuals. (A state is natural & necessary because man cannot fulfill all his needs on his own).
- Plato makes this statement in the context ^{why? purpose} of giving his Theory of Ideal State & his Idea of Justice.
- Plato's idea of justice is derived from the idea of justice as found at the level of individual.
- A just man is where reason controls courage & appetite. A just personality is where all

elements are properly placed. He mentions the virtue of temperance (self control) as an essential element for just personality.

- Since a state is magnified version of individual the principles of justice applicable in context of individual are also applicable at the level of state.

- A just or an ideal state is where reason dominates courage & appetite. All the three classes perform the task according to the dominant characteristic of their soul, exercise temperance & not interfere in each others' task. Plato first explains the principles of justice at the level of state than at the level of individual because the state is a magnified form & it is easier to understand in capital letters, than in small letters.

- By suggesting that same principles will apply for both individual & the state he is showing that there should not be any difference betⁿ ethics and politics. This makes Plato an idealist thinker.

Plato's thoughts are different from that of Machiavelli who suggests dual morality.

Plato's Theory of Education is the logical result of his conception of Justice.

relⁿ betⁿ edu & Justice.

what is justice : 3 classes.

to implement: education is needed.

promote equality of sexes, etc. extra.

All that is Platonic is Socratic

- influence of Socrates on Plato.

- Who was Socrates : Plato disciple of Socrates

considered him as wisest man.

how he has impacted plato.

knowledge is virtue, dialectics.

- main character in his book.

- partially correct : other influences as well

his own ideas also added. (Philosopher King, Communism)

platonic is more ~~go~~ than Socratic.

Allegory of Caves.

Life cycle of an ideal state given by Plato.

Even if ideal state is established it will change because change is the law of nature. Plato views change as a fall. First stage: Rule of Philosopher King (Rule of Monarchy).

Second Stage: Power will come in the hand of soldiers. (Timocracy)

Third stage: " rich (Oligarchy)
many, poor, ignorant

next Tyranny
Philosopher King again.

Ruling class should know the reason of governance.