



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 747)

Name of Candidate	Digvijay Bodke		
Medium Hindi/Eng.	English	Registration Number	22132
Center	(Online)	Date	22/9/16

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5(a)	10	
5(b)	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	20	
14	20	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

Signature of Examiner

INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are FOURTEEN questions printed in HINDI and ENGLISH.
इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं तथा हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory.
सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

Answer the following questions is not more than 150 words each.

1. (a) A broad ethical framework as a guiding light for international relations will not only ensure harmonious relations between nations but will also lead to progress of the human race. Discuss with examples. 10
- अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संबंधों के लिए प्रकाश स्तंभ के रूप में एक व्यापक नैतिक ढांचा न केवल राष्ट्रों के बीच सामंजस्यपूर्ण संबंध सुनिश्चित करेगा बल्कि मानव जाति का विकास भी सुनिश्चित करेगा। सोदाहरण चर्चा कीजिए।

International relations are often driven today by narrow interests disguised as national foreign policy.

If a broad ethical framework is followed as guideline for such relations, it could lead to following positive outcomes:

eg: ① If ^{sovereignty over} high seas is disregarded & the resources are distributed as per international law, then the present South China Sea dispute could get solved.

② If in climate negotiations, developed nations take responsibility for their historic emissions, then climate agreements will have more chances of succeeding.

Thus we can see in above examples, the acceptance of moral responsibility & respect for globally accepted norms which is a part of ethical way of international relations.

leads to harmonious relation.

This also ensures progress
of human race because today
nuclear
conflicts between nations have
potential for destruction of human
race. As human race progresses
because humans attain next
level of maturity in co-existence
on this planet.

1. (b) What does inequality mean to you? What are the different kinds of inequality? Is inequality morally wrong? 10

असमानता से आप क्या समझते हैं? असमानता के विभिन्न प्रकार क्या हैं? क्या असमानता नैतिक रूप से गलत है?

Inequality means a position / outcome of any event / phenomenon which leads to unequal allocation / distribution of resources / opportunity.

It means unequal terms for different people who ought to have been equal based on commonly accepted principles.

Following are the different kinds of inequality:

Economic: This means disparity in income levels, standard of living.

Social: This means unequal status in a society based on attributes like caste, religion, color, language.

Political: This means unequal civil rights amongst people. Like some people don't have right to vote.

The question of inequality being morally wrong depends upon the factors responsible for inequality eg. If inequality is social based on

cart, then it is morally wrong since all humans are born equal & one doesn't choose one's cart.

But inequality can be an outcome of natural processes. e.g. Economic growth in industrialised society is characterised by inequality in the beginning. This per se is not morally wrong. But if efforts are not made to address this inequality, then it becomes morally wrong.

Thus inequality ~~is~~ ^{may be} morally wrong, but not addressing it, definitely is wrong.

2. (a) One has a moral responsibility to disobey unjust laws. In light of this statement, examine the relevance of civil disobedience in a modern democratic society. Discuss the duties and responsibilities of a law enforcing officer in such situations.

10

अन्यायपूर्ण कानूनों की अवज्ञा करना हमारा नैतिक दायित्व है। इस कथन के प्रकाश में, आधुनिक लोकतांत्रिक समाज में सविनय अवज्ञा की प्रासंगिकता का परिक्षण कीजिए। ऐसी परिस्थितियों में एक कानून प्रवर्तन अधिकारी के कर्तव्यों तथा दायित्वों की चर्चा कीजिए।

Disobeying unjust laws shows a person's commitment to accepted principles of human rights. Such defiance was common in authoritarian ~~rules~~ where laws were arbitrary & framed by despotic ~~rules~~. However in modern democratic societies, such laws are difficult to legislate since the legislators are elected by the people & are responsible to the electorate. Moreover laws in a democracy are framed with wide consultation with the public. Thus laws made have high degree of legitimacy even if they are unjust. However civil disobedience cannot be ruled out completely even in democratic society because sometimes rule of majority may lead to abrogation of rights of minority if not protected.

In instances of unjust laws, law enforcing officer has following duties & responsibilities:

- Implement the law in spirit since law has democratic backing.
- Be considerate if law is extremely harsh & immoral.
- Obey the orders from seniors since it is a matter of duty.
- Try to ensure least harm ^{due to} the implementation of the law.

This focus should be on balancing conscience & duty. & role of empathy, compassion is paramount.

2. (b) Ensuring accountability in the administration just adds another layer in the bureaucratic process. Examine. Differentiate between accountability and responsibility. Suggest some measures through which administrative accountability can be made more effective in India. 10

प्रशासन में जवाबदेही (Accountability) सुनिश्चित करना नौकरशाही प्रक्रिया में एक और स्तर जोड़ देता है। परीक्षण कीजिए। जवाबदेही और उत्तरदायित्व (Responsibility) के बीच अंतर स्पष्ट कीजिए। कुछ ऐसे उपाय बताइए जिससे भारत में प्रशासनिक जवाबदेही को और अधिक प्रभावी बनाया जा सके।

Accountability can be $\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{internal} \\ \text{external} \end{array} \right.$

It is only in internal accountability mechanism which leads to addition of ~~an~~ layer of bureaucratic process while ~~is~~ ensuring accountability.

When accountability is external it serves as an efficient way, giving scope to civilians in ensuring accountability.

Accountability refers to answerability of a person in power/position/authority about various actions/decisions taken by him/her & their consequences.

Responsibility, on the other hand, refers to internal & moral standard imposed upon a person due to him/her holding a position/authority. Accountability is external to person but

responsibility comes from within,
from conscience & societal values.

Administrative accountability can
be made more effective in India
by:

- Improving value system of society.
- ~~Ex~~ Participation of citizens.
- Transparent procedures.
- ^{swift} Punishment to the guilty.
- Increased information dissemination to citizens.
- Attitudes of high standard of governance demanded.
- Use of Information technology.
- ~~Use~~ • Stringent laws & enforcement.

3. (a) "Morality is based neither on the principle of utility, nor on a law of nature, but on human reason. But human reason can be fallible." Comment., What does morality mean to you? 10
- "नैतिकता न तो उपयोगिता (utility) के सिद्धांत पर आधारित है और न ही प्रकृति के नियम पर, बल्कि यह मानवीय विवेक पर आधारित है। किंतु मानवीय विवेक दोषपूर्ण हो सकते हैं।" टिप्पणी कीजिए। आपके लिए नैतिकता का क्या अर्थ है?

Morality is a set of instructions which guides a person's behaviour. The foundation principle of morality was not that it should have some materialistic use or morality being the way of life on earth.

The principle behind it was human reason. Human awareness & consciousness distinguishes him from other animals. These aspects give rise to morality as a guiding lighthouse in uncertain environment found in a human life. This human intellect is reflected in morality.

But morality is not same for everyone. As all humans are different from each other intellectually, their notion of right & wrong too are different. Thus morality if based on values like dishonesty, anger, revenge, etc will be a bad

guidance for one's behaviour. Thus human reason in such cases is fallible based upon a person's value system & external environment.

eg. Adolf Hitler morally defended extermination of Jews since he felt Jews were responsible for Germany's defeat in world war I. This shows how morality varies from person to person.

For me morality is an empty paper which is to be filled by the person himself based on good values like compassion, empathy, righteousness. Morality thus should be a blueprint of one's good values.

3. (b) For effective public service delivery, the need today is to move from traditional accountability mechanisms to social accountability through greater civic engagement. Discuss with examples. 10

प्रभावी सार्वजनिक सेवा वितरण हेतु, जवाबदेहिता (Accountability) की पारंपरिक प्रणाली के स्थान पर अधिकाधिक नागरिक भागीदारी के माध्यम से सामाजिक जवाबदेही प्रणाली की ओर अग्रसर होना वर्तमान समय की आवश्यकता है। उदाहरण सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

Public service delivery has long suffered from poor quality, delayed times & high costs. This is mainly due to reliance on traditional accountability mechanisms such as laws, departmental vigilance etc. Such mechanisms have failed mainly because these measures are part of the same bureaucracy which it seeks to improve. This creates conflict of interest & mutual rent seeking.

But social accountability mechanisms like social audit, RTI act are more effective because:

- Role of citizens ensures beneficiaries of services have a say in improving them.
- Citizens will be more vigilant.
- It is impossible to bribe citizens.

ex: ① Social audit Mazdoor Kisan Sanjathana Rajarthan has improved outcomes from MGNREGA.

② Formation of state & district resource persons & village social audits in Telangana has reduced corruption in governmental schemes.

Thus civic engagement is a ~~new~~ moral viewpoint as they ought to check how they are governed. ~~It's~~ effectiveness boosts moral standards with economic & administrative sense & should be encouraged.

4. (a) What do you mean by social justice? Explain with examples, why it is imperative for a society to promote social justice. 10

सामाजिक न्याय से आप क्या समझते हैं? उदाहरण सहित व्याख्या कीजिए कि सामाजिक न्याय को प्रोत्साहित करना किसी समाज के लिए क्यों अनिवार्य है?

Social justice means ensuring rights + ~~following~~ adherence to rule of law in social matters.

It essentially mean redressal of grievances of any social group who feels its rights have been ~~ab~~ denied or it has been discriminated against. eg. denying someone employment because of a person's caste/religion/race etc is social injustice.

It is imperative to promote social justice in a society because:

- It ensures social ~~harmony~~ ^{cohesion}
- Without it, it could lead to social tension & civil war.
- Denying social justice goes against accepted ethical behaviour.
- Social justice is based on a simple principle that all humans are born equal & ought to be treated equitably in social sphere.

- Social justice also promotes economic & human development
- It also is essential for society to advance in ~~into~~ moral & ethical spheres.

eg. examples:

- ① denial of social justice to African American slaves led to US civil war (1860-1869)
- ② denial of social justice to scheduled castes allowed Britishers to reap faults in India's society.
- ③ countries with social justice (Nordic countries) perform best in ~~a~~ human welfare indicators.

4. (b) Investigative reporting by media can be a significant source of information on corruption. What are ethical issues involved in investigative journalism? What safeguards can be introduced to prevent its misuse? 10
मीडिया द्वारा खोजी (इनवेस्टिगेटिव) रिपोर्टिंग भ्रष्टाचार संबंधी सूचना का महत्वपूर्ण स्रोत हो सकती है। खोजी पत्रकारिता से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं? इसके दुरुपयोग को रोकने के लिए कौन से सुरक्षा उपाय आरंभ किए जा सकते हैं?

Investigative reporting can be a vital tool to report & curb corruption because it not only shows the extent of corruption but also aids uncover the extent, stakeholders, & vested interests ~~with~~ involved with adequate proof.

However following ethical issues are involved in it:

- Rights of the accused:

It often leads to public believing all accused as guilty & permanently defames them even if they are acquitted by court of law.

- Procedures followed:

Investigations by media often involve bribing to retrieve crucial information. This means are sacrificed to achieve ends.

- Harassment of innocent officials:

By blackmailing officials through reporting of corruption.

- Often media exaggerates reportage for viewership, which may mislead the viewer

Allowing safeguards can be introduced to prevent its misuse:

- Ensure transparency in investigative procedures.
- Institutional safeguards for officials so that they don't get harassed.
eg: sanction from higher officer before prosecution.
- Ethical norms for media in such procedures.
- Keeping identities disclosed until courts decide on the matter.

5. (a) While transplantation of organs represents one of the most spectacular achievements of modern medical science, it has raised many ethical issues as well. Discuss. Also, examine the issues related to organ transplantation in India. 10

यद्यपि अंग प्रत्यारोपण आधुनिक चिकित्सा विज्ञान की सर्वाधिक प्रभावशाली उपलब्धियों में से एक का प्रतिनिधित्व करती है, तथापि इसने कई नैतिक मुद्दे भी खड़े किए हैं। चर्चा कीजिए। साथ ही, भारत में अंग प्रत्यारोपण से जुड़े मुद्दों का भी परीक्षण कीजिए।

Transplantation of organs represent man's technological prowess to modify nature's order. It has raised following ethical issues:

- Consent of the donor:
This is ^{often} not taken or taken for granted.
- Commercialising such organs
which should normally be altruistic.
- Health of donors: is often overlooked leading to complications in future.
- We still don't know complete impacts of such transplants. ~~Is it~~ still we go ahead to perform them risking future generations.
- Criminal rackets are born due to high costs of such organs, leading to denial of rights of many.

Following issues related to organ transplantation have arisen in India:

- The process has gone underground making it difficult to monitor
- The procedures are available only in select hospitals which are unaffordable for many.
- Deaths related to such transplant are increasing.
- The poor are often ~~co~~coerced into "donating" organs.
- Rise of criminal networks poses security threat.

5. (b) There can be honesty without integrity, but no integrity without honesty. Do you agree? Justify your stand with examples. 10

सत्यनिष्ठा के बिना ईमानदारी संभव है, किंतु ईमानदारी के बिना सत्यनिष्ठा संभव नहीं है। क्या आप इससे सहमत हैं? उदाहरण सहित अपने मत का औचित्य सिद्ध कीजिए।

Integrity refers to presence of honest behaviour, uprightness in dealings with others, adherence to one's commitments & public service values.

Thus honesty is an integral part of integrity. ~~Moreover~~ Thus the above statement is not completely right, ^{or wrong} ~~its second part is no integrity & it depends upon situation & context.~~

eg: ① A civil servant may be honest in all his dealings but he doesn't uphold other public service values like empathy, commitment to one's duties, then he is not a person of integrity.

② Once a person/situation becomes dishonest, then integrity is lost immediately & no amount of good work can repair it.

The examples show that the statement is largely right-concerned with public service.

Another example where a person can be honest without integrity is ^{being honest about} US + UK bombing ^{Afghani} ~~Iran~~ for terrorists but also fulfilling other ulterior motives like control of middle eastern geopolitics.

6. "It is not always the same thing to be a good person and a good citizen." Explain the meaning of this statement and analyse its implications for a democratic society.

10

"अच्छा व्यक्ति होना और अच्छा नागरिक होना हमेशा समान बात नहीं होती है।" इस कथन के अर्थ की व्याख्या कीजिए और लोकतांत्रिक समाज के लिए इसके निहितार्थों का विश्लेषण कीजिए।

A good person is one who adheres to commonly accepted ethical values & moral rules.

A good citizen is one who adheres to legal enactments of a nation, performs his duties & contributes well to nation building.

Both these aspects need not be same always because sometimes ethical values are in conflict with legal enactments.

Also following all duties & ethical values can create crisis of conscience along with value conflicts. e.g. a good person adores merit, but social justice like reservations demands equity which can come in conflict with values like merit.

The above statement has following implications for a democratic society:

- It recognises the need to reconcile laws with ethical norms to reduce conflict between the two.
- It provides a litmus test ^{made} for rules by governments & their consonance with societal values.
- It shows one cannot please everybody with his/her acts.
- It shows certain aspects of life are contradictory & one must respect the rights of others.
- It provides a basis why we need values even in societies governed by laws made by state. & thus underscores role of emotional intelligence.

7. Value of compassion towards the weak extends the limits of operations of a public servant by introducing flexibility but dilutes the principle of objectivity. Discuss. If a conflict arises between the value of compassion and principle of objectivity, how will you deal with it as a public servant? 10
- कमजोर के प्रति करुणा की भावना रखने की महत्ता किसी लोकसेवक के कार्यक्षेत्र की सीमाओं में लोचशीलता लाकर उसे विस्तारित करती है, किंतु वस्तुनिष्ठता के सिद्धांत को निर्बल करती है। चर्चा कीजिए। यदि करुणा की महत्ता और वस्तुनिष्ठता के सिद्धांत के बीच संघर्ष पैदा होता है, तो एक लोक सेवक के रूप में आप इस परिस्थिति से किस प्रकार निपटेंगे?

Value of compassion not only means to put oneself in others position & feel their pain but also make efforts to reduce their sufferings.

Compassion towards the weak introduces flexibility in public service because one doesn't become rule bound here. ~~state~~ But this reduces objectivity because compassion in itself is subjective & when decisions are made on basis of compassion subjectivity is bound to occur ~~from~~ ^{for} each & every person may feel more or less compassion depends upon their value system.

Thus compassion by its ^{strong} nature induces a person to often overlook norms & thus

creates subjective outcomes.

If a conflict arises between compassion & objectivity, following can be done as a public servant:

- Asking oneself can I defend my act?
- Can I answer if my action undergoes scrutiny?
- Are my actions punishable by law?
- What will be the implication of my actions on my career?

If these questions are answered honestly, the dilemma of compassion & objectivity disappears. One is presented with clear decision to make.

8. Which administrator had a lasting impact on your decision to join the civil services and why? Should administrators have increased media presence so that the common man can know more about their efforts and achievements? Justify your stand. 10

किस प्रशासक ने लोक सेवाओं में सम्मिलित होने के आपके निर्णय पर अमिट छाप छोड़ी और क्यों? क्या प्रशासक को मीडिया की उपस्थिति को बढ़ाना चाहिए जिससे सामान्य जनता उनके प्रयासों और उपलब्धियों के बारे में अधिक जानकारी प्राप्त कर सके? अपने मत का औचित्य सिद्ध कीजिए।

[EXIPS, Kerala cadre]

Mr Ajit Dorai, had a lasting impact on my decision to join civil services. This was because:

- Mr Dorai's frank & practical nature appeals to me.
- Mr Dorai's position of National Security Advisor encourages me to join civil services.
- Mr Dorai's role as a spy portrays civil services as an adventurous job although all aspects may not be as adventurous as spying.
- Mr Dorai's love for the nation brings out the patriot in me.

Administrators often don't have much media presence but should remain that way because:

- Anonymity is an essential civil service value.
- Civil servants are just implementers of policies/decisions taken by political executives.
- Since civil servants don't face any slack for wrong policies of politicians, they shouldn't get much credit for their good decision of politician.
- Good efforts/achievements of civil servants should be rewarded monetarily through increased salary or by quicker promotion.
- Greater media attention would also pose unnecessary scrutiny in a life of a civil servant.

9. You are a Secretary in a government department. Your Minister has proposed an unemployment grant, which is expected to cost the public exchequer heavily. Having already taken the decision, he asks you to come up with research to support the scheme. Despite your best efforts, you fail to find socio-economic benefit in it. You approach the Minister with relevant facts and studies and ask him to reconsider his decision. Instead, he asks you to suppress the negative impacts and actively promote the scheme through mass media as the perceived social impacts are more important than economic impacts.

Elections are due in a short time and the political party currently in power is expected to win. You are also due for promotion at the same time. You are expected to fully cooperate in the situation and make the scheme a success, however flawed its foundations may be.

(a) List the different stakeholders in the above situation and mention their prospective interests.

(b) Discuss the ethical dilemma which you face in this situation.

(c) Some of the alternatives for you to handle the situation could be:

- Do as asked by the Minister..
- Insist on publication of results and let the public decide whether it wants the scheme.
- Call a press conference and brief the media about the results and the callous attitude of the Minister.

Suggest any other possible option(s). Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it.

20

आप एक सरकारी विभाग में सचिव हैं। आपके मंत्री ने बेरोजगारी भत्ता का प्रस्ताव स्वीकृत किया है, जिससे सरकारी खजाने पर अत्यधिक बोझ पड़ने की संभावना है। चूँकि उन्होंने पहले से ही इस पर निर्णय ले लिया है, अतः वे इस योजना के समर्थन में आपसे शोध करके आने को कहते हैं। आपके द्वारा सर्वोत्तम प्रयास किए जाने के बावजूद भी, आपको इसमें कोई सामाजिक-आर्थिक लाभ दिखाई नहीं पड़ रहा है। आप संबंधित तथ्यों और अध्ययनों के साथ मंत्री के पास जाते हैं और उनसे अपने निर्णय पर पुनर्विचार करने का आग्रह करते हैं। चूँकि इस योजना के कथित सामाजिक प्रभाव, आर्थिक प्रभाव की अपेक्षा अधिक महत्वपूर्ण हैं, अतः अपने निर्णय पर पुनर्विचार करने की अपेक्षा वे आपसे इसके नकारात्मक प्रभाव को छिपाने और इस योजना को जनसंचार माध्यम की सहायता से सक्रिय रूप से प्रचारित करने को कहते हैं।

कुछ ही समय बाद चुनाव होने वाले हैं और वर्तमान सत्तारूढ़ दल के जीतने की संभावना है। इसी समय आपकी प्रोन्नति भी होनी है। आपसे इस स्थिति में पूर्ण रूप से सहयोग करने तथा इस योजना को सफल बनाने की अपेक्षा है, भले ही इसके आधार त्रुटिपूर्ण हों।

(a) उपर्युक्त परिस्थिति में विभिन्न हितधारकों की सूची प्रदान कीजिए और उनके संभावित हितों का उल्लेख कीजिए।

(b) इस परिस्थिति में आपके समक्ष उत्पन्न नैतिक दुविधा की चर्चा कीजिए।

(c) इस परिस्थिति से निपटने के लिए आपके पास कुछ विकल्प हो सकते हैं:

- जैसा मंत्री ने कहा है वैसा कीजिए..।
- परिणामों को प्रकाशित करने का आग्रह कीजिए और जनता को निर्णय करने दीजिए कि क्या वह इस योजना को चाहती है या नहीं?
- एक प्रेस कॉन्फ्रेंस कीजिए और इस योजना के परिणामों तथा मंत्री के संवेदनहीन रवैये के बारे में मीडिया को संक्षिप्त वृत्तांत दीजिए।

कोई अन्य संभव विकल्प सुझाइए। उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और अपने कारण बताते हुए उनमें से सबसे अच्छे विकल्प को सुझाव दीजिए।

(a) The different stakeholders & their interests are:

- Minister & his party: to win the election.
- Me (Secretary) to secure my promotion & ensure public welfare.
- Public: to get the best out of the scheme, without much burden on public finances.

(b) In this situation the ethical dilemma is the need to obey the minister as a matter of duty & law on one hand & watching the wastage of public resources for self interest of minister on the other. This also represents a dilemma between

duty & values of objectivity;

[C] ① Do as asked by minister.

Merits:

- Remains in good books of the minister.
- ~~Want~~ Would help your promotion.
- Adherence to duty & law.
- Adherence to principle of political neutrality.

Demerits:

- Wastage of public finances.
- No real benefits to the public.
- Going against your conscience.

② Insist on publication of results
& let the public decide whether
it wants the scheme:

Merits:

- More democratic way of starting a scheme.
- Public will have full information about the scheme.
- Ensure transparency in scheme formulation & implementation

Demerits:-

- Disobeying minister can cost you during promotion.
- The minister already enjoys public support ^{that why} ~~the reason~~ he is a minister.
- Would unnecessarily politicise the issue.

③ Call a press conference & brief the media about the results & the callous attitude of the minister.

Merits:-

- Ensure complete dissemination of facts.
- Inform public of minister's real intent.

Demerits:

- Grossly against values of civil services like political neutrality

- Create an unnecessary controversy.
- Reproaches for your career if the party comes in power in elections.

The best course of action is doing as asked by the minister because:

- a civil servant's job is to obey the orders of political executives.
- He can at maximum give honest, free & fair advice.
- The final decision ought to be with the minister.
- The minister will be held responsible for all the negatives the scheme has.
- The civil servant is just an anonymous implementer of policies.

10. The International Money Bank has granted loan to the government to construct ten dams. The dams would provide water for irrigation of crops, control floods in some parts of your district, and supply drinking water to numerous towns and cities. Seven of these dams are to be constructed in areas of high ecological value occupied by native groups who are challenging the government. The native groups, who oppose the construction of the dams, represent a minority compared to the multiple towns and cities which would benefit from the dams.

Nevertheless, it should be taken under consideration that the natives consider the forests as their own. Also, their distinctive life style and culture is intimately related to the existence of these natural areas. It has been noted that the forests also have a very high ecological value. If this project is completed, their land would submerge and the natives would have to be relocated. The International Money Bank is aware of this yet it has granted the loan.

You are the District Magistrate of this district. Every day protests and demonstrations are happening in your office. The government has given you the responsibility to manage the situation.

What are the various options available to you. Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it. 20

अंतर्राष्ट्रीय मुद्रा बैंक ने दस बांधों का निर्माण करने के लिए सरकार को ऋण की स्वीकृति प्रदान की है। ये बांध फसलों की सिंचाई, आपके जिले के कुछ भागों में बाढ़ को नियंत्रित करने तथा अनेक कस्बों और शहरों में पेयजल आपूर्ति के लिए जल प्रदान करेंगे। इनमें से सात बांध, स्थानीय आदिवासी समूहों, जोकि सरकार के इस निर्णय का विरोध कर रहे हैं, के नियंत्रण वाले ऐसे क्षेत्रों में निर्मित किये जाने हैं जो उच्च पारिस्थितिक महत्व के हैं। बांधों के निर्माण का विरोध कर रहे आदिवासी समूह, बांधों से लाभान्वित होने वाले अनेक कस्बों और शहरों के जनसंख्या की तुलना में अल्पसंख्यक जनसंख्या का प्रतिनिधित्व करते हैं।

फिर भी, यह अवश्य ध्यान रखा जाना चाहिए आदिवासी वनों को अपना समझते हैं। इसके अतिरिक्त, उनकी विशिष्ट जीवन शैली और संस्कृति इन प्राकृतिक क्षेत्रों के अस्तित्व से घनिष्टता से जुड़ी हुई है। पुनः ध्यान देने योग्य बात यह भी है कि वनों की अत्यधिक उच्च पारिस्थितिक महत्ता भी है। यदि यह परियोजना पूरी हो जाती है तो उनकी भूमि जलमग्न हो जाएगी और आदिवासियों को अन्यत्र स्थानांतरित करना पड़ेगा। अंतर्राष्ट्रीय मुद्रा बैंक इस तथ्य से अवगत है किन्तु फिर भी इसने ऋण स्वीकृत कर दिया है।

आप इस जिले के जिलाधिकारी हैं। आपके कार्यालय में प्रतिदिन विरोध और प्रदर्शन हो रहे हैं। सरकार ने आपको स्थिति को नियंत्रित करने की जिम्मेदारी दी है।

आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और चयन करने का कारण स्पष्ट करते हुए सर्वोत्तम विकल्प सुझाइए।

The above situation represents a conflict between the interests of powerful, vocal majority & vulnerable minority of tribals. Following options are available to me:

1] Try to take tribals into confidence

Merits

- This would ensure a sense of inclusiveness to the tribals.
- The dam construction can proceed on time.
- This would cause ~~to~~ minimal suppression & resolve issues to consensus.

Demerits:

- It is a difficult task since the livelihood of tribals is at stake.
- The above situation clearly shows ~~for~~ that tribals only have to make a compromise.

[2] Request The government to
relocate or reduce the height of
at least some dams.

Merits:

- This could save some tribal forests from submergence.
- This would mean compromise by both parties.
- Desired benefits of flood control & drinking water can be met at least partly.

Demerits:

- The projects get delayed.
- The opportunity costs increase with every delay.

[3] Suppress the ~~several~~ protests
& demonstrations of tribals:

Merits:

- The project gets kick started on time & ✓
- This reduces any opportunity costs.

Demerits:

- Suppression of tribal rights is against the constitution.
- Ethical values don't allow such a high handed approach.
- Difficult to implement it in media attention.

The best course of action would be a mixture of option 1 + 2. Tribals should be taken into confidence so as to ensure the project starts without the 3 dams which don't submerge land. In the meanwhile genuine concerns ~~can~~ of tribals are placed before government. Positive government response would reduce further protests & issue can be solved democratically. All this while complete compensation & rehabilitation must be

provided the trade on
time & trade should not
feel cheated in the negotia-
tion. Thus this option
balances multiple aspects &
is most democratic.

11. You recently joined the civil administration as a young District Commissioner. As a part of fulfilling their electoral promise, the new government in the state announced total prohibition on production, sale and purchase of liquor. This has not only led to smuggling of liquor from neighbouring states but also production of illicit liquor in the state, known as hooch. Women of the area decide to go on a protest against the recent hooch tragedy wherein several people lost their lives owing to consumption of illicit liquor. The political authorities scapegoat you for mismanagement.

(a) What are the issues involved in this case?

(b) What are the various options available to you. Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it. 20

आप हाल ही में एक युवा जिला आयुक्त के रूप में नागरिक प्रशासन में सम्मिलित हुए हैं। अपने चुनावी वादे को पूरा करने के संदर्भ में, राज्य में नई सरकार ने शराब के उत्पादन और खरीद-बिक्री पूर्ण प्रतिबंध की घोषणा की है। इसके परिणाम स्वरूप न केवल पड़ोसी राज्य से शराब की तस्करी बल्कि राज्य में 'हूच' नाम से प्रसिद्ध अवैध शराब का उत्पादन भी आरंभ हो गया है। आपके जिले की महिलाओं ने हाल ही की एक हूच त्रासदी के विरुद्ध विरोध-प्रदर्शन करने का निश्चय किया है, जिसमें कई लोगों ने अवैध शराब के सेवन के कारण अपनी जानें गवाई थी। राजनीतिक प्राधिकारियों ने उक्त कुप्रबंधन के लिए आपको बलि का बकरा बनाया है।

(a) इस मामले में सम्मिलित मुद्दे क्या हैं?

(b) आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और चयन करने का कारण स्पष्ट करते हुए सर्वोत्तम विकल्प सुझाइए।

a) following issues are involved in the above case:

- Issue of political accountability being compromised.
- Innocent civil servant being targeted.
- Justice for those who have lost their lives in the hooch tragedy.

Following are the various options available to us:

1] Bring out relevant facts of the case by disclosing official communications:

Merits:

- This would prove your innocence by bringing truth out before everyone.

Demerits:

- Would be a confrontation with the political class.
- Such behaviour & disclosure to media is not expected of a civil servant.

2] Stand trial & let law take its own course

Merits:

- This could legally prove your innocence.

Demerits:

- Court procedures take time & lead to delays.

- Meanwhile your image would suffer immensely.
- Evidence could be stage managed against you.

[3] Make your position clear,
provide arguments why you are
not responsible, file RTI & get
relevant information, create a
positive public opinion about
yourself based on your honest
behaviour & let law take its
own course while requesting a
court monitored trial

Merits:

- This would prove your innocence.
- Won't tarnish your image.
- Evidence cannot be managed as case is monitored by the court.

- Action is as per law.
- Real perpetrators will be exposed.

Demerits.

- Difficult to implement given the political opposition you have.

The best course of action is the third one for all the merits listed above. Moreover it represents a solution which is acceptable legally & morally. Although difficult to implement, social media & RTI can be used effectively to prove one's innocence.

12. You are a doctoral student at a large university in the final months of your research on a potentially revolutionary technology. Meanwhile, you have also applied for post-doctoral research cum teaching positions at various universities. To your pleasant surprise, you get an interview call from your undergraduate alma mater, a prestigious research institution in a city where you would love to live.

In the interview, the department chair asks for detailed information about your research.

Your group is working on a patent application and its members have agreed not to provide details until a paper currently being prepared is submitted for publication. You explain the situation and tell them that you would be glad to send them an early preprint when it is available.

But the Chair pushes harder for this information, remarking that the Department seeks team players, willing to share information with department colleagues. She also appeals to your undergraduate connection with the institution.

(a) Enumerate the ethical issues involved in the case in light of your current responsibilities vis-a-vis future expectations.

(b) Discuss the possible motivations of the department chair in pressing you for detailed information.

(c) What stand will you take in such a situation? Give reasonable justification for your arguments.

20

आप एक प्रख्यात विश्वविद्यालय में किसी संभाव्य क्रांतिकारी प्रौद्योगिकी पर शोध कर रहे हैं और शोध पूरा होने में कुछ ही महीने शेष बचे हैं। इसी बीच, आपने विभिन्न विश्वविद्यालयों में शोध सह-अध्यापन पदों के लिए भी आवेदन किया है। आपको एक सुखद व आश्चर्यजनक समाचार प्राप्त होता है कि आपको स्नातक स्तर की उस संस्था से साक्षात्कार के लिए बुलावा प्राप्त हुआ है, जहाँ से आपने शिक्षा प्राप्त की है जो एक ऐसे नगर में स्थापित प्रतिष्ठित संस्थान है जहाँ रहना आप पसंद करेंगे।

साक्षात्कार में विभागीय अधिकारी आपके शोध के संबंध में विस्तृत सूचना मांगती हैं।

आपका समूह एक पेटेंट आवेदन पर कार्य कर रहा है और इसके सदस्य इस हेतु सहमत हुए हैं कि जब तक वर्तमान में तैयार किया जा रहा शोध पत्र प्रकाशन के लिए जमा न कर दिया जाए, तब तक कोई विवरण किसी अन्य को प्रदान नहीं किया जाए। आप परिस्थिति समझाते हैं और उन्हें कहते हैं कि जब शोध पत्र उपलब्ध हो जाएगा तो आपको उनके लिए उक्त शोध पत्र का नमूना भेजने में प्रसन्नता होगी।

किंतु विभागीय अधिकारी इस सूचना के लिए अत्यधिक दबाव देती हैं। वह यह स्पष्ट करती हैं कि विभाग ऐसे लोगों की नियुक्ति चाहता है जो टीम के रूप में साथ मिलकर काम कर सकें और विभागीय सहयोगियों के साथ सूचना साझा कर सकें। वह संस्था के साथ आपके स्नातक स्तरीय संपर्कों का भी वास्ता देती है।

- (a) अपनी वर्तमान जिम्मेदारियों और भविष्य की अपेक्षाओं को सामने रखते हुए इस प्रकरण में शामिल विभिन्न नैतिक मुद्दों की पहचान कीजिए।
- (b) आपसे विस्तृत जानकारी हेतु दबाव डालने के संबंध में विभागीय अधिकारी के संभावित उत्प्रेरणाओं पर चर्चा कीजिए।
- (c) ऐसी स्थिति में आप क्या निर्णय लेंगे? अपने तर्क को औचित्यपूर्ण सिद्ध कीजिए।

13. You have recently been appointed as the District Collector of an impoverished district, which has been witnessing drought for the last couple of years. Corruption at lower levels of bureaucracy has further aggravated the situation. The district also faces the problem of diminishing resources of drinking water. Despite, the gravity of the problem, the response from the central and the state government is lackadaisical. Moreover, the media coverage of the problem is also dismal. To make matters worse, the younger members of the community are migrating in search of work to the urban areas without much success, leaving the elders, women, and children behind to fend for themselves.

(a) As the District Collector what would be your priorities for solving the problem?

(b) How would you tackle the situation?

(c) What long term measures would you take to prevent the future recurrence of the problem?

20

आपको हाल ही में एक अत्यंत पिछड़े जिले के जिला कलेक्टर के रूप में नियुक्त किया गया है। उक्त जिला पिछले कुछ वर्षों से सूखे की चपेट में रहा है। नौकरशाही के निचले स्तर पर व्याप्त भ्रष्टाचार ने परिस्थिति को और गंभीर बना दिया है। यह जिला, पेयजल स्रोतों के गिरते जल स्तर की समस्याओं का सामना भी कर रहा है। परिस्थिति की गंभीरता के बावजूद भी, केंद्र और राज्य सरकार की प्रतिक्रिया चिंतनीय है। इसके अतिरिक्त, उक्त समस्या की मीडिया कवरेज भी निराशाजनक है। स्थानीय समुदाय के नौजवान सदस्य बुजुर्गों, महिलाओं और बच्चों को अपने भरण-पोषण की व्यवस्था स्वयं करने हेतु छोड़कर काम की खोज में शहरी क्षेत्रों, की ओर पलायन कर रहे हैं, जहां उन्हें अपेक्षित सफलता प्राप्त नहीं हो रही है। इससे यह स्थिति और बदतर होती जा रही है।

(a) जिला कलेक्टर के रूप में उक्त समस्या के समाधान के लिए आपकी प्राथमिकताएँ क्या होंगी?

(b) आप इस स्थिति से कैसे निपटेंगे?

(c) इस समस्या की भावी पुनरावृत्ति को रोकने के लिए आप कौन-से दीर्घावधिक उपाय अपनाएंगे?

The above mentioned situation resembles the situation of drought affected Bundelkhand region which received little media attention.

a) As a district collector following will be my priorities

- Ensuring maximum basic level of water for everyone for primary uses like drinking, cooking
- Reducing corruption levels.
- Welfare of vulnerable sections
- Work opportunities for youth.

b) The situation can be tackled by:

- Trying to ensure media coverage to the problems of the district.
- Writing letters to central & state government to release funds & supplies to tackle the drought like situations.
- Holding a meeting of important officials in the office & making it crystal clear that you'll

not tolerate corruption, especially in such hard times.

- Mobilising funds from schemes like MGNREGS to provide employment to the youth.
- Using MGNREGS to create rainwater harvesting aucts.
- Utilising social welfare funds for subsidising daily needs of population & also to ensure welfare of vulnerable sections like women, children.
- Promoting groundwater usage.
- Using services of private tankers to provide basic minimum water.
- Making examples by myself utilising less water & conserving it so that people are encouraged to conserve water.

- ~~Reducing~~ Ensuring strict & swift action against corrupt officials.
- Following long term measures need to be taken to prevent the future recurrence of the problem:
 - Promote creation of water storage assets.
 - Promote efficient irrigation methods such as drip irrigation.
 - Increase forest cover through social & farm forestry so that soil erosion/burnoff is reduced.
 - Appeal to state government to create a dedicated fund for drought affected districts.
 - Ensure employment opportunities to youth within the district.

- to reduce distress migration.
- Co-ordination mechanisms with neighbours, district collectors for ensuring employment to migrated youth from my district.
 - Sustainable water usage practices should be promoted as far as possible.

14. In a district, in which you are posted as a District Magistrate, a teacher molests a child in a government run school. As the news of this crime spreads, the parents, relatives and locals gather at the school. The culprit teacher has meanwhile fled. The police arrests the Principal of the school and assure the crowd that the culprit would be arrested soon. The crowd, however, has gone berserk and begins to damage the school building. It wants immediate arrest of the culprit and is not ready to budge until he is arrested.

(a) Is it correct to take the Principal into custody when he has personally not committed the crime? Support your answer with appropriate reasons.

(b) What options do you have in dealing with the crowd? Enumerate the merits and demerits of each and also suggest the best possible option.

(c) In the capacity of District Magistrate what would be your long term plan to prevent molestations and rapes in the schools? 20

एक जिले में जहां आप एक जिलाधिकारी के रूप में पदस्थापित हैं, वहां के एक सरकारी विद्यालय का एक शिक्षक एक बच्चे से छेड़छाड़ करता है। जब इस अपराध की खबर फैलती है तो उस बच्चे के माता-पिता, सगे-संबंधी और स्थानीय लोग विद्यालय के पास एकत्रित हो जाते हैं। इसी बीच आरोपी शिक्षक फ़रार हो जाता है। पुलिस उस विद्यालय के प्राचार्य को गिरफ्तार कर लेती है और भीड़ को यह आश्वासन देती है कि आरोपी को शीघ्र ही गिरफ्तार कर लिया जाएगा। तथापि भीड़ अनियंत्रित हो जाती है और विद्यालय भवन को क्षतिग्रस्त करना आरंभ कर देती है। उक्त भीड़ आरोपी की तत्काल गिरफ्तारी चाहती है और जब तक उसे गिरफ्तार नहीं कर लिया जाता, तब तक वे वहाँ से हिलने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं।

(a) क्या प्राचार्य को हिरासत में लेना सही है, जबकि उसने व्यक्तिगत रूप से अपराध नहीं किया है? उपयुक्त कारणों सहित अपने उत्तर का समर्थन कीजिए।

(b) आपके पास भीड़ से निपटने के कौन से विकल्प हैं? प्रत्येक के गुणों व दोषों की गणना कीजिए और सर्वोत्तम संभावित विकल्प सुझाइए।

(c) एक जिलाधिकारी के रूप में विद्यालयों में छेड़छाड़ और बलात्कार की घटना को रोकने के लिए आपकी दीर्घकालिक योजना क्या होगी?

a) Yes it is correct to take principal into custody even when he has not committed the crime because:

• he is responsible for the safety

of students & behaviour of the teachers.

- He needs to be kept safe from the angry mob.

b) Following options are available ~~to~~ in dealing with the crowd:

1] Talk with the village elder / Sarpanch / Parents to placate the crowd:

Merits:

- By talking to a limited group, it improves the chances of successful negotiations.
- The crowd would be more receptive to the village elders & leaders.

Demerits:

- It could send a wrong signal that magistrats is cowardly trying to defend the corrupt teacher.

② Call the police to control the mob:

Merits:

- This would reduce the damage to school infrastructure.
- This would lead to effective control of angry mob.

Demerits:

- The violent situation could spiral down into police firing & injuries & even death within the mob.
- This would alienate the people from district administration.

③ Promise that culprit would be arrested within a fixed date, ask ~~villagers~~ parents to file complaint with the police, convince certain section of crowd to disperse

Merits:

- By diverting a section of mob, widescale damage is prevented.
- ~~Filing~~ ^{Personal} Assurance by district Magistrate would go a long way in calming tempers.
- Talking to parents & convincing them of need to stop violence would enhance credibility of ~~advt~~ government.

Demerits:

- The faith in district Magistrate will be lost permanently if the culprit is not caught in time.
- The last option is the best one in the given circumstances as it combines positives of 1st option & tries to remove its negatives.

(C) To a district magistrate, following would be a long term plan to prevent molestation in schools:

- Ensure CCTV coverage of important school places.
- Ensure police verification of all persons employed in the school.
- Spread awareness about the consequences of such heinous crimes.
- Ensure ~~the~~ Panchayats maintain a record of all people convicted of such crimes & socially defame & isolate such criminals so as to discourage any potential molester.
- Teaching school children martial arts to defend themselves as much as possible in such situation.