



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 760)

Name of Candidate	Nikhil Mahajan		
Medium Hindi/Eng.	English	Registration Number	9235
Center		Date	

INDEX TABLE			INSTRUCTIONS
Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained	<ol style="list-style-type: none">Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code). उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।There are FOURTEEN questions printed in HINDI and ENGLISH. इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं तथा हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों में छपे हैं।All questions are compulsory. सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it. प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one. प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to. प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off. उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।
1(a)	10		
1(b)	10		
2(a)	10		
2(b)	10		
3(a)	10		
3(b)	10		
4(a)	10		
4(b)	10		
5(a)	10		
5(b)	10		
6	10		
7	10		
8	10		
9	20		
10	20		
11	20		
12	20		
13	20		
14	20		
Total Marks Obtained:			
Remarks:			

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

Answer the following questions is not more than 150 words each.

1. (a) Celebrities are paid huge amounts by companies for endorsing products that at times turn out to be harmful for the consumers. Examine the ethical dimensions involved in such instances. 10

There ^{was a} recent controversy over celebrities endorsing Maggi ~~beer~~ in which traces of lead were found.

Ethical issues in such endorsement:

- persuasive power of celebrities. brand ambassadors.
- lack of expertise in celebrities, ~~where~~ as they override the expert opinion.
eg- efficacy of toothpaste
- impressionable young mind of children
- hero worship, lack of education & awareness in masses
- information asymmetry.

Hence, it is important for celebrities to be responsible for what they endorse. In the age of social media^{24x7 news}, this may lead to backlash and damage their ~~his/her~~^{own} reputation & credibility.

Talent Management Agencies should also be careful when they manage their celebrity clients.

PS stand Comt d 2

- In this context, Finance Ministry has recommended 10 lakh fine for misleading ads. ✓ taste good
x not claim healthy
- not as expert, common sense, eg- soft drinks.
- ASCI (Advertising Council of India) should clamp down on such ads.

- But, the liability of celebrity should not extend to manufacturing defect or customer service.

1. (b) Lack of cleanliness in urban areas despite schemes such as the Swachh Bharat Abhiyan point to difficulties faced in bringing about attitudinal and behavioural changes. Discuss. 10

Despite government's flagship Swachh Bharat Abhiyan, most cities still appear no cleaner. Certainly there is a shortage of resources and infrastructure. But, there are attitudinal and behavioural dimension also —

(i) Tragedy of the Commons: Public spaces suffer from this. Why should one person make individual effort when everybody else will benefit from it.

(ii) Habits - of Littering, ^{spitting} cannot be changed overnight.
Freezing of attitude.

(iii) Addiction to Gutka, tobacco.

(iv) Broken Window theory -

If there is one broken window, people will not hesitate to throw stone in other windows.

Similar, if a place has some litter it will soon turn into a public dustbin.

(v) Thrift - people are hesitant to pay small monthly amount to garbage collector and they would rather dump it elsewhere.

(vi) Education & awareness - about virtues of cleanliness, separating waste at source into wet and dry garbage

Hence, SBA should focus beyond infrastructure and invest in changing mindset also.

2. (a) Issues around economic inclusion are not just about income gaps, there are many dimensions of moral and ethical choices as well. Discuss. 10

India is one of the most economically unequal countries in the world. It has the world largest number of poor and world's 3rd largest number of \$ millionaires.

Economic inclusion is necessary because:

- to fully utilize our demographic dividend
- to reduce social tension and conflict
- for a harmonious & peaceful society.
- to create a larger market, as only people with disposable income will be able to spend more.

But there are many ethical dimensions also - *Social Exclusion*

- Neoliberals are against progressive taxation as it punishes the productive people more.

- The poor are not the fault of the rich.
- Larger role of state for welfare increases leakages, bureaucratic power & corruption.
- People differ in their skill and effort, and rewards should be given by market accordingly.
- moral choices of compassion, empathy for weaker section are subjective - and have no legal basis.

2. (b) Socially and economically marginalized women are used to make a profit, often at the cost of their own health and reproductive autonomy, in the name of commercial surrogacy. Discuss the ethical issues associated with commercial surrogacy in India. Should commercial surrogacy be completely banned?

10

The Government recently banned commercial surrogacy except for altruistic purposes for heterosexual Indian couples.

Ethical issues involved :

For Surrogacy

- ① - right to freedom of profession for the mother.
- ② - right to privacy.
- ③ - livelihood, dignity and rising above poverty.
- ④ - voluntary transaction between the women and clients.
- ⑤ Infertile couples also deserve to be parents.

Against

- ① - Commodification of womb
- ② Babies are abandoned. *Disability/Unplanned Twins.*
eg - baby Manji, after her Japanese parents divorced.
- ③ Exploiting a poor women's helplessness
- ④ The mother benefits little, as the clinic takes most profit
- ⑤ She may be forced by her relatives. *Free Contract.*
- ⑥ Rt. of child - know mother, citizenship - motherly bond.
- ⑦ Rt. of fetus - abortion.

Way forward - A complete ban is

unfeasible as it may - drive the industry underground & increase risks for mother's health.

- The industry might move abroad resulting in forex loss.

- Discriminatory against single or homosexual parents.
Also, adoption of orphan children needs to be promoted.

3. (a) While discussing the ethical issues that journalists face on a regular basis, examine the causes of increased sensationalism in news media in recent times.

10

Journalism and news media is seen as the fourth pillar of democracy.

- Ethical issues journalists face :

- ① Profiting by publishing paid news and advertisements.
- ② Ideological journalists might be hesitant to report something which will benefit a politician from opposite camp in the elections.
- ③ Grabbing eyeballs by publishing sensational news.
- ④ Conflict of interest if they are connected to a party or business organization. or if parent org of news.
- ⑤ Personal Safety if they publish something against any powerful ^{muscleman}.

- ⑥ Threat of defamation suit under IPC 499 & 500.

Reporters Sans Frontiers ranks India 130, behind Afghanistan for journalistic freedoms.

Causes of increased sensationalism -

- ① Pressure to publish 24x7, crime vs. health/sci compet, breaking news.

- ② competition News anchor, shrill voice > cool glamorous.

- ③ Increase viewership TRP, ad revenue, prices.

- ④ Decline in the quality of journalists.

It is not seen as a good career and not any longer attracting the brightest minds.

change in ownership.

INM = idealist, reformers

now - corporate houses, politicians

- ⑤ Profits ↓, how to change people for news

⑥

3. (b) What are the various sources through which humans can judge the correctness of their actions? In the context of public life discuss how these sources are important in offering a clear and practical guidance. 10

The various sources are -

- ① Voice of conscience - which will prick you & make you feel guilty if you do any wrong.
- ② Social norms and cultural milieu
- ③ Work culture of the organization
- ④ Consequentialism - the end result/outcome of the action
- ⑤ Values, principles, duty
- ⑥ Legal instruction, Code of Conduct.
- ⑦ Empathy for the weakest - Gandhi's harmless

In the context of public life, these various sources can provide guidance -

VISION IAS

(इस भाग में
कठिन का विषय)

- ① Voice of conscience can ~~avoid~~ step us from misusing our position
- ② Social norms can help us care for the needy and elderly. But, it can also inculcate prejudice.
- ③ A strong work culture ensures public officials remain ^{self} motivated & to maintain a positive work environment.
- ④ The outcome of our work can help in ^{judging the} performance of a worker.
- ⑤ ~~These~~ Officials should give highest value to public interest and be committed
- ⑥ Should ~~to~~ never break the rules
- ⑦ Concept of Gandhian Sarvodaya is important in an unequal and developing society like ours.

1hr

4. (a) Should a person resort to leaking of information in case of wrongs done in the organization? Does it cause a conflict of interest between the personal, organizational and societal spheres? Discuss with examples. 10

Leaking of information from an organization to expose wrongdoing is called whistle blowing.

It is ethical, but with caveats:

- ① - it should be used as a tool of last resort.
- ② It should be in public interest
- ③ It should not harm larger goals like national security.

Yes, there can be several dimensions/areas of Conflict of interest in Whistleblowing

① Personal	② Org	③ Societal
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Personal safety • Loyalty to the org if he is an employee. • Crisis of conscience 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reputation • Org goal vs. misuse of power eg- spying on public to find out terrorists. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public interest • Putting pressure for action • Short attention span.

VISION

Eg - in the case of Edward Snowden - The former USA intelligence contractor who exposed indiscriminate snooping on public by NSA's PRISM programme in 2013.

- He may have saved the rt. to privacy of ~~his~~ others.
- He may have compromised ~~the~~ his country's security by rendering this PRISM ineffective
- He may have compromised the security of fellow employees by leaking data.
- He has taken asylum in Hongkong & Russia - two undemocratic countries.

4. (b) Competition, it is argued, spurs the best of performance, however, can it also instigate cheating and unethical behaviour? Discuss with adequate examples.

10

Competition is the best motivator for excellence. Even for a democracy competition of parties and policies, for a society competition of ideas is necessary.

But, in a bid to get ahead, competition may encourage cheating -

① Individual level :

- doping in sports
- plagiarism in academia.
- cheating in tests/exams.
- wealth \Rightarrow status, means may be unethical.

② Social level :

- seeking quotas for community in public education/employment.

③ Political Level:-

- bribing votes.
- votes for cash in parliament, horse trading.

④ Economic Level:-

- evading emission norms for environmental pollution by Volkswagen cars which will deliver better performance than competitors.
- child labour, envt pollute

Hence, competition will only work if there is fair play.

Here the role of regulator and judiciary becomes important.

5. (a) "A person may cause evil to others not only by his actions but by his inaction, and in either case he is justly accountable to them for the injury". Explain the statement giving one example each from personal and public life.

10

Action of commission
or omission may both lead to
harm to others. In either case, for
a deliberate act, with awareness
of its consequences - the person
should be held accountable.

Personal Life

- Parents can harm the children by teaching him to be intolerant of other religions.
- Parents can also harm the children by not sending him/her to school.

Public Life

- A doctor can harm the patient by wrong diagnosis's.

29 Spectrum - Coal Secy just followed instr of minist

• The doctor can refuse to attend an accident victim by saying that he is on a lunch break. This may prove lethal ~~and~~ as the victim will lose precious ~~hours~~ time.

bystander's
apathy.

Hence, integrity and probity are necessary for every individual.

5. (b) "A ^{person} people that values its privileges above its principles soon loses both."
What does this quotation mean to you? Explain with an example. 10

Privileges are the fruits of hard work done and duties performed. If privileges become the sole motivation of conduct, it will soon lead to compromise in principles. Ultimately, it will lead to the downfall of that person and his ~~as~~ reputation will be damaged.

In the realm of public service, if one gives priority to privileges, the importance of principles will go down.

Example - a civil servant will act in a partisan way to get desired ~~at~~ postings, avoid transfers and post-retirement sinecures. ~~But~~ For this he has to commit dereliction of duty. If his

Gandhi

Balan
rts &

Principle
Priv = sp

VISION IAS

compromises are found out by the media or internal enquiry, he may lose his job and reputation. Hence in the end he will end up with nothing - neither the privileges & nor principles which were already compromised before.

6. Instances of atrocities against dalits despite stringent legal measures point to the fact that the problem is not one of legality only but a matter of entrenched social prejudices and attitude. In this context suggest some effective measures to address the issue holistically. 10

According to the 2015 National Crime Records Bureau figures, atrocities on dalits have increased by more than 20%.

This is despite the legal provisions —

① Right to equality - article 14

② Abolition of untouchability — article 17

③ Prevention of atrocities (SC/ST) against

Act 1989.

Hence, the problem is of entrenched prejudices

Measures need to be taken:

① Empowering the weaker section through reservation in employment.

- ② Involving civil society, religious leaders in spreading harmony.
sacred texts.
- ③ Education and skilling for dalits to instill self confidence.
- ④ Sensitize local administration, police and legal system.
- ⑤ Countering unconscious bias in formal sector, administration.
- ⑥ End to inhuman practices like manual scavenging.
- ⑦ Strict law enforcement.
- ⑧ Strengthen schools & healthcare so that inequality is removed from the roots.

InterGroup Contact, Fests, ~~WREGA~~

7. What do you mean by 'anonymity in the civil services'? Explain why anonymity and neutrality are considered as important traits for civil servants.

10

↓
permanent
career.

Anonymity in civil services means civil servants not seeking publicity and shunning limelight. Civil servants are unelected and permanent. But, in a democracy the power should lie with the masses, exercised through regular elections of representatives. Hence, civil servants should eschew making public statements about policies and advise the government of the day confidentially.

Neutrality means non-partisanship, or not-ideological, serving the official position and not the party/person. It means loyalty to the larger public interest & to the constitution.

Importance of neutrality and anonymity :

- ① For the public - it builds their trust in administration.
- ② For the ministers - they can be assured for the support of administration in policy making and execution.
- ③ For the civil servants - it ensures positive work environment, tenure security and decreases political interference.

8. Prescription of dresscode for women not only violates their liberty but also reflects outdated views on gender relations as well as proper conduct.
Comment.

10

Recent headlines :

- ① Khap panchayat bans jeans
- ② Fatwa against Sana Mirza wearing skirt.
- ③ College authorities bans t-shirts for jeans.
- ④ Militants in Kashmir valley calling for full face veil for women.

Prescription of dresscode is against right to freedom (article 14) & right to equality (article 15).
Threatening women if they do not follow the dictate is against right to life & personal liberty (article 21).

Such incidents also indicate an outdated notion of gender where women's worth is equated with her honour. Her professional qualifications, convenience, freedoms,

choices - are sacrificed. It also prohibits her participation in public sphere and ~~accounts for~~ leads to low % labour force participation of women in India (28% vs. 56% for Bangladesh).

Elders or men should not define what is the proper conduct of women. It is important to break the stereotypes and judge every individual by his deeds.

3hr
20min

In the following questions, carefully study the cases presented and then answer the questions that follow (in around 250 words):

9. You are DM of of a very poor district in the hinterland of India. It has come to your notice that manual scavenging is widely prevalent in the district even though the new law prohibits manual scavenging in any form. Upon enquiry, you have found that the number of manual scavengers has been under-reported to be very low, however, hundreds of dry latrines in the district depict a different picture. You have also noticed two more important trends: first, most of the manual scavengers are Dalits, and second, in many of the cases they themselves go to the houses and request the owners to clean their toilets manually, as it would provide monetary benefits. The entire district administration has been criticized by the media and there is political pressure on you to manipulate the data in a way that it shows less number of manual scavengers in the district. Based on the given information answer the following:

1. Identify the ethical issues associated with manual scavenging.
2. List the options available to you in the given case. Evaluate the merits and demerits of each.
3. Discuss some feasible steps that you can take to control this serious problem.

After 7 decades of indep, equalitarian
embarrassment

As the DM and
even as a responsible citizen
it is my responsibility to end
the scourge of manual scavenging.

① Ethical issues involved:

- dignity, under rt. to life of
Indian constitution
vs. livelihood. (article 21)

Health Hazards:
- nature of job:

- caste discrimination
- poverty and lack of skills and opportunities which pushes them into this profession.

- social stigma

- freedom of profession

✓ rule of law as Manual scavenging is banned under Prohibition of Manual Scavenging Act 2013.

②

OPTIONS AVAILABLE

(i) Manipulate the data :

Merits

- ⊕ Good for my professional advancement as there is political pressure
- ⊕ Decrease media pressure
- ⊕ The manual scavengers will continue to earn monetary benefits.

Demerits

professional loyalty.

- ⊖ Dereliction of duty, org. ethics
Unethical to fudge data. I will
have a crisis of conscience.
- ⊖ I might face enquiry in future
if the correct facts are found
out.
- ⊖ The evil of manual scavenging
will continue.

Lack of courage
dedication

(iii) Goto media.

(ii) Rehabilitation of Manual
Resist pol pressure & Scavengers

Merits

- ⊕ A life of dignity for
manual scavengers
- ⊕ Implementation of law is the
DM's responsibility.
- ⊕ Long term health benefits,
utilization of human resource.

VISION IAS

Demerits

- Delay
- Lack of ^{adequate} job opportunities in a poor district
- political pressure ^{hampers} relation with pol leaders.
- media's criticisms

③ Manipulating data is unfeasible due to the reasons mentioned above.

Hence, proper planning & work — is needed in two broad areas :

① Administrative

- Construction of new toilets with running water & septic tanks to replace dry latrines under Saath Bharat Abhiyan.

- public, school toilets flushing, OD Free.
- Skilling, education of manual scavengers to instill self confidence in them.
- creating alternate job opportunities, eg - NREGA in rural areas.
- enforcement of ban & rehab.
work closely with police.

② Non-administrative

- Awareness campaign for cleanliness
- Involve local leaders, religious groups and civil society.
- education for children, so not hereditary

10. You are SP of a district where the use of drugs is prevalent, especially among the youth. The neighbouring districts are also suffering from the same problem. There is a huge hue and cry in the national media about the drug issue and the government and political parties are pressurising the police and district administration to act on the issue. A big deal of drugs is busted by the police in your area and all the culprits have been arrested. However, even before you reach your office, a minister from the ruling party of the state calls and asks you to release few of the culprits. You have long suspected the role of many senior leaders in this drug menace of the state. You have also been informed by your juniors that a few officers who dared to act against people involved in drug dealings were transferred or suspended on wrong charges earlier.

1. Identify the options available to you.
2. Evaluate the pros and cons of each of your options.

20

As an SP, my responsibility is to ensure law and order. Drugs are one of the biggest menace of the society, even my family & friends at risk.

Ethical dilemma in the above case

- ^{reluctant} ~~don~~ orthodox loyalty ^{spirit of service} vs. rule of law
- job security vs. ^{dedication to} public interest ^{responsibility}
- personal fulfilments ^{vs.} & self preservation ^{justice & perseverance}

① OPTIONS AVAILABLE

(i) Follow the instructions of the minister

Merits

- I don't have to face the risk of transfers
- I will be in the good books of ruling party
- By releasing few culprits, I can blame the other few arrested.

Demerits

- The arrested ^{caught only small fish} culprits will walk away freely, embolden, encourage
- The menace of drug will not be solved. youth ↓
- I might have to face future enquiry for this dereliction of duty.
- Media scrutiny.

(ii) To not follow the instructions of the ministers.

Merits

- I will perform by professional responsibility
- I will ensure justice is met.
- There is hope to end the menace of drugs from supply side.

Demerits

- Risk of transfer on suspension.
- The ruling party may victimize me in future.

In conclusion, the best option is to have coverage of conviction and to do my duty. Along with option (ii) I will - multi-Approach.

- inform my department seniors about the situation
- bring the case to media's attention. Engage civil society.
- inform the administration of neighbouring district & investigate who are also suffering from drug menace.
- ^{reject the minister's instructions,} ask for a written request from the minister.

11. You are the manager of a small hotel which maintains high standards of ethics in dealing with its customers. One day a person comes to your hotel and enquires about booking a room at your hotel. However, due to peak season, all rooms were already booked and hence the staff politely informed him about the unavailability. The person, however, was adamant and took this as a personal insult and started misbehaving with the staff present at the counter. Citing his political connection he also threatened the staff of severe consequences. Next day the person lodged a frivolous complaint with the police under the stringent SC/ST act. In his complaint he accused you and your staff of insulting him deliberately on the basis of his caste. He insisted further that he was denied a room at your hotel due to the caste he belongs to.

1. What are the options available to you?
2. Evaluate each of these options and choose the option which you would adopt, giving reasons.

20

The above case highlights the misuse of Prevention of Atrocities (SC/ST) Act 1989. There have been calls to amend this act due to such cases in recent times.

The ethical dilemma in this case is

- perseverance vs. condoning a wrongdoing

① OPTIONS AVAILABLE

(i) Accept my mistake and
apologize by offering
a compensation.

non
staff.

Merits

- Avoid future legal action against me and hotel staff.

Demerits

- The legal case may not ~~be~~ get stopped at this point.
- It will embolden the culprit and he may engage in further wrongdoing.
- It will bring a bad name to our hotel.

(ii) Let the law take its own
course by presenting
my case honestly.

Merits

- We will get justice as there was no wrongdoing from our side.
- By bringing this case to conclusion, there will be a public debate about the misuse and efficacy of this law.

Demerits

- Judicial delay, trips to court, legal expenses.
- got connection of that quest.

- ② Future Course of action ^{should} ~~will~~ be :
(ii) for the reasons mentioned.

Along with it I will -

- present the guest register as proof to police and media to show that there were no vacancies on that day.
- (if available) present CCTV footage as proof.
- testimony of old, regular customers.

12. You are the Health Secretary in a state where there is an outbreak of dengue and chikungunya diseases. There have been reports of negligent attitude of some private hospitals in the city. Also, the public hospitals do not have the required infrastructure and staff to meet such increased number of cases in a short span of time. Additionally, the staff is demoralised by the increased working hours and the public outrage. Despite the efforts of the local authorities this issue emerges year after year.
- Public Hospital
1. What are the immediate steps which should be taken in such a situation?
 2. Suggest some long term measures to ensure that such a situation is not repeated.
- 20

This issue is similar to the ^{recent} outbreak of vector-borne diseases during monsoon.

As a Health secretary it is my responsibility to ensure both preventive & curative healthcare.

① Immediate steps - with respect to -

(i) Private hospitals

- instruct them to reserve a certain proportion of wards for the current outbreak
- Remind them of the indirect subsidy (eg- land) they get

and their responsibility.

- Take stringent action ~~actio~~ against cases of negligence, deliberate turning away of patients.

(ii) Public Hospitals

- temporary increase in wages for increased work load.
- Use media to instruct public to remain calm and let the staff do its job. *Mohalla Clinics.*
- Ask help from neighbouring states for infrastructure and staff.

(iii) Public - *(Med & envt mgt)*

- ask them to ^{clean up} ~~avoid~~ stagnant water which act mosquito breeding ground.

VISION

- Spraying insecticides. *fumigation can*
- distribute mosquito nets.
- awareness about using mosquito repellents, full sleeve clothes.
- Focus on manual workers, daily wage earners since dengue bites happen during daytime

② Long term measures:

- *C.G. mobilization*
- Education and awareness program for school children.
- Focus on congested slums with bad sanitation, uncovered sewers.
- Research to eliminate mosquitoes, eg - GM mosquitoes which become infertile.
- Increase budget for healthcare infrastructure and human resource.
- Insecticide spraying before the onset of monsoon.

13. As a Forest Officer, you are receiving increasing complaints of certain animals ruining the farms and causing damage to crops. This is creating an undue financial burden for the farmers who are in deep distress because of the uncontrolled damage. Consequently, the farmers are demanding you to put forward a request for culling of animals. You are an animal lover and against culling of animals. You had made efforts to control the menace but the population of animals has increased beyond the managing capacity.
1. What are the options available to you? Evaluate each of these options and choose the option which you would adopt, giving reasons.
 2. Also suggest some long term measures to ensure that such a situation is not repeated.

20

The above case is similar to the recent debate over culling of Nilgai which were damaging crops.

The ethical dilemma here is —

- anthropocentric welfare
vs. animal welfare.
- cruelty to animals.
- livelihood of poor farmers.
ecological balance.

①

OPTIONS AVAILABLE

(i) Ignore the farmers request
for culling -
compensate for crop
loss.

Merits

- As a animal lover, I am against cruelty to animals.
- The animals have an equal freedom to live.

Demerits

- Damage to crops & financial burden on farmers.
- Farmers may start vigilante killing of animals and even risk their own lives if attacked by animals.
- Uncontrolled rise in animal population risks upsetting the food chain equilibrium in the wild.

- animals may enter residential areas, increase man-animal conflict.

(ii) Allow for culling.

Merits

- Protect the farmer's produce.
- Decrease the man-animal conflict situation.
- protect other animals who will be at risk due to rising population of one species.

Demerits

- Cruelty to animals.
- Man puts himself as the judge of nature's balance

Hence, culling is the best way forward and is in everybody's interest.

② Long term measures:

- Nature's equilibrium gets disturbed if any link in food chain is weakened. The rise in Nilgai population is due to decreasing population of tigers and lions. Hence it is important to protect every species.
- Check deforestation, conversion of forest land into agricultural land
- Building of fences around crops.
- Sound alerts, IR warning, flashlights to scare off animals.

14. Dr. A.K. Singh, a professor of medicine, is a prominent cardiologist. His personal financial investments include significant stock holdings in three publicly traded biotechnology firms. He is approached by one of these firms to be a lead investigator in a therapeutic trial of a novel agent for preventing tissue damage from myocardial infarction (MI). This will be a randomized double-blinded, placebo-controlled clinical trial (neither patient nor physician will know whether the drug under investigation or a placebo is being used in a given patient). Dr. Singh is quite familiar with the preliminary animal and cell biology work in the area and believes that there is an excellent chance that this new drug will result in a significant improvement in survival and reduce damage to the heart muscle. He even thinks this novel agent may reduce the risk of heart failure and irregular beats. Dr. Singh's group is one of the few cardiology groups fully prepared to carry out this investigation, which is why he was contacted. He cares for a large number of patients with MI and believes that he could enroll numerous patients efficiently. The drug will only be available to his patients if his group participates in the trial. The company is offering Rs. 25 lakh for each patient enrolled. As a lead investigator, he will become much better known and will likely experience an increase in referrals if the trial succeeds.
1. Is Dr. Singh's participation in this study appropriate? Justify your position.
 2. Does Dr. Singh have a conflict of interest? If so, what is the nature of the conflict? How could it be mitigated.
 3. How would the nature of the conflict of interest be different had he not already owned stock, but instead had been offered stock as a form of compensation for conducting the study?

20

①

Yes, it is ok because - - - - -
No, Dr. Singh's participation in this study is not appropriate because -
~~Factor of the case~~

(i) - Dr. Singh owns stocks of the biotech firm that he will investigate for the clinical trial.

(ii) - Dr. Singh's patients are enrolled in the trial.

(iii) - Dr. Singh will make further gains (via referrals) if the trial succeeds.

② Dr. Singh has a Conflict of Interest.

His primary professional responsibility ~~can~~ might be unduly influenced by secondary benefits that will accrue to him via - increase in stock prices of biotech firms (i) option.

- Increase in income because of (ii) option above.

- there might be risk involved for the patient in clinical trial.

The Conflict of Interest will be mitigated if Dr. Singh recuses

himself from the investigation by citing the above issue.

③

The nature of conflict of Interest would have been similar because :

the success of trial



profit for biotech firm



increase in stock prices which he is being paid.

The (iii) conflict will remain the same in this case.

Hence, it would be unethical for him to investigate the trial.

Also, if this conflict of interest

is found out by competing biotech firms or by media, it will lead to

- damage of Dr. Singh's professional reputation

- even if the drug is effective, its release will be delayed due to the controversy.

6 cases

1 hr
35 m