



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 747)

Name of Candidate	AKSHAT KAUSHAL		
Medium Hindi/Eng.	ENGLISH	Registration Number	1735
Center	NEW DELHI	Date	31.10.16

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5(a)	10	
5(b)	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	20	
14	20	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

Signature of Examiner

INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are FOURTEEN questions printed in HINDI and ENGLISH.
इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं तथा हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory.
सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

Answer the following questions is not more than 150 words each.

1. (a) A broad ethical framework as a guiding light for international relations will not only ensure harmonious relations between nations but will also lead to progress of the human race. Discuss with examples. 10
- अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संबंधों के लिए प्रकाश स्तंभ के रूप में एक व्यापक नैतिक ढांचा न केवल राष्ट्रों के बीच सामंजस्यपूर्ण संबंध सुनिश्चित करेगा बल्कि मानव जाति का विकास भी सुनिश्चित करेगा। सोदाहरण चर्चा कीजिए।

1. (b) What does inequality mean to you? What are the different kinds of inequality? Is inequality morally wrong? 10

असमानता से आप क्या समझते हैं? असमानता के विभिन्न प्रकार क्या हैं? क्या असमानता नैतिक रूप से गलत है?

Inequality means inaccessible
or unequal access to resources.
These resources can be material (faves: Food)
and non-material (faves: Education)

The Different forms of inequality are:-

- ① Economic Inequality → Unequal distribution of economic rewards and economic resources.
- ② Social Inequality → The Society treats individuals unequally on the basis of society-determined parameters. Eg:- Caste system.
- ③ Political Inequality → Unequal access to political power or some people are not allowed to participate in the political process. Eg: Colonial rule.

Inequality and Morality

Inequality is morally wrong because it creates artificial barriers among individuals who are biologically similar.

Further, the consequences of inequality creates handicaps for people which prevent ^{them} from living a healthy and decent life.

2. (a) One has a moral responsibility to disobey unjust laws. In light of this statement, examine the relevance of civil disobedience in a modern democratic society. Discuss the duties and responsibilities of a law enforcing officer in such situations. 10

अन्यायपूर्ण कानूनों की अवज्ञा करना हमारा नैतिक दायित्व है। इस कथन के प्रकाश में, आधुनिक लोकतांत्रिक समाज में सविनय अवज्ञा की प्रासंगिकता का परिक्षण कीजिए। ऐसी परिस्थितियों में एक कानून प्रवर्तन अधिकारी के कर्तव्यों तथा दायित्वों की चर्चा कीजिए।

Gandhiji and other leaders of India's national movement highlighted the need to disobey unjust laws.
For ex: → Gandhiji's protest against the salt tax was based on the premise that no tax can be imposed on a commodity as basic and universally consumed as salt.

Why they should be disobeyed :-

- Ⓐ Because laws reflect the norms and objectives which the society aims for and ~~wants~~ wants to achieve.

These norms and objectives can be out of sync with the

changed world (eg: GK-based laws)
or are being imposed for the
interests of only a handful of
people (eg: Colonial laws). Hence,
in such circumstances, it becomes
a moral responsibility to
set the law on the right
course by objecting to them.

Duties and Responsibilities of a law
enforcement officer.

- ① The law enforcement officer
should still uphold the existing
law because this remains his
primary duty.
- ② However, he can be lenient
if he finds that the majority of the
people find the law unjust. For eg:-
He should use minimum force
while dispersing an assembled
crowd.

2. (b) Ensuring accountability in the administration just adds another layer in the bureaucratic process. Examine. Differentiate between accountability and responsibility. Suggest some measures through which administrative accountability can be made more effective in India. 10

प्रशासन में जवाबदेही (Accountability) सुनिश्चित करना नौकरशाही प्रक्रिया में एक और स्तर जोड़ देता है। परीक्षण कीजिए। जवाबदेही और उत्तरदायित्व (Responsibility) के बीच अंतर स्पष्ट कीजिए। कुछ ऐसे उपाय बताइए जिससे भारत में प्रशासनिक जवाबदेही को और अधिक प्रभावी बनाया जा सके।

Accountability is one of the most important mechanisms needed to ensure that the bureaucracy remains true to its task.

Without Accountability, a bureaucracy can become irresponsible and turn away from its objectives.

Accountability v/s Responsibility

Accountability means being answerable for one's conduct and for any commission or omission.

Responsibility means being committed to the task.

Accountability is also a mechanism to check the responsi

- Ability of an individual.
Measures through which
accountability can be increased:

- ① Plugging loopholes in existing laws to allow minimum discretion.
- ② Strengthening vigilance institutions.
- ③ Increasing the efficiency of the judicial process.
- ④ Promoting accountability towards people through methods such as Social Audits.
- ⑤ By increasing transparency in the decision-making process.

3. (a) "Morality is based neither on the principle of utility, nor on a law of nature, but on human reason. But human reason can be fallible." Comment., What does morality mean to you? 10

"नैतिकता न तो उपयोगिता (utility) के सिद्धांत पर आधारित है और न ही प्रकृति के नियम पर, बल्कि यह मानवीय विवेक पर आधारित है। किंतु मानवीय विवेक दोषपूर्ण हो सकते हैं।" टिप्पणी कीजिए। आपके लिए नैतिकता का क्या अर्थ है?

Morality means the ability of the person to distinguish between right and wrong. The decision is based on personal choices, opinion, values of the person.

Since morality is determined by the individual for himself, it is not based on any law.

But as human reason is determined by a person's personal choices and values — it can also be misplaced.

This is the reason why certain individuals have misplaced opinion about right & wrong.
For eg:- Hitler saw his reason for killing jews as right.

What morality means to me.

Morality for me is an important instrument to decide my decisions. I use morality to check whether doing an Act is likely to do good for me, for my family and for my society.

According to me - Morality is the inner voice or consciousness which has an opinion about dilemmas we face and helps us to resolve this dilemma based on values which I hold dear, my previous experiences and the likely result I am expecting as outcome.

3. (b) For effective public service delivery, the need today is to move from traditional accountability mechanisms to social accountability through greater civic engagement. Discuss with examples. 10

प्रभावी सार्वजनिक सेवा वितरण हेतु, जवाबदेहिता (Accountability) की पारंपरिक प्रणाली के स्थान पर अधिकाधिक नागरिक भागीदारी के माध्यम से सामाजिक जवाबदेही प्रणाली की ओर अग्रसर होना वर्तमान समय की आवश्यकता है। उदाहरण सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

The traditional accountability mechanisms are an efficient way of keeping account of how the money is spent. But its major deficiency is that it is unable to explain how well the money was utilised for its intended objectives.

Social accountability is a way of getting around this problem. It includes: Public hearings, Social audits, use of RTI, etc. The method of social accountability helps in knowing from the intended beneficiaries of how well was the scheme implemented and how it can be improved further.

An example of Social Accountability is the use of Social audits in MGNREGA. It involves participation of the gram panchayat - which audits the implementation of the scheme, distribution of wages and also decides on which projects will be taken up for development under MGNREGA. Similarly, the mid-day meal scheme also involves similar participation by the citizens.

However, for the effective implementation of Social accountability it is important to ensure that the provisions of its implementation are implemented in letter and spirit.

4. (a) What do you mean by social justice? Explain with examples, why it is imperative for a society to promote social justice. 10

सामाजिक न्याय से आप क्या समझते हैं? उदाहरण सहित व्याख्या कीजिए कि सामाजिक न्याय को प्रोत्साहित करना किसी समाज के लिए क्यों अनिवार्य है?

Social justice includes uplifting the downtrodden, providing relief and support to the marginalised. It also includes extending positive discrimination to those sections who have been historically marginalised.

Examples:-

- ① Extending reservation in govt jobs to SCs and STs.
- ② Providing unemployment allowance.
- ③ Job-security schemes such as MGNREGA.

It is imperative for the society to promote social justice, because:

- ① In modern democracy - the state is looked upon as benevolent whose primary responsibility is to provide relief and support to all sections - especially those who are weak.
- ② In the absence of social justice - inequalities increase which pose threat to the harmony and social integration of the whole society.
- ③ Social justice promote democracy as all citizens feel they have a stake in nation ensuring the ~~government~~ government becomes more strong.

4. (b) Investigative reporting by media can be a significant source of information on corruption. What are ethical issues involved in investigative journalism? What safeguards can be introduced to prevent its misuse? 10
मीडिया द्वारा खोजी (इनवेस्टिगेटिव) रिपोर्टिंग भ्रष्टाचार संबंधी सूचना का महत्वपूर्ण स्रोत हो सकती है। खोजी पत्रकारिता से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं? इसके दुरुपयोग को रोकने के लिए कौन से सुरक्षा उपाय आरंभ किए जा सकते हैं?

Investigative reporting involves uncovering the truth by journalists investigating government records, corporate balance sheets, collecting evidence from the ground, etc.

In recent years, investigative reporting has become a significant source of information on corruption. For ex:-
Investigation into Panama Papers which revealed tax evasion.

Ethical issues involved in investigative journalism are :-

① Right to privacy:-

String operations have raised issues whether they violate the privacy rights of the people who figure in their recordings.

② Right & fair access to justice

Another ethical question raised surrounds whether the accused get a fair judgment in the courts because the media attention already concludes who are the guilty.

③ Media's Expertise

Some corruption cases involves knowledge & forensic sciences. The ethical dilemma which emerges is whether the media - which lacks professional expertise - should be allowed to pass judgment on sensitive cases.

SAFEGUARDS :- the following safeguards can be introduced :-

- ① The accused are given a fair share of voice to be heard.
- ② The judiciary is trained to not get influenced by the public/media attention.
- ③ A Code of Conduct should be institutionalised for the media to adhere too.

5. (a) While transplantation of organs represents one of the most spectacular achievements of modern medical science, it has raised many ethical issues as well. Discuss. Also, examine the issues related to organ transplantation in India. 10

यद्यपि अंग प्रत्यारोपण आधुनिक चिकित्सा विज्ञान की सर्वाधिक प्रभावशाली उपलब्धियों में से एक का प्रतिनिधित्व करती है, तथापि इसने कई नैतिक मुद्दे भी खड़े किए हैं। चर्चा कीजिए। साथ ही, भारत में अंग प्रत्यारोपण से जुड़े मुद्दों का भी परीक्षण कीजिए।

Organ transplantation represents the immense potential of modern science. But it also raises ethical issues. Some of these are:

① Should the law of the nature be disturbed. → Degeneration and death are natural phenomena - transplantation of organs is challenging this.

② Rich v/s Poor → Being an expensive procedure - the trend is that the poor are predominantly the donors while the rich are receivers.

③ The Will of the dead. →

While the consent for transplant is taken when the donor is alive, the final nod is given ~~by~~ ^{by} the relatives of the ~~immediate~~ ^{by} dead person. This raises questions over whose voice should be valued more — of the relatives or ~~the~~ that of the donor.

④ Should money ship lines → At

present, patients are able to skip donor lists by paying more money. This raises another ethical dilemma of whether this practice should be encouraged.

Issues in India :- ① Illegal donation

② Poor people being used for illegal removal of their organs.

③ No proper list is being maintained of donors and receivers.

④ Misconceptions are plenty around the issue of transplantation.

5. (b) There can be honesty without integrity, but no integrity without honesty. Do you agree? Justify your stand with examples. 10

सत्यनिष्ठा के बिना ईमानदारी संभव है, किंतु ईमानदारी के बिना सत्यनिष्ठा संभव नहीं है। क्या आप इससे सहमत हैं? उदाहरण सहित अपने मत का औचित्य सिद्ध कीजिए।

6. "It is not always the same thing to be a good person and a good citizen." Explain the meaning of this statement and analyse its implications for a democratic society. 10

"अच्छा व्यक्ति होना और अच्छा नागरिक होना हमेशा समान बात नहीं होती है।" इस कथन के अर्थ की व्याख्या कीजिए और लोकतांत्रिक समाज के लिए इसके निहितार्थों का विश्लेषण कीजिए।

A good person is someone who is considered virtuous, well-meaning, helpful and cooperative by his social circle. These may include his relatives, friends and colleagues at the work place.

In comparison to this, the term "good citizen" is a broader concept. A person is considered as a good citizen if he obeys all the laws of the country or state — in both letter and spirit.

In some cases, a good person will also be good citizen. But they can both diverge too.

For ex:- An ~~one~~ illegal refugee

might be provided shelter by a citizen because the citizen thinks this is a "good" thing to do. However, by not reporting to the government about the presence of an illegal ~~citizen~~ person, the citizen is not fulfilling his duties.

Implications for democratic society

A democratic society needs both good persons and good citizens. While usually those who are good persons, but not good citizens, are not harmful. But in the long-term — the good persons need to be converted into good citizens — by convincing them to believe in the larger interests of the society.

7. Value of compassion towards the weak extends the limits of operations of a public servant by introducing flexibility but dilutes the principle of objectivity. Discuss. If a conflict arises between the value of compassion and principle of objectivity, how will you deal with it as a public servant? 10
- कमजोर के प्रति करुणा की भावना रखने की महत्ता किसी लोकसेवक के कार्यक्षेत्र की सीमाओं में लोचशीलता लाकर उसे विस्तारित करती है, किंतु वस्तुनिष्ठता के सिद्धांत को निर्बल करती है। चर्चा कीजिए। यदि करुणा की महत्ता और वस्तुनिष्ठता के सिद्धांत के बीच संघर्ष पैदा होता है, तो एक लोक सेवक के रूप में आप इस परिस्थिति से किस प्रकार निपटेंगे?

A public servant — especially one who is involved in public dealing — has to often resolve the conflict within himself between being compassionate or being objective.

This conflict arises because a civil servant is expected to apply the law dispassionately to all the people — without fear or favour. On the other hand, certain situations demand where the civil servant is expected to go out of his way to provide relief.

For example:— In case of flood — he may order relief without following all tender-related regulations.

Compassion v/s Objectivity.

Compassion is the lynch pin on which the relationship between the public servant and the people is fixed. Compromising on Compassion - involves giving up on the public trust.

Hence, ~~when~~ when a conflict arises then I would prefer Compassion over Objectivity.

However, it is important to not sacrifice all the rules in the quest of being compassionate. Hence, while the aim has to be to be compassionate - a Civil Servant has to also work within the rules. A solution to this is perhaps not read the literal meaning of the law but read it innovatively.

8. Which administrator had a lasting impact on your decision to join the civil services and why? Should administrators have increased media presence so that the common man can know more about their efforts and achievements? Justify your stand. 10

किस प्रशासक ने लोक सेवाओं में सम्मिलित होने के आपके निर्णय पर अमिट छाप छोड़ी और क्यों? क्या प्रशासक को मीडिया की उपस्थिति को बढ़ाना चाहिए जिससे सामान्य जनता उनके प्रयासों और उपलब्धियों के बारे में अधिक जानकारी प्राप्त कर सके? अपने मत का औचित्य सिद्ध कीजिए।

JM Lyndhoy - the former chief Election Commission - left a lasting impact on me, which also influenced my decision to join the Civil Services. Lyndhoy's following qualities appealed to me:

- ① His firm and upright work as the chief Election Commission, especially not giving into political pressure.
- ② His personal integrity.
- ③ His decision to not take up any post-retirement job (a promise he has kept) once he retired as the CEC. Because according to him it brought to disrepute the Office of CEC.

Civil servants by definition are expected to work behind the scenes. However, as the communication revolution engulfs the world - it would be welcome to increase the interaction between the civil servants and the public - via media.

The position :-

(a) Citizens would come to know how the government functions - This will help them in accessing services from the govt.

(b) Motivate young people to join the civil service.

(c) In a two-way communication - the civil servant can also become aware of citizen needs.

However, the civil servants while interacting need to appreciate that not all information can be divulged/shared with the public.

9. You are a Secretary in a government department. Your Minister has proposed an unemployment grant, which is expected to cost the public exchequer heavily. Having already taken the decision, he asks you to come up with research to support the scheme. Despite your best efforts, you fail to find socio-economic benefit in it. You approach the Minister with relevant facts and studies and ask him to reconsider his decision. Instead, he asks you to suppress the negative impacts and actively promote the scheme through mass media as the perceived social impacts are more important than economic impacts.

Elections are due in a short time and the political party currently in power is expected to win. You are also due for promotion at the same time. You are expected to fully cooperate in the situation and make the scheme a success, however flawed its foundations may be.

(a) List the different stakeholders in the above situation and mention their prospective interests.

(b) Discuss the ethical dilemma which you face in this situation.

(c) Some of the alternatives for you to handle the situation could be:

- Do as asked by the Minister..
- Insist on publication of results and let the public decide whether it wants the scheme.
- Call a press conference and brief the media about the results and the callous attitude of the Minister.

Suggest any other possible option(s). Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it. 20

आप एक सरकारी विभाग में सचिव हैं। आपके मंत्री ने बेरोजगारी भत्ता का प्रस्ताव स्वीकृत किया है, जिससे सरकारी खजाने पर अत्याधिक बोझ पड़ने की संभावना है। चूँकि उन्होंने पहले से ही इस पर निर्णय ले लिया है, अतः वे इस योजना के समर्थन में आपसे शोध करके आने को कहते हैं। आपके द्वारा सर्वोत्तम प्रयास किए जाने के बावजूद भी, आपको इसमें कोई सामाजिक-आर्थिक लाभ दिखाई नहीं पड़ रहा है। आप संबंधित तथ्यों और अध्ययनों के साथ मंत्री के पास जाते हैं और उनसे अपने निर्णय पर पुनर्विचार करने का आग्रह करते हैं। चूँकि इस योजना के कथित सामाजिक प्रभाव, आर्थिक प्रभाव की अपेक्षा अधिक महत्वपूर्ण हैं, अतः अपने निर्णय पर पुनर्विचार करने की अपेक्षा वे आपसे इसके नकारात्मक प्रभाव को छिपाने और इस योजना को जनसंचार माध्यम की सहायता से सक्रिय रूप से प्रचारित करने को कहते हैं।

कुछ ही समय बाद चुनाव होने वाले हैं और वर्तमान सत्तारूढ़ दल के जीतने की संभावना है। इसी समय आपकी प्रोन्नति भी होनी है। आपसे इस स्थिति में पूर्ण रूप से सहयोग करने तथा इस योजना को सफल बनाने की अपेक्षा है, भले ही इसके आधार नुतिपूर्ण हों।

(a) उपर्युक्त परिस्थिति में विभिन्न हितधारकों की सूची प्रदान कीजिए और उनके संभावित हितों का उल्लेख कीजिए।

(b) इस परिस्थिति में आपके समक्ष उत्पन्न नैतिक दुविधा की चर्चा कीजिए।

(c) इस परिस्थिति से निपटने के लिए आपके पास कुछ विकल्प हो सकते हैं:

- जैसा मंत्री ने कहा है वैसा कीजिए..।
- परिणामों को प्रकाशित करने का आग्रह कीजिए और जनता को निर्णय करने दीजिए कि क्या वह इस योजना को चाहती है या नहीं?
- एक प्रेस कॉन्फ्रेंस कीजिए और इस योजना के परिणामों तथा मंत्री के संवेदनहीन रवैये के बारे में मीडिया को संक्षिप्त वृत्तांत दीजिए।

कोई अन्य संभव विकल्प सुझाइए। उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और अपने कारण बताते हुए उनमें से सबसे अच्छे विकल्प को सुझाव दीजिए।

② Following are the different stakeholders in the situation:-

① Minister → The minister considers the scheme proposed by him as innovative and one which is likely to benefit the people. Because of the upcoming elections, he also sees the scheme as politically rewarding.

② Secretary → The secretary's professional interests require him to ensure that the scheme being implemented by the govt is sound, with minimum leakages. He is also dependent

On the minister for his job.
Therefore, he cannot completely
alienate the minister.

③ Common people

The common people need government
assistance because of prevalence
of unemployment. They want
efficient government delivery.

④ The secretary faces the
following ethical dilemma:

① He is conflicted between
his personal and professional
interests. His personal interests
require him to give support to
the minister as his promotion is
due. While his professional duty
wants him to ensure that
the govt. spends money on
viable schemes with intended consequ
- ences.

(#) Another ethical dilemma which the secretary faces is between —
 running a half-baked scheme
 (as the minister wants him to do)
 or not give his consent unless
 all loopholes are plugged.

(C) Do as the Minister says.

Merit :- (i) Will keep the Secy in
 the good books of the minister.

(ii) Likely promotion for the
 secretary.

(iii) Some people will get relief

Demerit :- (i) Professionally incompetent
 performance of duty.

(ii) The ~~secret~~ Watchdog Lodha —

CAG, CAI, CVC, Can inquire
 into the decision.

(iii) No long-term solution for
 people.

Don't on publication of results and
let public debate.

Merit :- (i) Will save the Secy from
violating rules & procedures.
(ii) Sought of a compromise with the
minister.

Demerit :- (i) Minister will remain
unsatisfied.
(ii) The Public will not have all
knowledge at their disposal

Call a press conference.

Merit :- (i) Will lead to some
transparency in how the
government runs its business.

(ii) The Secy will be saved of
violating a law.

(iii) Public money will be saved

Demerit :- (i) The minister and the government will become vindictive when it returns to power.

(ii) The people will not get any benefit.

Likely Solution :-

- (a) Convince the minister that while his intentions are justified and fair, he won't get any political dividend as the scheme will fail on the ground.
- (b) Ask him for time - and quickly rework the scheme to suit the minister's political needs, the demands of the public - while being confined to the governance framework.

10. The International Money Bank has granted loan to the government to construct ten dams. The dams would provide water for irrigation of crops, control floods in some parts of your district, and supply drinking water to numerous towns and cities. Seven of these dams are to be constructed in areas of high ecological value occupied by native groups who are challenging the government. The native groups, who oppose the construction of the dams, represent a minority compared to the multiple towns and cities which would benefit from the dams.

Nevertheless, it should be taken under consideration that the natives consider the forests as their own. Also, their distinctive life style and culture is intimately related to the existence of these natural areas. It has been noted that the forests also have a very high ecological value. If this project is completed, their land would submerge and the natives would have to be relocated. The International Money Bank is aware of this yet it has granted the loan.

You are the District Magistrate of this district. Every day protests and demonstrations are happening in your office. The government has given you the responsibility to manage the situation.

What are the various options available to you. Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it. 20

अंतर्राष्ट्रीय मुद्रा बैंक ने दस बांधों का निर्माण करने के लिए सरकार को ऋण की स्वीकृति प्रदान की है। ये बांध फसलों की सिंचाई, आपके जिले के कुछ भागों में बाढ़ को नियंत्रित करने तथा अनेक कस्बों और शहरों में पेयजल आपूर्ति के लिए जल प्रदान करेंगे। इनमें से सात बांध, स्थानीय आदिवासी समूहों, जोकि सरकार के इस निर्णय का विरोध कर रहे हैं, के नियंत्रण वाले ऐसे क्षेत्रों में निर्मित किये जाने हैं जो उच्च पारिस्थितिक महत्व के हैं। बांधों के निर्माण का विरोध कर रहे आदिवासी समूह, बांधों से लाभान्वित होने वाले अनेक कस्बों और शहरों के जनसंख्या की तुलना में अल्पसंख्यक जनसंख्या का प्रतिनिधित्व करते हैं।

फिर भी, यह अवश्य ध्यान रखा जाना चाहिए आदिवासी वनों को अपना समझते हैं। इसके अतिरिक्त, उनकी विशिष्ट जीवन शैली और संस्कृति इन प्राकृतिक क्षेत्रों के अस्तित्व से घनिष्टता से जुड़ी हुई है। पुनः ध्यान देने योग्य बात यह भी है कि वनों की अत्यधिक उच्च पारिस्थितिक महत्ता भी है। यदि यह परियोजना पूरी हो जाती है तो उनकी भूमि जलमग्न हो जाएगी और आदिवासियों को अन्यत्र स्थानांतरित करना पड़ेगा। अंतर्राष्ट्रीय मुद्रा बैंक इस तथ्य से अवगत है किन्तु फिर भी इसने ऋण स्वीकृत कर दिया है।

आप इस जिले के जिलाधिकारी हैं। आपके कार्यालय में प्रतिदिन विरोध और प्रदर्शन हो रहे हैं। सरकार ने आपको स्थिति को नियंत्रित करने की जिम्मेदारी दी है।

आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और चयन करने का कारण स्पष्ट करते हुए सर्वोत्तम विकल्प सुझाइए।

The present situation illustrated relates to development-induced development. While the urban centres require water, the natives are not willing to give their land for the construction of dams. Apart from the humanitarian angle, the situation also involves environmental concerns as the dam will result in submergence of natural habitats.

The DM has the following options :-

① Ignore the natives and go ahead with the dams.

Merit :- (i) Will lead to speedy implementation of the project —
Save govt on interest costs.

(ii) Substantially more number of people will get benefitted

as the beneficiaries include —
agriculturists, urban residents
and industries.

Demerit :- (1) In the long-term —
the environment of the region
will deteriorate — causing
loss to the same intended
beneficiaries —

(2) The protest by natives can
cause law and order problem —
and damage to state machinery.

(3) A large number of people will
become homeless.

(4) Stop the development of
zone ~~and~~ until the
demands of the natives are
addressed

Merit :- (1) The natives will end
their protest.

② Environmental concerns will be addressed.

Demerit :- ① The development of the area will suffer.

② Interest costs will increase.

③ WAY FORWARD



Order EIA by an independent agency, search for an alternative place for the natives which nearly match their original homes.
And provide employment in the dams for the natives.

Merit :- ① The EIA will ensure that during the construction of the dam all environment-related concerns are taken care of.

② The natives will be provided with employment and home.

③ The work on the dam will continue - therefore, not compromising on development.

Demerit :- ① The EIA might not ensure long term environment damage.

② The traditional lifestyle and livelihood of the natives will be lost. - Making them feel uprooted and alienated.

11. You recently joined the civil administration as a young District Commissioner. As a part of fulfilling their electoral promise, the new government in the state announced total prohibition on production, sale and purchase of liquor. This has not only led to smuggling of liquor from neighbouring states but also production of illicit liquor in the state, known as hooch. Women of the area decide to go on a protest against the recent hooch tragedy wherein several people lost their lives owing to consumption of illicit liquor. The political authorities scapegoat you for mismanagement.

(a) What are the issues involved in this case?

(b) What are the various options available to you. Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it. 20

आप हाल ही में एक युवा जिला आयुक्त के रूप में नागरिक प्रशासन में सम्मिलित हुए हैं। अपने चुनावी वादे को पूरा करने के संदर्भ में, राज्य में नई सरकार ने शराब के उत्पादन और खरीद-विक्री पूर्ण प्रतिबंध की घोषणा की है। इसके परिणाम स्वरूप न केवल पड़ोसी राज्य से शराब की तस्करी बल्कि राज्य में 'हूच' नाम से प्रसिद्ध अवैध शराब का उत्पादन भी आरंभ हो गया है। आपके जिले की महिलाओं ने हाल ही की एक हूच त्रासदी के विरुद्ध विरोध-प्रदर्शन करने का निश्चय किया है, जिसमें कई लोगों ने अवैध शराब के सेवन के कारण अपनी जानें गवाई थी। राजनीतिक प्राधिकारियों ने उक्त कुप्रबंधन के लिए आपको बलि का बकरा बनाया है।

(a) इस मामले में सम्मिलित मुद्दे क्या हैं?

(b) आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और चयन करने का कारण स्पष्ट करते हुए सर्वोत्तम विकल्प सुझाइए।

Q11 (a) In the above case the following issues are involved:

① The prohibition in the state is being violated.

② Because of prohibition - Illicit liquor is entering the state and is being consumed.

③ The people involved in this case need to be identified

who manufactured and sold the illicit liquor.

④ The long-term solution for alcoholism needs to be sought - other than prohibition.

Q11

⑤ The case involves death of people by consuming illicit liquor. It involves ensuring that the prohibition law is effectively implemented while putting a ban on any consumption & sale of illicit liquor.

The following options are available in the above case:-

① Request the govt to remove the ban on alcohol

Merit:- (i) Domestic and international experience shows that prohibition does not work as it is a short-term solution.

Demerit:- (i) Civil servant's primary responsibility is to implement the law laid down by the legislature or executive.

(ii) Will not ensure that the people behind the tragedy are punished.

(iii) The political class might want even stricter action against the District Commissioners.

② Launch a drive against illicit liquor manufacturers and sellers. Ensure even stricter ban on alcohol consumption.

Merit:- (i) The men/women behind the harsh tragedy might get punished.

- (ii) Will discourage other hooch manufacturers and sellers.
- (iii) Might reduce the anger among the people and satisfy the political class.

Demerit :- (i) Does not offer a long-term solution to the problem of alcoholism.

- (ii) Many of the culprits might escape to other states

(C) WAY FORWARD - likely solution.



Coordinate with neighboring states and launch a drive against hooch sellers. Use development fund to set up de-addiction centres. Try to find employment

In the family members of those who
died because of consuming
illicit liquor

Merit :- (1) Offers long-term solution
to the problem of alcoholism.

(2) Livelihood of the family members
of the deceased persons is then
gone.

(3) Likely to convince the protestors
to give up on their protest and
also convince the political class.

Demerit :- The prohibition policy
will continue to exist which
empirical evidence suggests
causes more deaths (NCRB
data) due to alcoholism than
when no prohibition exists.

12. You are a doctoral student at a large university in the final months of your research on a potentially revolutionary technology. Meanwhile, you have also applied for post-doctoral research cum teaching positions at various universities. To your pleasant surprise, you get an interview call from your undergraduate alma mater, a prestigious research institution in a city where you would love to live.

In the interview, the department chair asks for detailed information about your research.

Your group is working on a patent application and its members have agreed not to provide details until a paper currently being prepared is submitted for publication. You explain the situation and tell them that you would be glad to send them an early preprint when it is available.

But the Chair pushes harder for this information, remarking that the Department seeks team players, willing to share information with department colleagues. She also appeals to your undergraduate connection with the institution.

(a) Enumerate the ethical issues involved in the case in light of your current responsibilities vis-a-vis future expectations.

(b) Discuss the possible motivations of the department chair in pressing you for detailed information.

(c) What stand will you take in such a situation? Give reasonable justification for your arguments.

20

आप एक प्रख्यात विश्वविद्यालय में किसी संभाव्य क्रांतिकारी प्रौद्योगिकी पर शोध कर रहे हैं और शोध पूरा होने में कुछ ही महीने शेष बचे हैं। इसी बीच, आपने विभिन्न विश्वविद्यालयों में शोध सह-अध्यापन पदों के लिए भी आवेदन किया है। आपको एक सुखद व आश्चर्यजनक समाचार प्राप्त होता है कि आपको स्नातक स्तर की उस संस्था से साक्षात्कार के लिए बुलावा प्राप्त हुआ है, जहाँ से आपने शिक्षा प्राप्त की है जो एक ऐसे नगर में स्थापित प्रतिष्ठित संस्थान है जहाँ रहना आप पसंद करेंगे।

साक्षात्कार में विभागीय अधिकारी आपके शोध के संबंध में विस्तृत सूचना मांगती हैं।

आपका समूह एक पेटेंट आवेदन पर कार्य कर रहा है और इसके सदस्य इस हेतु सहमत हुए हैं कि जब तक वर्तमान में तैयार किया जा रहा शोध पत्र प्रकाशन के लिए जमा न कर दिया जाए, तब तक कोई विवरण किसी अन्य को प्रदान नहीं किया जाए। आप परिस्थिति समझाते हैं और उन्हें कहते हैं कि जब शोध पत्र उपलब्ध हो जाएगा तो आपको उनके लिए उक्त शोध पत्र का नमूना भेजने में प्रसन्नता होगी।

किंतु विभागीय अधिकारी इस सूचना के लिए अत्यधिक दबाव देती हैं। वह यह स्पष्ट करती हैं कि विभाग ऐसे लोगों की नियुक्ति चाहता है जो टीम के रूप में साथ मिलकर काम कर सकें और विभागीय सहयोगियों के साथ सूचना साझा कर सकें। वह संस्था के साथ आपके स्नातक स्तरीय संपर्कों का भी वास्ता देती है।

- (a) अपनी वर्तमान जिम्मेदारियों और भविष्य की अपेक्षाओं को सामने रखते हुए इस प्रकरण में शामिल विभिन्न नैतिक मुद्दों की पहचान कीजिए।
- (b) आपसे विस्तृत जानकारी हेतु दबाव डालने के संबंध में विभागीय अधिकारी के संभावित उत्प्रेरणाओं पर चर्चा कीजिए।
- (c) ऐसी स्थिति में आप क्या निर्णय लेंगे? अपने तर्क को औचित्यपूर्ण सिद्ध कीजिए।

The above situation involves divulging details of a research project. But those details cannot be shared at this moment as research is not yet complete and involves other members interests as they have participated in the research too.

Ethical issues involved :-

- (A) Divulging details of the research project tantamounts to breaking the trust of other team members.
- (B) The research itself can become compromised if the details are divulged.
- (C) The definition of "team player" which the Chair is stressing on - can lead to future ethical dilemmas too, as she appears to undermine individual hardwork.

(B) The department chair could have the following motivations :-

(1) The chair is herself researching a similar subject and is curious to know the details of a similar research.

(2) The chair is merely testing the Candidates by pushing the point further - to test whether he really understands the meaning of being team player.

(3) She has been asked by the University to get the details of the research being conducted at another university.

(C) Placed in a similar situation, I would patiently explain to the department chair that as per the ethics of research, I am

not in a position to divulge any detail of the research project. I would inform her that placed in a similar situation while working with her university — she would have expected me to stick to the same ethical principles.

At the same time, I would tell her that I will ensure that she gets to read the research findings before any of her peers. But she would have to wait until all the rest of my teammates agree to my sharing the details with her.

Lastly, I will tell her that since she has raised my undergraduate connection then she should be glad to know that the foundation of my present ethical standards (and hence the decision to not divulge the findings) was laid in her university.

13. You have recently been appointed as the District Collector of an impoverished district, which has been witnessing drought for the last couple of years. Corruption at lower levels of bureaucracy has further aggravated the situation. The district also faces the problem of diminishing resources of drinking water. Despite, the gravity of the problem, the response from the central and the state government is lackadaisical. Moreover, the media coverage of the problem is also dismal. To make matters worse, the younger members of the community are migrating in search of work to the urban areas without much success, leaving the elders, women, and children behind to fend for themselves.

(a) As the District Collector what would be your priorities for solving the problem?

(b) How would you tackle the situation?

(c) What long term measures would you take to prevent the future recurrence of the problem?

20

आपको हाल ही में एक अत्यंत पिछड़े जिले के जिला कलेक्टर के रूप में नियुक्त किया गया है। उक्त जिला पिछले कुछ वर्षों से सूखे की चपेट में रहा है। नौकरशाही के निचले स्तर पर व्याप्त भ्रष्टाचार ने परिस्थिति को और गंभीर बना दिया है। यह जिला, पेयजल स्रोतों के गिरते जल स्तर की समस्याओं का सामना भी कर रहा है। परिस्थिति की गंभीरता के बावजूद भी, केंद्र और राज्य सरकार की प्रतिक्रिया चिंतनीय है। इसके अतिरिक्त, उक्त समस्या की मीडिया कवरेज भी निराशाजनक है। स्थानीय समुदाय के नौजवान सदस्य बुजुर्गों, महिलाओं और बच्चों को अपने भरण-पोषण की व्यवस्था स्वयं करने हेतु छोड़कर काम की खोज में शहरी क्षेत्रों, की ओर पलायन कर रहे हैं, जहां उन्हें अपेक्षित सफलता प्राप्त नहीं हो रही है। इससे यह स्थिति और बदतर होती जा रही है।

(a) जिला कलेक्टर के रूप में उक्त समस्या के समाधान के लिए आपकी प्राथमिकताएँ क्या होंगी?

(b) आप इस स्थिति से कैसे निपटेंगे?

(c) इस समस्या की भावी पुनरावृत्ति को रोकने के लिए आप कौन-से दीर्घावधिक उपाय अपनाएंगे?

Q13 (c) The District Collector's
priorities should be:-

① Ensure clean drinking water
is available to people and
for animals.

- ② Ensure the health department of the district is geared up to handle all water-borne illnesses.
- ③ Co-ordinate with Central & State governments to draw a long-term strategy to solve the water crisis.
- ④ Promote low-water agriculture. This would also help in discouraging migration.
- ⑤ Use media - to attract attention of NGOs to develop indigenous methods of irrigation in the district.

Q13

- ⑤ As the DC, I would tackle the problem in the following way:-

① Utilise MGRDA Workers
to clean all tanks and
rivers.

Also, we plan to construct
new wells and tanks.

② Lead by example.

I will order the Secretariat -
to show that no water is
wasted in the official premise
For eg:- Order/request staff to
use minimum flush instead
pour water.

Through this I will try to
request the residents to not
waste water: Prefer bucket
over shower; boil water
instead of R.O. etc.

③ Put ^{a temp.} ban on all wasteful
resources → Such as swimming
pools and showers in
parks.

Q13 - (C)
 (A) Draw a long-term plan →

It will include:-

- (a) Climate-specific agriculture
- (b) Sharing of water among houses through common taps.
- (c) Promote rain harvesting and drip irrigation.
- (d) Coordinate with Indian Railways to put in place a water-train in case of extreme emergency.
- (e) Information from the met department should be shared at the earliest with the farmers using mobile and radio.
- (f) Run a special class in all schools to make them aware of water conservation & how it can be practiced.

14. In a district, in which you are posted as a District Magistrate, a teacher molests a child in a government run school. As the news of this crime spreads, the parents, relatives and locals gather at the school. The culprit teacher has meanwhile fled. The police arrests the Principal of the school and assure the crowd that the culprit would be arrested soon. The crowd, however, has gone berserk and begins to damage the school building. It wants immediate arrest of the culprit and is not ready to budge until he is arrested.

(a) Is it correct to take the Principal into custody when he has personally not committed the crime? Support your answer with appropriate reasons.

(b) What options do you have in dealing with the crowd? Enumerate the merits and demerits of each and also suggest the best possible option.

(c) In the capacity of District Magistrate what would be your long term plan to prevent molestations and rapes in the schools? 20

एक जिले में जहां आप एक जिलाधिकारी के रूप में पदस्थापित हैं, वहां के एक सरकारी विद्यालय का एक शिक्षक एक बच्चे से छेड़छाड़ करता है। जब इस अपराध की खबर फैलती है तो उस बच्चे के माता-पिता, सगे-संबंधी और स्थानीय लोग विद्यालय के पास एकत्रित हो जाते हैं। इसी बीच आरोपी शिक्षक फ़रार हो जाता है। पुलिस उस विद्यालय के प्राचार्य को गिरफ्तार कर लेती है और भीड़ को यह आश्वासन देती है कि आरोपी को शीघ्र ही गिरफ्तार कर लिया जाएगा। तथापि भीड़ अनियंत्रित हो जाती है और विद्यालय भवन को क्षतिग्रस्त करना आरंभ कर देती है। उक्त भीड़ आरोपी की तत्काल गिरफ्तारी चाहती है और जब तक उसे गिरफ्तार नहीं कर लिया जाता, तब तक वे वहाँ से हिलने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं।

(a) क्या प्राचार्य को हिरासत में लेना सही है, जबकि उसने व्यक्तिगत रूप से अपराध नहीं किया है? उपयुक्त कारणों सहित अपने उत्तर का समर्थन कीजिए।

(b) आपके पास भीड़ से निपटने के कौन से विकल्प हैं? प्रत्येक के गुणों व दोषों की गणना कीजिए और सर्वोत्तम संभावित विकल्प सुझाइए।

(c) एक जिलाधिकारी के रूप में विद्यालयों में छेड़छाड़ और बलात्कार की घटना को रोकने के लिए आपकी दीर्घकालिक योजना क्या होगी?

Q14(a) The arrest of the principal appears as a kneejerk reaction by the police aimed at calming the crowd. However, this does not imply that

The principal is absolved of all his responsibilities. The likely response should be to launch an investigation into the role of the police, check if the principal fulfilled all his duties to ensure children's safety. If the principal is found guilty prima facie by the police — then only he should be arrested.

⑥ To control the crowd, the DM has the following options.

① Order the police to take strict action against the crowd.

Merit :- → It will disperse the crowd and save the public property from dangers.

Demerit :- → It might further anger the crowd.

→ It will lead to loss of
credibility of the District Admin-
-stration in the eyes of the public.

② Assure the crowd that the
culprit will be soon caught and
request them to end their protest.

Merit :- → The crowd might
get convinced and end
their protest.

→ Will ensure minimum harm
to the protestors.

Demerit :- → The protestors might
refuge to budge.

→ They might take advantage
of the leniency and get more
violent.

③ Way Forward - Best Solution



Inform the Crowd that (a) the principal has been called for questioning,

(b) a special SIT ~~has been~~ ^{has been} formed to locate the teacher.

(c) Warn them that though the administration is trying its best to find the accused - strict action will be taken against those indulging in violence if they don't desist at the earliest.

Merit → The Crowd will be given concrete reasons to feel assured that justice will be done.

→ The Admin will warn the Crowd before taking action against them.