



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 621)

Name of Candidate	Karn Satyarthi		
Medium Hindi/Eng.	English	Registration Number	5205
Center	Distance (Dhanbad)	Date	14.09.2015

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5(a)	10	
5(b)	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	20	
14	20	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

Signature of Examiner

INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are FOURTEEN questions printed in HINDI and ENGLISH. इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं तथा हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory. सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

Section A

Answer questions in NOT MORE than the word limit specified for each in the parenthesis. Content of the answer is more important than its length.

1. (a) "If instead of insisting on rights everyone does his duty, there will immediately be the rule of order established among mankind." - Mahatma Gandhi. Bring out what this statement means to you in the present context. (150 words) 10

"यदि अधिकारों पर बल देने के बजाय प्रत्येक व्यक्ति अपने कर्तव्य का पालन करे तो मानवजाति के बीच शीघ्र ही शासन व्यवस्था प्रतिष्ठित हो जाएगी।" - महात्मा गांधी। इस बात पर प्रकाश डालें कि वर्तमान परिप्रेक्ष्य में यह कथन का आपके लिए क्या महत्व रखता है? (150 शब्द)

Mahatma Gandhi has been one of the leading lights of an ethical approach towards issues of politics not only for India but for the world at large.

Writing for ~~the~~ Young India as well as Harijan he repeatedly brought out the virtue of performing one's duty and according more importance to the means rather than ends. In his words means are the ends.

When we talk about rights, concurrent to claims we impose an obligation on the wider society to act in a way that lets us enjoy our claims. e.g. our right to enjoy a healthy environment imposes an obligation, ~~not~~ to pollute for the wider society.

Gandhi approached the issue in a much more austere and dharmic way. His

view was that if everyone performs his/her obligations/duty the individual will automatically enjoy his/her rights. This viewpoint has several advantages in today's world. They are:

- (i) It instills in us a sense of responsibility.
- (ii) It generates empathy for the wider society.
- (iii) It enhances our sensitivity to the problem of others.

In today's multicultural, commercial and globalised world we would be better off if we followed Gandhi's unflinching commitment to duty.

1. (b) Should circumstances be the sole criterion for judging the morality of human action or the nature of the action and its purpose must also be considered? Justify your stand with examples. (150 words) 10

क्या परिस्थितियाँ ही मानव कार्यों की नैतिकता की परख करने का एक मात्र पैमाना होना चाहिए या कार्य की प्रकृति और उसके उद्देश्य पर भी विचार किया जाना चाहिए? उदाहरण प्रस्तुत करते हुए अपने मत की अभिव्यक्ति करें। (150 शब्द)

Various sociobiological theories propounded by scientists like Richard Dawkins claim that instincts have a genetic source. According to them a particular type of person will respond in a certain way to circumstances. By corollary people having similar genes will respond to similar circumstances in a similar fashion.

Our experience however tells us that this is not entirely true. Any human being's response to a circumstance is shaped & nurtured by a multitude of factors like:

- (i) his/her upbringing
- (ii) life experiences.
- (iii) Conscience.
- (iv) ability to convert thought into action.

In my view circumstances cannot be the sole criterion to judge the morality of action. There are numerous examples where people having similar backgrounds have turned to an entirely different

Scheme of action the morality of which are
 beyond doubt contrasting. e.g. while
 conditions of strife & war ^{in palestine} inspired Edward
 Said to become a world famous literary
 critic similar conditions prompted Osama
 Bin Laden to become a ~~drilled~~ criminal.
 Another example we can cite is of Ted
 Kaczynski who became a serial bomber
 after obtaining a PhD in mathematics
 from an Ivy league university.

2. (a) A person cannot do right in civil service whilst attempting to do wrong in personal life. In context of this statement, examine the relationship between personal and professional ethics. Do civil servants have to be ethical in personal life in order to be professionally ethical? Illustrate. (150 words) 10

अपने व्यक्तिगत जीवन में गलत करने में प्रयासरत व्यक्ति सिविल सेवा में सही कार्य नहीं कर सकता। इस कथन के परिप्रेक्ष्य में व्यक्तिगत और पेशेवर नैतिकता के बीच सम्बन्ध की जांच करें। क्या पेशेवर तौर पर नैतिक होने के लिए सिविल सेवकों को व्यक्तिगत जीवन में भी नैतिक होने की आवश्यकता है? व्याख्या करें। (150 शब्द)

When one holds an office of public value like a position in the civil service one's personal & professional lines no longer remain water tight compartments.

It is difficult to commit errors of judgement or corruption of conscience in personal life and expect to remain objective, efficient as well as honest in public life. This is because:

- (i) Although personal & private are different realms, they are ultimately artificial. Our conscience once corrupted will remain corrupted.
- (ii) The people we interact with in personal life might also interact with us in public life. How will we then maintain impartiality.
- (iii) The actions we undertake in personal life might have unintended consequences in our public actions.
- (iv) Civil servants are looked upon by the youth as examples to be emulated.

Civil servants have to maintain a level of impartiality, honesty and ethical behaviour in personal life as as to be maintain integrity in public ~~life~~ behaviour.

2. (b) What is the importance of whistle-blowing in public and private institutions? What role does individual conscience play in the act of whistle-blowing? (150 words) 10

सार्वजनिक एवं निजी संस्थानों में व्हिसल-ब्लोविंग का क्या महत्व है? व्हिसल-ब्लोविंग के कार्य में व्यक्तिगत विवेक की क्या भूमिका होती है? (150 शब्द)

For any organisation public or private ethical conduct is non negotiable. The best form of conduct is self regulation with sufficient checks and balances to nip unethical activities in the bud. However when an institution fails to regulate itself whistle blowers find themselves in a unique position to respond. This is because :

- (i) whistle blowers are from within the organisation hence know exactly where the institution has gone wrong / adopted unethical means.
- (ii) A whistle blower has access to both personnel & documents that act as evidence within the institution.
- (iii) whistle blowers are truly aware of what great harm an unethical practice is causing the world at large.

The act of whistleblowing requires great personal courage, sense of duty and willingness to sacrifice. Individual conscience plays the most important role in the act of whistleblowing. Famous examples whether its Frank Serpico

who blew the whistle over New York City police's corrupt activities or closer home like Satyendra Dubey have always a paid an individual price for the act of whistleblowing. At ^{least} ^{obligation} whistleblowers do not have any legal or otherwise to expose corrupt practices but they do it risking ~~at~~ their personal safety purely on the basis of individual Conscience.

3. (a) 'Objectivity' and 'neutrality' are among the core civil service values. Discuss with examples. (150 words) 10

'वस्तुनिष्ठता' एवं 'तटस्थता' सिविल सेवा के आधारभूत मूल्यों में स्थान रखते हैं। उदाहरणों के साथ चर्चा करें। (150 शब्द)

A civil servant has to deal with myriad issues in the course of her/his routine work. Most of these issues have a public character and hence it becomes increasingly important to be objective and neutral in decision making. This is because: as well as ethical

(i) Civil servants have a legal obligation to be honest, impartial and objective.

(ii) They always have to act in the best interest of the nation and in accordance with the values of the Constitution of India.

(iii) Their actions impact the most vulnerable sections of our society, this impact has to be positive and for that to happen decision making must be neutral, objective & evidence based.

(iv) Civil servants also act as arbiters in competing and diverse interests; in such a scenario it is very important that the notions of both 'Niti' and 'Nyaya' pass through the test of fairness. In other words they impact both policy and justice.

India has given us many great civil servants whose impartiality and objectivity has been beneficial to us in many ways. Examples include our former CAG Vinod Rai who helped exposed large scale corruption, MN Buch the great urban planner, E Sridharan who has delivered us one of the finest metro rails in the world, VP Menon who was instrumental along with Dandekar Patel in unifying post Independence India and many others.

3. (b) The legal framework in modern society has both anomalous and complementary relationship with its ethical framework. Discuss with examples. (150 words) 10

आधुनिक समाज में कानूनी ढाँचे का इसके नीतिगत ढाँचे के साथ असंगत और पूरक, दोनों सम्बन्ध हैं। उदाहरणों के साथ चर्चा करें। (150 शब्द)

One of the key questions in today's jurisprudence is the relationship between law & morality. There are two dominant discourses in this regard. The first one is the doctrine of positive law.

According to this doctrine law is law only by the ability of its makers to enforce it. This view deals not concern itself with implicit morality of law.

Another view is that any law must have a moral core and ethical underpinning. Our constitution makers clearly opted for the second view.

Even the British administered India under the garb of an elaborate legal arrangement but these laws were at best utilitarian and had poor to moderate moral content but were focused towards efficiency in administration. Over the years dictators of most countries claim some form of legal approval for their rule but this again is devoid of any ethical framework.

India however is a unique case where the constitution makers tried to

create a mandatory ethical framework for any law to be constitutional in India.

In India ethics preceded the collective conscience of the society in many instances. e.g. the anti untouchability law was passed when a majority of Indians gave tacit consent to the practice itself. However there remain certain laws perhaps as a residue of long British rule that are anomalous to morality. e.g. the law of preventive detention.

Laws regulate individual's behaviour and we must ensure all times that laws of ~~state~~ ^{are steeped} in ethical debate and not at odds with what is right.

4. (a) There seems to be a fundamental contradiction between effectiveness and accountability. Comment. Why is accountability a necessary evil for good governance? Discuss. (150 words) 10

प्रभाविता और उत्तरदायित्व के बीच आधारभूत विरोधाभास नज़र आता है। टिप्पणी करें। सुशासन की राह में उत्तरदायित्व एक आवश्यक बुराई क्यों है, इस पर विचार करें। (150 शब्द)

Effectiveness and accountability are both very important for decisionmaking in public life. However many times we face a tradeoff between the two. Maximising accountability slows down the efficiency and maximising efficiency forces us to bypass accountability.

The parliament is a classic example where of late the treasury benches and the opposition benches are fundamentally opposed in favour of effectiveness and accountability respectively.

Accountability however is key to good governance. This is because:

- (i) Accountability ensures that what we gain is permanent and that good decisions are not arbitrarily reversed.
- (ii) It forces politicians, civil servants and lawmakers to be responsive to the need of the grass roots.
- (iii) Accountability ensures that the opposition acts as a watchdog over the government.

- (iv.) It helps in educating the masses about rights and the functioning of an electoral democracy.
- (v.) It sensitises the ruling class towards their duty and the means to achieve ends.

In other words governance without accountability is hollow. Many authoritarian dictators lay claim upon efficiency or effectiveness however the people are invariably dissatisfied. This shows that only accountability can ensure enduring development and progress.

4. (b) "One of the penalties for refusing to participate in politics is that you end up being governed by your inferiors". Explain. Suggest some measures that can be taken to increase political participation in our country. (150 words) 10

"राजनीति में भागीदारी निभाने से अस्वीकार करने की सज़ाओं में से एक है अपने से निम्न स्तर के लोगों के द्वारा शासित होना।" इस कथन की व्याख्या करें। हमारे देश में राजनीतिक भागीदारी बढ़ाने के लिए किये जा सकते वाले कुछ उपायों के बारे में सुझाव दें। (150 शब्द)

In my view we should not harbour misgivings like inferiority or superiority over human beings in a democracy. Different people are endowed by ~~of~~ variable ~~amount of~~ acumen in different areas. However if a person of doubtful ability reaches to a position of eminence it is because the system is not yielding optimum results. We often complain about the character of our elected politicians but consequently forget that it is ~~us~~ we who have elected our representatives. Some measures that can be taken to increase political participation include:

- (i) Increased political socialisation especially among the youth from the middle classes.
- (ii) Educating the wider public on issues like rights, duties of our elected representative.
- (iii) It is often said that information destroys corruption, ~~is~~ a big reason

for political apathy is the perception that the political class as a whole is corrupt in this regard we must utilise legislations like Right To Information to its full potential.

(iv) We must instil in ourselves a notion of collective nation building.

(v) The political class as a stakeholder must strive to clean up its image and the noble ideals of our national movement must be revived. This will make politics a profession of service.

We must realise that politics as an instrument of power can be used effectively for welfare & development. Politics can be a force of good ^{only} when individual politicians work with responsibility and the society at large holds them accountable.

5. (a) The erosion of civic values from our public life has become a pervasive phenomenon. Discuss the role of value education in tackling this issue in the Indian context. (150 words) 10

हमारे सार्वजनिक जीवन से नागरिक मूल्यों का ह्रास एक व्यापक परिघटना बन गयी है। भारतीय परिप्रेक्ष्य में इस मुद्दे का समाधान करने के सन्दर्भ में मूल्यप्रद शिक्षा की भूमिका पर चर्चा करें। (150 शब्द)

~~The~~ The presence of civic values forms the bedrock for any society's existence. Civic values imply that a citizen is steered of the fact that he is not atomistic but belongs to a collective and has a responsibility to act in accordance with the principles that govern the wider society.

Some evidence of erosion of civic values include:

- (i) Absence of cleanliness in public spaces.
- (ii) deterioration in quality of public goods like transport, parks, education etc.

Value education must perform a critical role in shaping lives of individuals so that they can positively impact their civic environment. Value education can not make someone distinctively ethical or unethical but it can give us the tools to discern between what is right and what is wrong. Value education will:

- (i) Help us understand that our civic actions can have unintended consequences and hence must be thoughtful.

- (ii) Help us understand that ultimate ~~result~~ fruits of positive civic values accrue to us. e.g. If we help keep the park clean and well maintained we ourselves will be able to use it for recreational purpose.
- (iii) Our civic values speak a lot about how we are as a society.
- (iv) Value education will also help us act as informed citizens who understand that we have a duty to adhere to civic values even if we are not directly benefited by them.

5. (b) It is often said that home is the first school and parents are the first teachers. Explain the role of family in inculcating moral values. Analyze how the changing nature of family has affected this role in the context of India.

(150 words)

10

प्रायः यह कहा जाता है कि घर प्रथम विद्यालय और माता-पिता प्रथम शिक्षक होते हैं। नैतिक मूल्यों की स्थापना में परिवार की भूमिका की व्याख्या प्रस्तुत करें। भारतीय परिप्रेक्ष्य में इस बात का विश्लेषण करें कि परिवार की बदलती प्रकृति ने किस प्रकार इस भूमिका को प्रभावित किया है? (150 शब्द)

Family as an institution has stood the test of time. There have been many qualitative as well as numerical shifts in the nature of our family system but its importance as an institution remains undeniable.

For any child:

- (i) The family members especially the parents are the first set of human beings they interact with.
- (ii) Children's formative years are spent with family.
- (iii) There has been scientific evidence on issues like educational achievement and family structure. In most cases the family environment lays the basis for future achievement.
- (iv) Family is the most important institution towards building of social capital.

Changes in the economic structure of the society has led to many changes in the family structure. Some of them and their impact are:

- (i) The numerical size of the middle class family has decreased.

we have moved towards a nuclear family from a joint family. The child often in such cases is not able to be in constant touch of grandparents, grandparents earlier used to be an important source of traditional moral values.

(ii) The emergence of working couples has led to an increase in the number of children who grew up through baby sitting and are not fully able to imbibe the values that parents must impart.

Our society just like the family structure is undergoing a transition and we must strive to strike a balance between the financial, social and moral needs of our children.

6. "A world without nuclear weapons would be less stable and more dangerous for all of us." Critically examine the ethical dimensions of the given statement from the perspective of international relations. (150 words) 10

"नाभिकीय हथियारों से रहित विश्व हम सब के लिए अपेक्षाकृत कम स्थायित्व और अधिक खतरनाक होगा।" अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संबंधों के सन्दर्भ में उक्त कथन के नैतिक आयामों की आलोचनात्मक व्याख्या करें। (150 शब्द)

Nuclear weapons have presented before us spectre that haunts us. The memory of Hiroshima and Nagasaki is still fresh and the irony is that the world has seen a tremendous pace in nuclear proliferation since the end of the second world war.

The arguments ^{often extended} in favour of possession of nuclear weapons is deterrence. Nuclear powers like India, Pakistan, UK & France claim that nuclear weapons up the costs of war dramatically hence reduce the chances of conflict. Historical evidence also suggests that nuclear weapons' power do not often engage in conventional warfare an exception being the Kargil war of 1999 ~~bt~~ between India Pakistan.

Critics however point out many flaws in the nuclear ~~po~~ weapons regime. Some of them are:

- (i) History shows us that great powers e.g. USA in Hiroshima do not resist first use of ~~a~~ & unilateral application of nuclear warfare

(ii.) Nuclear safety is another major issue, what if a 'dirty bomb' goes into the hand of violent non state actors like Al Qaeda.

(iii.) Nuclear weapons always lead to an escalation arms race.

(iv.) Even the thought of nuclear weapons use sends chills up our spine when we consider the possibility of Mutual Assured Destruction and nuclear winter.

(v.) Safety of fissile material and threat of unintended use/accident remains a possibility.

The presence of nuclear weapons is a reality and we can't escape it however we must strive to contain weapons' proliferation and ensure enduring safety of fissile material. Only the non use of nuclear weapons can lead us to a world of enduring peace.

7. The increasing speed and scope of globalization has raised several ethical concerns. Analyze with examples. (150 words) 10

वैश्वीकरण की बढ़ती गति एवं संभावना ने नैतिकता संबंधी कई चिंताएं पैदा कर दी हैं।
उदाहरणों के साथ विश्लेषण करें। (150 शब्द)

Ever since the Washington Consensus of late 1980s the world has rapidly moved towards free trade, a web of interdependence and porous national boundaries. While globalisation has undoubtedly many positive impacts, it has also thrown up some ethical concerns. Some of them are:

1) Global citizen/cosmopolitan v nationality:
To whom does an individual have an allegiance? Is he/she a global citizen first or a national of his/her country of birth. This dilemma is especially underscored due to mobility of labour across national boundaries. e.g. growing number of Indian Americans today have this identity crisis.

2) The issue of sovereignty:
When the government of India negotiates on international fora like WTO it has to strike a balance between competing local interests and global demands.

3) The issue of free trade:
While free trade has been a force of good on many occasions it has also caused some problems especially to producers of agricultural goods.

4.) Climate change:

Different countries are at different level of development ~~but~~ ^{and} have contributed varying to climate change but each country has to face the challenges irrespective of its historical emissions.

5.) Weakening of traditional relations like family, society etc.

6.) Overload of information due to shortening of time-space gaps. This leads to hollowing out of many indigenous cultures and leads to a dull uniformity.

Globalisation is a force that has considerable force & autonomy we must be cautious enough to use it wisely and keep its ^{pace} under control to utilise its full potential.

8. What do you understand by aptitude? What kind of aptitude is considered important for civil services? What measures have you taken to make yourself fit for being a civil servant? (150 words) 10

अभिक्षमता से आप क्या समझते हैं? किस प्रकार की अभिक्षमता सिविल सेवा के लिए महत्वपूर्ण समझी जाती है? स्वयं को सिविल सेवक के रूप में उपयुक्त बनाने हेतु आपने कौन-से उपाय किये हैं? (150 शब्द)

Aptitude can be defined as an inherent or acquired ability and proclivity towards a certain area of work or specialisation. Aptitude also implies a capacity to undertake roles that are required by specific professions.

Most countries employ a permanent or temporary civil service to aid and advise the ~~executive~~ executive. Civil servants are supposed to be generalists with an aptitude for a wide ranging fields of interest that include policy making, administration, management, economy, finance, history, knowledge of the basic structure of the government, law and accounting. A civil servant ~~must~~ preferably has a good intelligence as well as emotional quotient as well as management and leadership skills.

The steps that we can take to develop ourselves for a career in civil service include:

- (i) Wide reading on various subjects.

This includes the reading of autobiographies, biographies of national heroes as well as former civil servants.

(ii) Involve ourselves in team activities in school or in college/academic institutions.

(iii) develop an interest in current happenings in the national and international arena.

(iv) Be receptive to new ideas.

(v) Have an appetite for innovation.

(vi) Develop an empathy for fellow human beings.

(vii) Constantly challenge ourselves with newer assignments in our fields of interest.

Above all we must recognise that with great comes greater ~~to~~ responsibility and act in accordance with our Constitutional ideals.

Section B

In the following questions, carefully study the cases presented and then answer the questions that follow:

9. You are a young civil servant posted in a tribal dominated district, which is notorious for illegal mining done by mafia. They exercise their power over poor tribals of the region by bribing the local tribal musclemen who have political aspirations. The consequent easy money and luxury have ensured that these musclemen work in the interest of these mafia. They use these 'tribal' musclemen as a 'front' to plant 'constructed' news in the media to create confusion or to gain sympathy of the civil society activists and the public at large. It is a strategy to thwart any concrete action of the government for eliminating the menace of illegal activities in that area. You quickly understood these designs after assuming the office. You came to know that some employees in your own office are in nexus with the mafia. When you initiated stringent action against the mafia they turned hostile. They prompted few tribal musclemen to file a fake FIR against you under the stringent provisions of the 'Prevention of Atrocities Against SC and ST Act'. They also convinced the unsuspecting poor tribals that the state was 'again' launching atrocities against them. These poor tribals were eventually tutored to write a complaint to the National and State Commission for ST, a copy of which was leaked to the media.

This could easily become a very hot issue for the opposition parties in the state as the Assembly Elections were due only six months later. Unfortunately all this can have grave consequences for your career.

(a) Bring out and discuss the ethical issues involved in the above case.

(b) What steps will you take in pursuance of the most appropriate closure of this case? (250 words)

20

आप एक जनजातीय बहुल जिले में पदस्थापित युवा सिविल सेवक हैं। यह जिले के माफिया द्वारा अवैध खनन हेतु कुख्यात है। वे (माफिया) राजनीतिक आकांक्षा रखने वाले जनजातीय दबंगों को रिश्त देकर निर्धन आदिवासियों पर अपनी हुकूमत चलाते हैं। इसके परिणामस्वरूप सरलता से प्राप्त होने वाले पैसे और विलासिता ने इन दबंग लोगों द्वारा माफिया के हित में कार्य किया जाना सुनिश्चित किया है। वे नागरिक समाज के कार्यकर्ताओं और आम जनता के बीच बड़े पैमाने पर भ्रम फैलाने या उनकी सहानुभूति बटोरने के लिए मीडिया में झूठी खबरों को स्थान दिलाने हेतु इन जनजातीय दबंगों का उपयोग "भोहरा" के रूप में करते हैं। यह सरकार द्वारा उक्त क्षेत्र में अवैध गतिविधियों के संजाल को समाप्त करने के लिए की जाने वाली किसी भी ठोस कार्रवाई को निष्फल करने की एक रणनीति है।

पद-भार ग्रहण करने के शीघ्र बाद आप इन घटबंदों को समझ गए। आपको यह बात भी पता चली कि आपके कार्यालय के कुछ कर्मचारी माफिया के साथ सांठ-गांठ रखते हैं। जब आपने माफिया के विरुद्ध कड़ी कार्रवाई आरम्भ की तो उनका रुख आपके प्रति शत्रुत्व हो गया। उन्होंने अनुसूचित जाति और अनुसूचित जनजाति अत्याचार निवारण अधिनियम के संख्य प्रावधानों के तहत आपके विरुद्ध एक झूठी प्रथम सूचना रिपोर्ट (एफ. आई. आर.) दाखिल करने के लिए कुछ जनजातीय दबंगों को उकसाया। उन्होंने शंका रहित निर्धन आदिवासियों को इस बात का विश्वास दिलाया कि सरकार पुनः उन पर अत्याचार कर रही है। अतः, इन निर्धन आदिवासियों को राष्ट्रीय अनुसूचित जनजाति आयोग और राज्य अनुसूचित जनजाति

आयोग के पास शिकायत दर्ज कराने को बहलाया और सिखाया गया, जिसकी एक प्रति मीडिया में प्रकट कर दी गयी।

चूँकि सिर्फ छह माह बाद विधान सभा के चुनाव होने वाले हैं, यह विपक्षी दलों के लिए बड़ी सरलता से एक गर्म मुद्दा बन सकता है। दुर्भाग्य से इस सबका आपके भविष्य पर बुरा प्रभाव पड़ सकता है।

(a) उपर्युक्त मामले से जुड़े नैतिकता संबंधी मुद्दे पर प्रकाश डालें और चर्चा करें।

(b) इस प्रकरण की सर्वाधिक उपयुक्त दंग से समाप्ति हेतु आप कौन से कदम उठाएंगे? (250 शब्द)

There are many stakeholders with competing interests involved in the above mentioned case. The prominent ones are:

- (i) The civil servant: his interest being to clamp down on illegal mining and perform his duty to the best of his ability.
- (ii) Mining Mafia: Their interest is making money by whatever means they think is fit.
- (iii) Tribal strongmen: They are paid by the mafia but do not have any intrinsic interest in exploitation.
- (iv) The tribals at large: They face an acute case of information asymmetry hence their welfare is disregarded.
- (v) The ruling party: Their interest is in tribal welfare but they also want to avoid negative publicity so that they don't lose the next elections.

(vi.) The people of the country at large:
Cases like these manifest themselves in different forms in different areas of the country therefore there is a larger national interest involved in delivering justice in such cases.

There are some principles that must guide our conduct in the pursuit of our objectives they are:

(i) In public service we must adhere to the John Ruskin's maxim of 'the greatest good of all' or what Gandhi called 'Sarvodaya'.

(ii) We must also keep in mind Kant's deontological (or duty based) theory and at all times strive towards its universal application.

(iii) In public service we must also at all times be considerate of the wider consequences of our actions and hence be a consequentialist in a limited sense.

Considering the above 3 principles my plan of action towards the resolution of this case will be as follows:

(i) First of all I will take strict action against the ~~the~~ employees in my own organisation who are abetting criminal activities. This might include suspension, transfers or in extreme cases dismissal.

(ii) Secondly I would try to run a campaign to reach out to tribals themselves by short circuiting the strongmen. In this pursuit I may have to utilise some ~~frictions~~ friction or political opposition to the tribal strongmen within their own communities.

(iii) I will immediately initiate the proceedings to set up a 'district mineral foundation'. This will be followed by educating the ~~the~~ tribals about:

- (i) benefits that will accrue to them if illegal mining is brought under the ambit of the law
- (ii) That currently the mafia & the strongmen are the only ones benefitting.
- (iv) I will try to build on the social capital of elders from tribal areas in this pursuit.
- (v) I will make a comprehensive report on the ground level situation and send them to all prominent media bodies and invite them to visit ground zero and investigate themselves.

If the above mentioned steps turn out to be even partially successful our purpose will be achieved. I will present myself and all evidence at my disposal to the National Commission and since I have not done anything ^{thing} contrary to the law I am sure I will be absolved and be allowed to continue my work.

10. In the face of acute famine in the district, you, as an area officer, have instructed your subordinates to procure food grains from the FCI godowns located in the adjoining districts. This would make the food grains available to the public through PDS shops. Considering the gravity of the situation, this task has to be done immediately, because majority of the people in the district are poor, and therefore can't buy the food at the market prices. However, you were told that all the truck operators have formed a cartel and are asking for three times the usual transportation rate, in order to exploit the situation. This would nullify your effort, as the prices of the food grains would increase due to high transportation charges.

(a) Following are some suggested options. Please evaluate the merits and demerits of each of the options:

1. Threaten the truck owners of severe consequences if they do not fall in line and cancel their transportation permits.

2. Transport the food grains by Railways, though it may take a week.

3. Agree to pay the truck owners the transportation charges they are demanding, so as to ensure the availability of food grains, but searching for alternative and affordable transportation. However, take legal actions against the truck owners at a later time.

4. Asking the state government for sending some help.

(b) Also indicate (without necessarily restricting to the above options) the course of action you would like to follow, giving proper reasons for the same. (250 words)

20

जिले में गंभीर अकाल की स्थिति में, एक क्षेत्रीय पदाधिकारी के रूप में आपने अपने सहायकों को समीपवर्ती जिलों में स्थित भारतीय खाद्य निगम के गोदामों से खाद्यान्न प्राप्त करने का निर्देश दिया है। इससे जन वितरण प्रणाली के माध्यम से लोगों को खाद्यान्न उपलब्ध हो पायेगा। स्थिति की गंभीरता को समझते हुए इस कार्य को शीघ्रतापूर्वक किया जाना है क्योंकि इस जिले की ज्यादातर जनता निर्धन है और इसलिए वे बाज़ार-मूल्य पर खाद्यान्न नहीं खरीद सकते। यद्यपि आपको बताया गया था कि सभी ट्रक-संचालकों ने एक संघ बना लिया है और स्थिति का लाभ उठाने के लिए वर्तमान दुलाई दर के तिगुने की मांग कर रहे हैं। इससे आपका प्रयास व्यर्थ हो जाएगा क्योंकि उच्च दुलाई दर के कारण खाद्यान्न के मूल्यों में बढोतरी हो जायेगी।

(a) नीचे कुछ विकल्प सुझाए गए हैं। कृपया प्रत्येक विकल्प के गुण एवं दोष का मूल्यांकन करें:

1. ट्रक-स्वामियों द्वारा आपकी बात न मानने के लिए उन्हें गंभीर परिणामों की धमकी देंगे और उनके परिवहन अनुज्ञा-पत्र को रद्द कर देंगे।

2. रेलवे द्वारा खाद्यान्न की दुलाई करायेगे, यद्यपि इसमें एक सप्ताह का समय लग सकता है।

3. ट्रक मालिकों को उनकी मांग के अनुसार दुलाई शुल्क के भुगतान को तैयार हो जाएंगे ताकि खाद्यान्न की उपलब्धता सुनिश्चित हो सके। लेकिन किसी वैकल्पिक रास्ते और कम खर्चिले साधनों की तलाश जारी रखेंगे। यद्यपि, बाद में ट्रक-मालिकों के विरुद्ध कानूनी कार्रवाई करेंगे।

4. राज्य सरकार को कुछ सहायता प्रदान करने को कहेंगे।

(b) उचित कारण बताते हुए (उपर्युक्त विकल्पों तक सीमित रहे बिना) उन उपायों के बारे में चर्चा करें जिन्हें आप अमल में लाना चाहेंगे। (250 शब्द)

Famine has been one of the gravest problems that our country is under the constant threat of facing. Even the nobel prize winner Dr. Amartya Sen has written extensively on the negative impacts of famine on the economy, public health & societal relations in any community.

Let us analyse the aforementioned course of action in the face of an acute famine:

- 1.) The merits of the first choice include:
 - (i) Under the threat of sanction some of the truck drivers may agree to break the cartel
 - (ii) If a majority of the truck drivers relent then this would solve our problem and we can easily corner the few who still don't agree.

Demerits

- (i) Evidence shows that under such cases of market failure it is very difficult to break the cartels.
- (ii) If the truck drivers are well organised this might backfire and they would react negatively.

Option 2Merit

- (i) This would help us ^{bypass} the ~~tax~~ truck drivers.
- (ii) It would help us save money from the public exchequer

demerits

- (i) ~~The~~ precious time will be lost and this might lead to loss of lives.

Option 3

- (i) Many ^{merits} ~~times~~ will be saved since there will be no loss of time.

demerit

- (i) huge loss to the public funds.
- (ii) This would mean that we are bending in the face of injustice and set a bad precedent.
- (iii) ~~Fit~~ Taking legal action after we have agreed to pay them 3 times the amount would itself not stand judicial scrutiny. If we do not pay thrice the amount the drivers won't relent.

Option 4merit

- (i) The state government might be better equipped financially as well as physically to help us out.

demerit

(i) This option again will consume an
time

(ii) This would show that we are incapable
of handling a case of this complexity.

In the ideal case we must utilise a
combination of these approaches. We must
take the following steps:

(i) Recommend the application of essential
services maintenance act immediately to
the state govt. and ask for their help.

(ii) Crack down on hoarders as efficiently
as possible.

(iii) Start a campaign for pooling of
foodgrains from individual households
so that deaths due to starvation can be
avoided.

(iv) Start the delivery of foodgrains by
railways.

(v) Convince the truck drivers on the merits
of breaking the cartel or face legal action
in the future.

(vi) We can also break a few drivers
away from the cartel by paying slightly
higher prices to them so that in the face
of individual benefits they are lined to
break the cartel & prevent market failure.

(vii) Appeal to religious leaders to convince
the truck drivers over the merits of
action.

11. 'Honour killing' has been in news in recent times. It involves the homicide of a member of a family by other members, due to the perpetrators' belief that the victim has brought shame or dishonour upon the family. Analyse this problem in detail and indicate not only the social but also the emotional and attitudinal factors responsible for this problem? Also, distinctly bring out why:

- (a) The youth in such areas do not speak up against these practices. ✓
- (b) The conviction rate in 'honour killing' cases is extremely low. ✓
- (c) Women, who have to face the brunt of this crime the most, do not speak against it collectively. ✓

Discuss some feasible steps, which could be effective in controlling this serious problem. (250 words) 20

'ऑनर किलिंग' हाल में सुर्खियों में रही है। इसमें परिवार के एक सदस्य की किसी अन्य सदस्य द्वारा की गयी हत्या को सम्मिलित किया जाता है। यहाँ अपराधकर्ता ऐसा विश्वास करता है कि पीड़ित व्यक्ति के कारण परिवार का तिरस्कार एवं अनादर हुआ है। इस समस्या का विस्तार से विश्लेषण करें और इसके लिए उत्तरदायी न सिर्फ सामाजिक बल्कि भावनात्मक और सोच संबंधी कारकों को भी इंगित करें। इसके अतिरिक्त, इस बात पर भी स्पष्ट रूप से प्रकाश डालें कि क्यों:

- (a) ऐसे क्षेत्रों में युवा इन प्रथाओं के विरुद्ध मुंह नहीं खोलते।
 - (b) 'ऑनर किलिंग' के मुकदमों में अपराध सिद्धि की दर अत्यंत निम्न है।
 - (c) महिलाएं, जिन्हें इस अपराध का सर्वाधिक आघात झेलना पड़ता है, सामूहिक रूप से इसके विरुद्ध आवाज नहीं उठाती।
- कुछ ऐसे व्यवहार्य कदमों के बारे में चर्चा करें जो इस गम्भीर समस्या को नियंत्रित करने में प्रभावी हो सकती हैं। (250 शब्द)

The two most prominent reasons among others for honour killing are:

- (i) Patriarchal mindset and an excessive attachment to ~~age~~ orthodoxy.
- (ii) Lack of high quality education and gender sensitisation.

It has also been observed that the phenomenon has no correlation with economic status. i.e. it is prevalent in both economically prosperous areas like Punjab & Haryana as well as in relatively weaker states like Bihar.

If we look at a comparative analysis of all the sociological factors that are prevalent in areas where honour killing is practised we find a few commonalities. Some of them are:

- (i) Rigid caste rules.
 - (ii) Belief in age old non scientific customs like people belonging to the same gotra are siblings etc.
 - (iii) undue attachment to orthodox values like family honour.
 - (iv) peer pressure, the structure along which the society is organised, fear of ostracisation.
 - (v) Lack of women's empowerment.
- If we look at why specific groups fall under such circumstances we find unique reasons. Some of them are:

a) The youth

The youth in most cases lack sufficient autonomy to break free from a very hierarchical society. They find it easier to conform and in due course become a part of the orthodoxy.

Gender sensitisation, financial independence and quality higher education is the need of the hour.

(b) The administration/police :

The conviction rates in cases of honour killing is low because:

(i) It is difficult to procure witnesses and evidence (peer pressure and fear of ostracisation).

(ii) The police/executive machinery belongs to the same society and have similar values. It has been often observed that the state machinery sympathises with regressive khaps/panchayats/vigilante groups.

(c) Women facing the brunt do not protest collectively because they lack both financial autonomy and skills on which they can rely. In the absence of a social security net the joint family is their only support. Since they cannot sustain themselves on their own they have to toe the line of village elders.

In my view the only solution to this problem lies in the 3 arrows of women's empowerment, quality education and gender sensitisation.

12. You are posted as a District Magistrate in a communal violence prone area, where incidents of communal clashes are often visible. Recently, trailer of a movie was released by a Film Director whose is known to make movies on religious issues. After the release of the trailer, there was anger among a minority community, who claim that their religious sentiments had been hurt in the movie and thus demanded a ban on the movie. However, the government did not pay heed to any such demands and the movie is slated to be released the next week across the entire country.

You had also watched the trailer and felt that it was derogatory to that minority community. Also, being in-charge of the communally sensitive district, you are concerned about the law and order scenario on the day the movie releases. Some of the options to deal with the issue are mentioned below. Evaluate these options and suggest the best course of action, giving your reasons for it.

- (a) Do not allow the release of movie in your district as you feel that it hurts the religious sentiments.
(b) Make sure that the movie is released in your district on the given day by taking steps, like arranging for more police and paramilitary forces to deal with anticipated public order scenario etc.
(c) Allowing release of the movie, but imposing curfew in the region so that people are devoid of watching the movie. (250 words) 20

आप एक साम्प्रदायिक हिंसा ग्रस्त क्षेत्र में जिलाधिकारी के रूप में नियुक्त हैं, जहां साम्प्रदायिक झगड़ों की घटनाएं प्रायः देखने को मिल जाती हैं। हाल ही में धार्मिक मुद्दों पर फिल्में बनाने के लिए विख्यात एक फिल्म निर्देशक के द्वारा एक फिल्म का ट्रेलर जारी किया गया। ट्रेलर जारी होने के बाद एक अल्पसंख्यक समुदाय में रोष व्याप्त था। उस समुदाय का दावा था कि फिल्म में उनकी धार्मिक भावनाओं को आहत किया गया था और इसलिए फिल्म पर प्रतिबन्ध की मांग की। यद्यपि, सरकार ने ऐसी किसी भी मांग पर ध्यान नहीं दिया और फिल्म अगले सप्ताह पूरे देश में रिलीज़ होने वाली है।

आपने भी ट्रेलर देखा था और अनुभव किया था कि यह उस अल्पसंख्यक समुदाय के लिए अपमानजनक था। इसके अतिरिक्त, साम्प्रदायिक रूप से एक संवेदनशील जिले के प्रभारी होने के कारण आप फिल्म के रिलीज़ होने के दिन कानून-व्यवस्था की स्थिति को लेकर चिंतित हैं। इस मामले से निबटने के कुछ विकल्प नीचे दिए गए हैं। इन विकल्पों का मूल्यांकन करें और कारण बताते हुए सर्वाधिक सही कार्रवाई के बारे में अपने सुझाव प्रस्तुत करें।

- (a) चूंकि आप ऐसा अनुभव करते हैं कि फिल्म धार्मिक भावनाओं को आहत करती है इसलिए उसे अपने जिले में रिलीज़ होने की अनुमति न दें।
(b) लोक व्यवस्था इत्यादि की प्रत्याशित स्थितियों को ध्यान में रख अतिरिक्त पुलिस और अर्द्ध-सैनिक बलों की व्यवस्था के साथ फिल्म का उसी दिन आपके जिले में रिलीज़ होना सुनिश्चित करना।
(c) फिल्म के रिलीज़ की अनुमति देना किन्तु उक्त क्षेत्र में कर्फ्यू लगा देना ताकि लोग फिल्म देखने से बंचित रहें। (250 words)

Section 295A of the Indian Penal Code bars any individual/group to incite violence on communal lines through the activity of speech, action etc. Under all circumstances we have to uphold the law of the land. In this light let us analyse the above mentioned course of action:

(a) Merits

(i) This will assuage the feelings of a large section of the minority community and who feel aggrieved. From a purely consequentialist point of view this should be adopted since the utility gained by the community will be larger than the utility lost by only a few filmmakers.

Demerit

However this would serve as a negation of article 19(1) of our constitution that ensures the freedom of speech and restrictions if any have to pass the test of law. Since we have no authority to take the law in our own hands and the duly elected govt. has not banned the film it would not be proper to take the law in our own hands. Even from the deontological point of view we have to perform our duty and i.e. to protect

the rights of the filmmakers.

b) Merit

The right of the filmmaker will be protected.

Demerit

A large section of the population will be hurt sentimentally.

The public enchequer will have to bear the cost of protecting film screenings. Some violence may ensue which from a utilitarian standpoint will be counter-productive.

c) Merit

There will be no violence.

The rights of the filmmaker is protected.

Demerit

This option is disingenuous since we are artificially suppressing the protest against the film. We must understand that though end will be achieved the means will not be appropriate. By clamping a curfew we will be disturbing the rights of many citizens who have nothing to do with the ~~current~~ particular affair.

The course of action that we must undertake may be as follows:

- (i) Allow the release of the film since the state govt. has not banned its exhibition.
- (ii) Make available space to the hunt community for peaceful protests.
- (iii) Clamp down ~~on~~ any violence that takes place.
- (iv) Appeal to the minority community to show faith in the judiciary and obtain a legal remedy as soon as possible.

13. Arvind has recently started working as a cyber security analyst at a government intelligence organisation. During the course of his work, he stumbles upon documents, which reveal that the government is spying on leaders of opposition parties with alleged Maoist links. He discusses this matter with his superior officer who tells him that though the spying was illegal, it was essential for national security. He also tells Arvind that sanction for the spying came from the highest echelons of the government. He further warns Arvind not to divulge facts of the case to anyone else in the organisation and especially no one on the outside as it may lead to his dismissal from the organisation or even his arrest for treason.

However, Arvind being an honest person finds himself in a deep conflict. He feels that the spying, apart from being illegal, could also be misused by the government for settling political scores with its opponents.

The following are some options that Arvind has. Evaluate the merits and demerits of each of these:

1. Do nothing as he does not want to risk losing his job or end up in jail for treason.
2. Talk to the head of the organisation to get his opinion on the matter and then do as he says.
3. Send an anonymous letter to the press leaking the details of the case.
4. Go to the press directly with the details of the case.

Also indicate (without necessarily restricting to the above options) what you would like to advise, giving proper reasons. (250 words) 20

अरविन्द ने हाल ही में एक सरकारी खुफिया संगठन में एक साइबर सुरक्षा विश्लेषक के रूप में कार्य करना आरम्भ किया है। अपनी कार्यावधि के दौरान उसका सामना कुछ ऐसे दस्तावेजों से होता है जिनसे पता चलता है कि सरकार माओवादिओं से कथित रूप से जुड़ाव रखने वाले विपक्षी दलों के नेताओं की जासूसी कर रही है। वह इस मुद्दे पर अपने वरीय पदाधिकारी से चर्चा करता है जो उसे बताते हैं कि यद्यपि जासूसी अवैध थी किन्तु यह राष्ट्रीय सुरक्षा के लिए आवश्यक थी। वह अरविन्द को यह भी बताते हैं कि जासूसी की अनुमति सरकार के उच्चतम सोपान से मिली है। इसके अतिरिक्त वह अरविन्द को चेतावनी देते हैं कि वह इस मामले से सम्बंधित तथ्यों को संगठन के किसी अन्य व्यक्ति या किसी बाह्य व्यक्ति के समक्ष उजागर न करे। यह उसके संगठन से पदच्युत किये जाने या देशद्रोह के आरोप में उसकी गिरफ्तारी का कारण भी बन सकता है।

हालांकि, अरविन्द जो एक ईमानदार व्यक्ति है, एक आप को गंभीर विरोधाभास में पाता है। वह अनुभव करता है कि जासूसी के अवैध होने के साथ साथ सरकार इसका दुरुपयोग अपने विरोधियों के साथ राजनीतिक हिसाब बराबर करने में भी कर सकती है।

अरविन्द के पास कुछ निम्नलिखित विकल्प हैं। इनमें से प्रत्येक के गुण और दोष का मूल्यांकन करें:

1. कुछ नहीं करना क्योंकि वह न तो अपनी नौकरी खोने का खतरा उठाना चाहता है और न ही देशद्रोह के लिए जेल जाना चाहता है।
2. संगठन प्रमुख से कथित मुद्दे पर उसकी राय लेने के लिए चर्चा के तत्पश्चात उसके आदेशानुसार कार्य करना।
3. प्रेस के पास मामले के व्यौरे का खुलासा करता हुआ एक अज्ञात पत्र भेजना।
4. मामले के विस्तृत व्यौरे के साथ सीधे प्रेस के पास जाना।

उचित कारण बताते हुए (उपर्युक्त विकल्पों तक सीमित रहे बिना) इस बात का संकेत दें कि
आपका सुझाव क्या होगा? (250 शब्द)

The above mentioned case presents before ourselves some classic dilemmas on ~~of~~ which is the end or means debate. ~~There is no~~ ^{There is} ~~debate~~ about the fact that the means employed to achieve the ends were not appropriate but the larger question before us is whether

- (i) The value of the ends far outweighs the costs in bypassing ethical means.
- (ii) Could the same ends ~~have been~~ ^{be achieved} through following ethical means?

Under the light of the above mentioned questions let us analyse the options available.

- 1.) This would amount to abdication of duty. This would also imply that we are willing to be passive spectators to injustice for the sake of personal ends. This would also make us a part of the injustice.
- 2.) We must certainly talk to the head of the organisation to gain a fuller understanding of the case. We must understand the circumstances under which the particular course of action was undertaken.

However we must not simply act as he thinks fit. We must exercise personal judgement before acting.

3.) Whistle blowing is an act that requires personal sacrifice and responsibility hence before undertaking this activity we must convince ourselves that the ends to be achieved were not in national interest and that they were partisan.

4.) Going to the press even before we have checked upon the case might not be advisable since we might be harming the cause of national security and unduly sensationalise a covert operation.

In my view the following course of action must be undertaken:

1.) We must gain a full understanding of the case.

2.) We must talk to our superiors to understand the threats to national security

3.) If after a thorough analysis we find that there indeed was a grave threat to national security no further action is required.

However if we do find that privacy of an individual was breached on trivial grounds we must exercise the third option and blow the whistle.

14. You are a Head of Department in a premier University. Recently a clerical staff in your department was terminated from the job as he was found under the influence of alcohol during office hours. In the previous month there were a lot of complaints regarding his poor quality of work, tardiness and some incoherent behavior. Later you came to know that this change in behavior was concurrent with the death of his wife after a prolonged illness. It has also made him debt ridden. This may be further compounded by the fact that he has a daughter to marry off soon and a differently abled son to take care of.

He desperately needs a job. He has applied for a position at a private University and has already given your name as a reference. He pleads you to give him a good recommendation and not mention his drinking, which he assures you is now under control. He also asks you to mention that he voluntarily left the University to address a family medical crisis and that the University was pleased with his work. You like this person and believe that he is a good worker when he is not drinking. But you doubt whether he has really overcome his drinking problem.

Valid arguments can be advanced, both, for rejecting his plea with the consequence that his condition may become even worse and for accepting his plea with a noble intention, but keeping the third party in dark. What could those arguments be? Could there be any better way to get out of this dilemma? If so, outline the main elements of this third way, pointing out its merits. (250 words)

20

आप एक प्रमुख विश्वविद्यालय में विभागाध्यक्ष हैं। हाल में आपके विभाग का एक लिपिक वर्गीय कर्मचारी अपनी नौकरी से बर्खास्त कर दिया गया क्योंकि वह कार्यावधि के दौरान शराब के नशे में था। इसके पिछले माह में उसके कार्य की निम्न गुणवत्ता, आलस्य और असंगत व्यवहार की कई शिकायतें मिली थी। बाद में आपको पता चला कि उसके व्यवहार में यह परिवर्तन लम्बी बीमारी के पश्चात उसकी पत्नी की मृत्यु की वजह से था। इस कारण वह ऋण के बोझ तले भी दब गया है। स्थिति इस तथ्य से और जटिल हो सकती है कि उसे शीघ्र ही एक बेटी का विवाह करना है तथा एक निःशक्त पुत्र की देख-भाल भी करनी है।

उसे एक नौकरी की बहुत अधिक आवश्यकता है। उसने एक निजी विश्वविद्यालय में एक पद के लिए आवेदन दिया है और अनुमोदक के रूप में आपके नाम का जिक्र भी वहाँ कर चुका है। वह आपसे विनती करता है कि आप उसकी अच्छी अनुशंसा कर दें और शराब पीने की उसकी आदत की चर्चा न करें, जिसके बारे में वह आपको बताता है कि अब नियंत्रण में है। वह आपसे यह बताने के लिए भी कहता है कि उसने परिवारिक चिकित्सा संकट से निबटने के लिए स्वेच्छा से विश्वविद्यालय को छोड़ा था और विश्वविद्यालय उसके काम से खुश था। आप इस व्यक्ति को पसंद करते हैं और जानते हैं कि जब वह शराब नहीं पीता है तो वह एक अच्छा कर्मचारी होता है। किन्तु आपको इस बात पर संदेह है कि उसने वास्तव में अपनी शराब पीने की समस्या पर काबू पा लिया है।

उसके आग्रह को ठुकराने, जिसका परिणाम उसकी स्थिति के और बिगड़ जाने के रूप में होगा तथा अच्छे आशय से उसके आग्रह को स्वीकार करने, अर्थात् इन दोनों ही स्थितियों के पक्ष में मान्य तर्क प्रस्तुत किये जा सकते हैं किन्तु इससे तीसरे पक्ष को अन्धकार में रखना पड़ेगा। इन दोनों ही स्थितियों के पक्ष में क्या तर्क हो सकते हैं? क्या इस दुविधा से निकलने का कोई और

बेहतर तरीका हो सकता है? यदि हाँ, तो इस तीसरे तरीके के मुख्य तत्वों को इसकी खूबियों के साथ रेखांकित करें। (250 शब्द)

This case presents before us the issues of disclosure, efficiency v mercy & ~~trust~~ and trust.

The arguments that can be advanced in favour of giving the recommendation letter to the worker are of utilitarian in nature. If we follow the maxim of the greatest good of the greatest number we find that the worker, his daughter as well as his son will be in a better position. However this presents before us a few questions. They are:

- 1.) He will commit the act of lying knowingly if we hide his previous record from his prospective employer.
- 2.) Is a drunkard in a position to do good to his family? Will he not use his the money earned from his new job to consume alcohol?

However we must also remember that we are duty bound to help someone in need. Gandhiji always reminded us of the virtues of empathy and forgiveness.

In my view the correct course of action will have the following steps:

(i) enquire about the past record of the worker. If we find that before his wife's death he did not create such nuisance we must do the following.

1.) Have a meeting with ~~the~~ the worker on whether he will be willing to undergo a rehabilitation program and work efficiently with his new employer.

2.) Have a meeting with his prospective employer outlining before him his past record. We must take the ~~of~~ the prospective employer into confidence and ensure that the worker signs an undertaking that he will be liable to be disqualified if he shows even a hint of callousness.

Apart from the above mentioned steps we must undertake an active search to find out whether the skills of the worker's son match any employment opportunities under the differently abled quota. If yes we must do our best to get him ~~as~~ into employment. If not we must make him aware of the skilling/scholarship programs that the government runs for the differently abled.