



# VISION IAS

www.visionias.in



## GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 873)

|                   |                    |                     |          |
|-------------------|--------------------|---------------------|----------|
| Name of Candidate | PRATISHTHA MAMGAIN |                     |          |
| Medium Eng./Hindi | ENGLISH            | Registration Number | 37256    |
| Center            | KB                 | Date                | 20.09.17 |

| INDEX TABLE           |               |                | INSTRUCTIONS  |
|-----------------------|---------------|----------------|---|
| Q. No.                | Maximum Marks | Marks Obtained | <p>1. Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).<br/>उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।</p> <p>2. There are FOURTEEN questions printed in ENGLISH &amp; HINDI इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं अंग्रेजी और हिन्दी में छपे हैं।</p> <p>3. All questions are compulsory.<br/>सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।</p> <p>4. The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.<br/>प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।</p> <p>5. Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.<br/>प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।</p> <p>6. Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.<br/>प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।</p> <p>7. Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.<br/>उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।</p> |
| 1(a)                  | 10            |                |   |
| 1(b)                  | 10            |                |   |
| 2(a)                  | 10            |                |   |
| 2(b)                  | 10            |                |   |
| 3(a)                  | 10            |                |   |
| 3(b)                  | 10            |                |   |
| 4(a)                  | 10            |                |   |
| 4(b)                  | 10            |                |   |
| 5                     | 10            |                |   |
| 6                     | 10            |                |   |
| 7                     | 10            |                |   |
| 8                     | 10            |                |   |
| 9                     | 20            |                |   |
| 10                    | 20            |                |   |
| 11                    | 20            |                |   |
| 12                    | 20            |                |   |
| 13                    | 25            |                |   |
| 14                    | 25            |                |   |
| Total Marks Obtained: |               |                |   |
| Remarks:              |               |                |   |

75, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

## EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

Answer the following questions in not more than 150 words each:

1. (a) The more remotely power is exercised from the people, the greater is the distance between authority and accountability. Discuss. 10

(a) जितना लोगों से सत्ता का प्रयोग दूर होगा, उतना ही अधिक प्राधिकारी और जवाबदेही के बीच अंतर होगा। चर्चा कीजिए।

‘With great power comes great responsibility’

The state exercises power on behalf of the people in order to secure their interests. Power is not an end in itself. It is a means to an end.

There is a trend of excessive centralisation of power i.e. most of the power is concentrated at the level of Union govt, while state & local govt's power are limited. This has several disadvantages.

- excessive bureau ~~bureaucratisation~~ centralisation. Bureaucrats are not accountable to the people.

- difficulty for people in holding those in power accountable.



Decisions that affect people are taken by higher ups with whom there is no interaction

- disempowerment of the people. They are not involved in decision making & can't easily get grievances redressed.

In India, the 73<sup>rd</sup> & 74<sup>th</sup> amendment have ushered in local self govt which has resulted in increased accountability.

Accountability is the hallmark of a good public servant. We need to imbibe the 4Ds - decentralization, debureaucratization, delegation & democratisation.

1. (b) "If you want others to be happy, practice compassion. If you want to be happy, practice compassion". In what ways can a compassionate public official be more useful for realizing public service goals? 10

(b) "यदि आप दूसरों को प्रसन्न रखना चाहते हैं, तो करुणावान बनें। यदि आप प्रसन्न रहना चाहते हैं तो करुणा अपनाएं।" किस प्रकार से एक करुणावान लोक सेवक सार्वजनिक सेवा के लक्ष्यों को साकार करने के लिए अधिक उपयोगी हो सकता है?

Primary responsibility of a public official is to serve the people.

In order to serve the people an official has to ensure social & economic justice & build their capacity in order to improve their lives.

Unless a public official is compassionate towards the needy, it will not be possible to show the level of commitment & sincerity that is needed to do complete justice to her job.

There are several examples of public officials who have demonstrated compassion eg - The IAS officer who ate the

food made by a Dalit widow  
for a mid-day meal to  
support her.

Unless there is compassion  
for the needy & less fortunate,  
marginalised & vulnerable,  
there may be derelection  
of duty.

2. (a) The recent decision by the government to ban use of red beacons is only a symbolic gesture and a lot more needs to be done to end the VIP culture in India. Critically discuss. 10

(a) लाल बत्ती के प्रयोग पर प्रतिबन्ध सम्बन्धी सरकार का हालिया निर्णय केवल एक प्रतीकात्मक संकेत है और भारत में वीआईपी संस्कृति समाप्त करने के लिए बहुत कुछ किए जाने की आवश्यकता है। आलोचनात्मक रूप से चर्चा कीजिए।

'Lal Battli' culture is a big problem in India. Special treatment for VVIPs & VIPs are considered a huge perk of public office, often forgetting that public officials are in fact public servants.

The recent decision to ban red beacon is a step in right direction

- it will help to end a feeling of entitlement
- traffic police can do their job well & not worry about consequences
- it will help reduce traffic jams due to such VIP movements which often result in death of patients who are on the way to hospital.



However, much more will have to be done.

- We need a behavioural change among public servants.
- Besides the beacon, several other comforts are given to officials that need to be taken away.  
eg - exemptions at airports checking,
- There is also another problem where officials use connections in other depts. to get personal work done faster.

A comprehensive change is needed not adhoc measures. The govt should continue to take more steps.



2. (b) To what extent can financial incentives help shape attitude towards social issues? Discuss with relevant examples. 10

(b) किस हद तक आर्थिक प्रोत्साहन सामाजिक मुद्दों के प्रति अभिवृत्ति को आकार देने में सहायता कर सकते हैं? प्रासंगिक उदाहरणों सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

One of the biggest challenges that policymakers face is providing the right incentives to obtain desired results.

Often, people are unresponsive or there may be certain undesired results.

A solution that is promoted is using financial incentives to shape people's attitudes.

Govt of India has used financial incentives.

- Janani Suraksha scheme - free delivery at govt hospitals to encourage institutional deliveries

- Sadli scheme, Sukanya Samriddhi scheme - bank accounts for girl child to curb falling child sex ratio & end gender discrimination

TSY  
Girl.  
Env.

Though such efforts have shown success, in order to ensure that such success change in attitudes is permanent & not transient, behavioural change campaigns & awareness generation are equally necessary.

Financial incentives should be accompanied by other measures as well.

3. (a) At times, moral behaviour can be constrained by the complexity of legal system. Explain. In this context, explain the purpose of legal protection for good samaritans in the case of road accidents. 10

(a) कई बार, नैतिक व्यवहार कानूनी प्रणाली की जटिलता के चलते निरुद्ध हो सकता है। व्याख्या कीजिये। इस संदर्भ में, सड़क दुर्घटनाओं के मामलों में संकट के समय सहायता देने वाले अच्छे व्यक्तियों (good samaritans) के लिए कानूनी संरक्षण के उद्देश्य को समझाएं।

Common people often view legal system - police, lawyers, judges - with dread.

Legal processes are associated with long delays, high costs & harassment.

As a result people avoid getting themselves entangled into legal hassles. This has several negative consequences

- fraudsters, & criminals, extortionists go free as people don't report.

- Even if police registers complaints, witnesses don't come forward.

- As a result, case progresses slowly and then victims prefer to withdraw or settle.

This results in grave miscarriage of justice

witness  
victim  
road  
criminal



No where is this more prominent than in road accident victims

People prefer to st remain bystanders & make videos rather than help as they don't want to get entangled with police & court cases.

Good samaritan law is essential as it reduces burden on the person who chooses to help. H/she doesn't have to through hassle of legal system

It will encourage people to help victims & rush them to hospital within the 'golden hour'.

3. (b) Examine the different ethical issues involved in the use of public shaming as a punitive measure. Do you think this is an appropriate measure to address the problem of rising crime rates. 10

(b) दंडात्मक उपाय के रूप में सार्वजनिक रूप से लज्जित करने (public shaming) जैसे उपायों से जुड़े विभिन्न नैतिक मुद्दों का परीक्षण कीजिए। क्या आप मानते हैं कि बढ़ते अपराध दर की समस्या हल करने के लिए यह उपयुक्त उपाय है।

Public shaming is often suggested as a punitive measure in wide range of case from corruption to heinous crimes like rape & murder.

Several ethical issues are involved.

- Dignity of individual is an important foundational principle of society.
- Justice - A principle that is universally accepted is 'innocent till proven guilty'. Till person exhausts all legal remedies, is it justified to name & shame?
- Rule of law means equal protection of law. Can the principles of privacy & equality be denied to the accused?
- Often, making names of

dignity  
innocent  
till  
guilty  
justice  
rule of  
law

sexual offenders public is  
advocated. But this makes  
rehabilitation of the guilty  
person difficult. Accused can't  
assimilate in society after  
completing the sentence.

Public shaming may  
have to be examined  
on a case by case basis.

A major cause of  
rising crime rates is lack  
of strict enforcement of existing  
laws. If implementation is  
good, it will result in  
deterrence.



4. (a) Why did Gunnar Myrdal use the term 'soft state' in the context of South Asia? Do you think such a characterisation is still relevant in the case of India today? 10

(a) गुन्नार मिर्दल ने दक्षिण एशिया के संदर्भ में 'मृदु राज्य' का प्रयोग क्यों किया है? क्या आप मानते हैं कि इस प्रकार का विशेषीकरण आज के भारत के संदर्भ में भी प्रासंगिक है?

Gunnar Myrdal used the term 'soft state' to refer to inability of state to enforce laws. As a result, there is disregard for laws & lawlessness. This results in difficulty in governability.

South Asian countries at present face several problems that point to this - corruption, rising crimes, organised crime, terrorism etc.

This characterisation is not relevant in context of India. There are several reasons:

- Initiatives on part of govt. Govt of India has strengthened laws ~~so~~ on crimes against women, corruption, black money etc.

There is a new & enhanced focus on implementation

- Activist judiciary - judiciary has played an important role in maintaining rule of law & often takes suo moto cognition.

eg - Role in 2G, coal scam etc

- Activist media - Media in recent times has played vital role in holding govt accountable.

- Aware citizens - Social media, RTI, awareness of rights, have made citizens empowered.

4. (b) Intolerance can be linked both to prejudices and value judgments. Elaborate with relevant examples. Also discuss how intolerance can be countered in a multicultural society like India. 10

- (b) असहिष्णुता को पूर्वाग्रह और मूल्यानुमानों (value judgments) दोनों से जोड़ा जा सकता है। प्रासंगिक उदाहरणों के साथ सविस्तार वर्णन कीजिए। साथ ही चर्चा कीजिए कि भारत जैसे बहुसांस्कृतिक समाज में असहिष्णुता का प्रतिकार कैसे किया जा सकता है।

Intolerance is a major threat to democracy all over the world.

It can be linked to prejudices - eg race violence & police brutality against African Americans in USA

It can be linked to value judgements as well.

eg ethnic chauvinism, Islamophobia because of failure to understand Islamic values.

India is an excellent example of unity in diversity. Despite a multitude of religions, ethnicities, languages we have emerged as a successful democracy. Several challenges exist in



India w.r.t. intolerance.

It can be countered in following ways.

- Greater dialogue among communities on contentious issues like beef, Ayodhya temple etc.

- Improving understanding of various cultures.

This can help resolve misunderstandings. This is relevant in case of ~~p~~ alienation faced by people of northeast

Govt of India has taken initiatives like Ek Bharat Shreshtha Bharat to encourage this.

5. Social attitude towards corruption has become more forgiving with time leading to a view of illegal gains and misappropriation of public assets as a "rightful" individual prerogative. Analyse in the context of India. 10

समय के साथ भ्रष्टाचार के प्रति सामाजिक दृष्टिकोण अधिक क्षम्य बन गया है जिससे "उचित" व्यक्तिगत विशिष्टाधिकार के रूप में गैर-कानूनी लाभों और सार्वजनिक परिसंपत्तियों के दुर्विनियोग का मार्ग प्रशस्त हुआ है। भारत के संदर्भ में विश्लेषण कीजिए।

A major factor that determines how societies tackle certain issues is societal attitude.

In India, corruption is pervasive. At each level of govt, from lowest to highest ranking officials, there are instances of corruption.

Even common people have prefer to pay bribe to get work done in govt offices faster or escape misdemeanours like breaking traffic rules.

However, all citizens have become more aware of their rights they have begun demanding better quality of public service.

There is growing intolerance towards corruption.

eg Jan Lokpal movement led by Anna Hazare saw mass participation after series of scams emerged.

RTI & social media have become major tools for citizens to ensure transparency. Govt has become more proactive in delivering corruption free govt & addressing grievances.



6. What are the factors which draw people to public service? Suggest measures to keep public servants motivated. 10

लोगों को लोक सेवा की ओर आकर्षित करने वाले कारक क्या हैं? लोक सेवकों को प्रेरित रखने के उपाय सुझाए।

Public service means service of the people. Through public service goals of socio-economic equality & justice can be achieved.

There are several factors drawing people to public service :-

- Chance to work at grassroots level & make a lasting impact on people's lives
- A large number of avenues are available to serve the people - policymaking, implementation, ensuring accountability through auditing etc.
- Chance to bring about innovation & out of box thinking to solve problems.

Several measures can be ~~taken~~ taken to motivate officials :

- appreciation of good work & holding errant officials accountable
- minimising political interference to make jobs of officials easier & less stressful
- effective communication so that even the inputs of officials at all levels can be included in policy formulation.

7. Corporate Governance provides a framework that defines the rights, roles and responsibilities of various groups within an organization. (a) Elaborate the need to incorporate the principles of Corporate Governance to enhance the effectiveness of the public sector enterprises. (b) Identify the challenges specific to the public sector when it comes to the application of good practices of corporate governance. 10

कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस वह ढांचा प्रदान करता है जो संगठन के भीतर विभिन्न समूहों की भूमिकाएं, अधिकार और उत्तरदायित्व परिभाषित करता है। (a) सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र के उद्यमों की प्रभावशीलता बढ़ाने के लिए कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस के सिद्धांतों को समाविष्ट करने की आवश्यकता का सविस्तार वर्णन कीजिए। (b) जब कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस की अच्छी पद्धतियों के अनुप्रयोग की बात आती है तो सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र के लिए विशिष्ट चुनौतियों की पहचान कीजिए।

(a) There is a need to incorporate principles of corporate governance to in PSEs to achieve the 3 Es - Efficiency, Economy & Effectiveness.

This is beneficial in following manner:

- enhance transparency.
- enhance accountability.
- ensure integrity.
- prevent profligate spending or unwise investment.
- bring in better management.
- help in application of best practices in running PSEs.



- (b) Challenges that exist are as follows :
- minimising political interference.
  - ensuring autonomy of PSEs
  - changing work culture of PSEs
  - changing attitude of employees of PSEs

8. Emotions, earlier considered as an irrational factor in decision-making, are now recognised as a critical factor of judgment. In this regard, answer the following questions: (a) How can Emotional Intelligence help in coping with the intense pressure and occupational stress faced by police officers and armed forces in discharge of their duties? (b) What are the some of the concerns in incorporating and assessment of emotional intelligence skills in public service? 10

भावनाओं को, जिन्हें निर्णय लेने में पहले एक अतार्किक कारक माना जाता था, अब निर्णय का महत्वपूर्ण कारक माना जाता है। इस संबंध में, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

(a) अपने कर्तव्यों का निर्वहन में पुलिस कर्मियों और सशस्त्र बलों द्वारा सामना किए जाने वाले तीव्र दबाव और कार्य सम्बन्धी तनाव (occupational stress) का मुकाबला करने में भावात्मक प्रज्ञता (Emotional Intelligence) किस प्रकार सहायता कर सकती है?

(b) लोक सेवा में भावात्मक प्रज्ञता कौशल को समाविष्ट करने और आंकलन सम्बन्धी कुछ चिंताएं क्या हैं?

(a) Emotional intelligence means ability to recognise & control own emotions & those of others & affect outcomes

This is especially useful for police officers & armed forces as it results in :-

- better inter personal skills
- better negotiation skills
- better conflict resolution
- ability to motivate onself and others
- handle extreme/ negative emotions
- build positive attitude

These qualities help in coping

intense pressure & stress

(b) Concerns in incorporating & assessment of EI are:

- difficulty in designing tests as test results can be manipulated
- difficulty in design modules
- question on effectiveness as such qualities take time to cultivate & are a ~~result of~~ life long process.



9. You, a manager in one of the top IT firms in the country, are tasked with hiring new recruits for an upcoming project. You find that the company has given tacit instructions of not hiring female candidates in view of the new maternity law passed by the Government. You find this highly objectionable and lodge a protest with people in the higher management but they are firm as they want to cut down all the unnecessary costs. Based on this information, answer the following questions:

- (a) Identify the stakeholders and their interests in the situation.
- (b) What are the dilemmas that a recruiting manager may face in such a scenario?
- (c) What are the different options available to you? Which one will you pursue and why?

20

आप देश की एक शीर्ष आईटी कंपनी के प्रबंधक हैं। आपको आगामी परियोजना के लिए नई भर्तियां करने का उत्तरदायित्व सौंपा गया है। आप पाते हैं कि सरकार द्वारा पारित किए गए नवीन मातृत्व कानून के आलोक में कंपनी ने महिला अभ्यर्थियों की भर्ती न करने का अकथित निर्देश दिया गया है। आप इसे अत्यधिक आपत्तिजनक पाते हैं और प्रबंधन के उच्च अधिकारियों से विरोध जताते हैं, लेकिन वे दृढ़ हैं क्योंकि वे सभी अनावश्यक व्यय में कमी करना चाहते हैं।

इस जानकारी के आधार पर, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

- (a) इस स्थिति में हितधारकों और उनके हितों की पहचान कीजिए।
- (b) वे धर्मसंकट क्या है जिनका ऐसी परिस्थिति में भर्ती प्रबंधक द्वारा सामना किया जा सकता है?
- (c) आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? आप किसका अनुसरण करेंगे और क्यों?

- (a) Stakeholders & their interests in the situation are as follows:
- Owners of IT firm - They want to cut down costs as they don't want to pay salaries to women on maternity leave.
- Management - wants to please owners & protect own job prospects in firm.

Manager who recruits - want to ensure gender equality & doesn't wish to discriminate against women.

other employees - As the rule limits the talent pool & may exclude deserving, high performing candidates, it may affect overall performance of the firm.

Female candidates - The rule is against their right to equality & penalises them for their gender. It is a setback for women's rights.

Govt & society at large - Govt is entrusted with responsibility to ensure ~~rules~~ laws as & constitutional ideals are obeyed.

Society ~~has~~ wants to ensure gender equality.

(b) As a manager, there are primarily 2 ~~issues~~ ethical issues

(i) commitment to the firm & obeying orders of superiors.

Organisations demand loyalty from employees & expect complete obedience

Going against directives may hinder career prospects of the manager.

(ii) commitment to higher ideals of equality, justice & integrity.

Manager by following the rule not only goes against spirit of law but also against his own moral principles.

Dilemma is in front of manager is how to balance the two issues.



(c) Different options available me are as follows:

- (i) refuse to follow the tacit instructions & use own mind to hire recruits
- (ii) follow instructions of the top management
- (iii) make a complaint to the Internal Complaint committee set up with firm
- (iv) read rule book of the firm & make my case for recruiting female candidates based on hard evidence & illustrate with examples of good female employees to convince top management

I would use the fourth option as it successfully resolves dilemma of loyalty

to company versus commitment  
to gender equality

10. There has been a perceptible rise in the cost of healthcare services provided by private hospitals. In absence of adequate and quality government hospitals, people are forced to opt for private hospitals, especially for life threatening diseases and injuries. You recently visit one of your friends admitted in a famous private hospital. You found out that the hospital is charging a huge amount of money, which seems to be unreasonable. You confront the staff and ask them to explain the rationale behind such high charges.

Their response is that the charges are fair for the kind of services they are providing.

- (a) What are the ethical issues involved in this situation?
- (b) Given how other professions price their services, discuss the feasibility of capping the amount of fees charged by doctors and private hospitals.
- (c) How can the provision of quality services and need for profit be reconciled with society's interests in this case?

20

निजी अस्पतालों द्वारा प्रदान की जाने वाली स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं की लागत में सुषष्ट वृद्धि हुई है। पर्याप्त और गुणवत्ता पूर्ण सरकारी अस्पतालों के अभाव में, लोग निजी अस्पतालों का विकल्प चुनने के लिए विवश हैं, विशेषकर जीवन के लिए खतरनाक बीमारियों और चोटों हेतु। आप हाल ही में एक प्रसिद्ध निजी अस्पताल में भर्ती अपने मित्र से मिलने जाते हैं। आपको पता चलता है कि अस्पताल बड़ी धनराशि वसूल रहा है जो आपको अनुचित या आवश्यकता से अधिक प्रतीत होता है। आप कर्मचारियों से बातचीत करते हैं और उनसे इस प्रकार के उच्च शुल्क के पीछे का तर्क समझाने के लिए कहते हैं। उनकी प्रतिक्रिया यह है कि उनके द्वारा जिस प्रकार की सेवाएँ प्रदान की जाती हैं उसके लिए यह शुल्क उचित है।

- (a) इस स्थिति से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं?
- (b) यह देखते हुए कि अन्य व्यवसाय अपनी सेवाओं का मूल्य कैसे तय करते हैं, चिकित्सकों और निजी अस्पतालों द्वारा आरोपित शुल्क की राशि पर सीमा निर्धारित करने की व्यवहार्यता पर चर्चा कीजिए।
- (c) इस प्रकरण में गुणवत्ता परक सेवाओं के प्रबंध और लाभ की आवश्यकता का समाज के हितों के साथ सामंजस्य कैसे स्थापित किया जा सकता है?



(a) Ethical issues involved is the profit versus service.

Patients blindly trust doctors & hospitals. They agree to undergo whatever tests, surgeries & treatments suggested by doctors.

Hospitals misuse this trust & make patients undergo unnecessary tests & surgeries to extract exorbitant fees from them.

Besides, it makes medical care unaffordable & hence inaccessible for a large share of population. Often poor get trapped in debt.

The main objective of the medical profession is to save lives not profit of out of misery & helplessness of patients.

(b) Capping of fees is a feasible option.

Often prices of stents, medicines, lab tests are overinflated.

Based on price of inputs & salaries of doctors, a formula can be arrived at.

Capping of fees may help reduce unnecessary tests & operations as hospitals ~~may~~ can't make profits out of them.

However, govt will then have to ensure that hospitals don't lose incentives to keep running & or engage in other unethical practises.

- (C) & This can be resolved in following way
- having income limits ~~for~~ <sup>above</sup> which hospitals are free to charge prices
  - govt can ensure better implementation of its insurance schemes for poor & expand its coverage to include more people
  - hospitals should be encouraged to be more transparent about prices
  - govt can provide subsidies to ensure that when fee is capped, incentive for doctors doesn't end.
  - a regulatory body can be set up to prevent unethical practices.





11. You are the District Magistrate in a district where a significant number of transgenders reside. While discrimination against the community is well known, commuters increasingly complain of harassment at their hands, especially at traffic junctions where transgenders are mostly involved in begging. This, at times, also leads to traffic management issues. You have received a number of complaints in this regard and have to act quickly to resolve it. However, a group of transgender associations argue that begging is their only source of livelihood.

Given the situation, answer the following questions:

(a) Describe the ethical issues involved in this case. Discuss the attitude of people towards transgenders in general and reasons for the same.

(b) What possible courses of action can be undertaken in such situations? Discuss their merits and demerits.

20

आप ऐसे जिले में जिला मजिस्ट्रेट हैं जहां ट्रांसजेंडर की बड़ी संख्या रहती है। यद्यपि इस समुदाय के विरुद्ध भेदभाव सुविदित है, तथापि यात्री उनके हाथों, विशेषकर यातायात जंक्शनों पर अधिकाधिक उत्पीड़न की शिकायत करते हैं, जहां ट्रांसजेंडर अधिकांशतः भीख मांगने में शामिल होते हैं। कभी-कभी, इससे यातायात प्रबंधन की समस्या भी पैदा होती है। इस संबंध में आपको कई शिकायतें मिली हैं और इसे हल करने के लिए शीघ्र कार्रवाई करनी है। हालांकि, ट्रांसजेंडर संघ के एक समूह का कहना है कि भीख मांगना उनकी आजीविका का एकमात्र स्रोत है।

इस स्थिति को देखते हुए, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

(a) इस प्रकरण से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दों का वर्णन कीजिए। ट्रांसजेंडर लोगों के प्रति जनसामान्य के सामान्य दृष्टिकोण और उसके कारणों पर चर्चा कीजिए।

(b) ऐसी स्थिति में क्या संभव कार्रवाई की जा सकती है? उनके गुणों और अवगुणों पर चर्चा कीजिए।

(a) Ethical issues involved are as follows :

(i) Right to livelihood of transgenders. Prohibiting begging will endanger their livelihoods

(ii) Right of commuters against

harassment

(iii) ~~dilemma~~ for DM about right to equality of transgenders.

(iv) Public safety which is ~~also~~ endangered because of traffic management issues

In general, people discriminate against transgenders. They are considered a taboo in society. They remain on margins of society with lack of access to their rights as human beings.

Reasons for this attitude are as follows

(i) lack of understanding among people as it is not a much discussed subject.

(ii) superstitious beliefs  
of the people

(iii) lack of initiative on  
part of govt to bring  
them into mainstream

(iv) Transgenders also ~~don't~~ <sup>did, not</sup>  
receive media attention  
in the past.

(b) Possible course of actions  
that can be taken are

- allowing the situation  
to continue - It is dangerous  
as it may lead to  
road accidents. Besides  
it causes inconvenience for  
people

- prohibiting begging - this  
violates rights of transgenders.



- providing alternate livelihoods to transgenders. They can be provided vocational & skill training & credit to start enterprises.

The third option is most suitable as it will result in problem resolving itself. As transgenders earn a living elsewhere, begging will stop. This is a win-win situation for all.





12. Mr. X is the head of an NGO working in the field of environment conservation and protection. He is in dire need of funds for the NGO's operations and payments to his staff. He is approached by an official of a large infrastructure company, who is ready to provide the required funding for the NGO. But, in a quid pro quo, he asks Mr. X to raise objections over the bypassing of Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) norms in an ongoing PPP project through his NGO. This project is being implemented by a rival infrastructure company. Mr. X knows that there have been instances of high level corruption in the process of granting EIA to mega projects and the information provided by the official seems to be authentic. Hence, he accepts the money and agrees to raise the objection.

(a) Considering the circumstances of the case, is Mr. X correct in accepting the money? Give appropriate reasons for your answer.

(b) If you were in place of Mr. X, what would have been your course of action? Give reasons for it.

20

श्री एक्स पर्यावरण संरक्षण और सुरक्षा के क्षेत्र में कार्यरत एक NGO (गैर सरकारी संगठन) के प्रमुख हैं। उन्हें NGO के संचालन और कर्मचारियों को भुगतान करने हेतु धन की अत्यन्त आवश्यकता है। एक बड़ी इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर कंपनी का एक अधिकारी उनसे संपर्क करता है। कंपनी NGO के लिए आवश्यक फंड उपलब्ध कराने को तैयार है। लेकिन उसके बदले वह कंपनी यह चाहती है कि श्री एक्स अपने NGO के माध्यम से चल रही PPP परियोजना में पर्यावरण प्रभाव आकलन (EIA) मानदंडों की अवहेलना पर आपत्तियां उठाएं। यह परियोजना प्रतिद्वंद्वी इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर कंपनी द्वारा कार्यान्वित की जा रही है। श्री एक्स को पता है कि बड़े प्रोजेक्ट्स के लिए EIA प्रदान करने की प्रक्रिया में उच्च स्तरीय भ्रष्टाचार के मामले सामने आए हैं और अधिकारियों द्वारा दी गई जानकारी प्रामाणिक प्रतीत होती है। इसलिए, वह धन स्वीकार कर लेते हैं और आपत्ति उठाने के लिए सहमत हो जाते हैं।

(a) प्रकरण की परिस्थितियों को ध्यान में रखते हुए, क्या श्री एक्स का धन स्वीकार करना सही है? अपने उत्तर के लिए उचित कारण दीजिए।

(b) यदि आप श्री एक्स के स्थान पर होते, तो आप क्या कदम उठाते? इसके कारण बताइए।

(a)

No. Mr X is wrong in accepting the money. This is because of following reasons :-

(i) there is no good or bad corruption.

Corruption in all its forms is unethical

(ii) There is a clear conflict of interest for Mr X.

He accepted money to derail a rival firm's project in garb of environment

(iii) He has shown lack of integrity.

If claims ~~were~~ seemed authentic he should have investigated himself & brought it to attention of concerned authorities.

(iv) He has also misused trust of the people. People

trust him for his past work & has violated this trust.

- (b) If I were in place of Mr X, I would have done the following :
- (i) outrightly rejected the offer of money.
  - (ii) As the allegations seemed authentic, I would investigate the matter myself.
  - (iii) If indeed there are irregularities, I would bring it to notice of concerned authorities.
  - (iv) In order to raise funds, I would have raised the issue on proper platforms & appealed for



help & donations to  
continue the good work.

The above approach  
ensures that I adhere  
to my code of ethics &  
highest moral standards.

On account of running  
the NGO, it is my duty  
to maintain my integrity  
& trustworthiness.

Even the mere hint  
of suspicion or of can  
tarnish reputation built  
over years. It is important  
being an NGO to maintain  
the same ethical standards  
that it demands from the govt



13. You are a civil servant posted in a state where elections were recently held. The newly elected Chief Minister had promised to ban alcohol in several of his election campaigns as well as his election manifesto, which was widely praised and supported by women of the state. Fulfilling his electoral promise, the Chief Minister has ordered a blanket ban on the sale of alcohol in the state. Following the ban, concerns have been raised about the feasibility of the ban and whether the government should interfere in what is considered by many to be a matter of personal choice.

(a) Who are the stakeholders in this case and how are they affected by the ban?

(b) Is blanket ban on alcohol a feasible action?

(c) Identify the issues that may arise while enforcing the ban and the steps you will take to handle them, as a civil servant.

25

आप एक ऐसे राज्य में सिविल सेवक के रूप में तैनात हैं जहां हाल ही में चुनाव हुए थे। नव निर्वाचित मुख्यमंत्री ने अपने कई चुनावी अभियानों के साथ-साथ चुनाव घोषणापत्र में शराब पर प्रतिबंध लगाने का वादा किया था, जिसकी राज्य की महिलाओं ने व्यापक रूप से प्रशंसा की थी और समर्थन दिया था। अपने चुनावी वादे को पूरा करते हुए, मुख्यमंत्री ने राज्य में शराब की बिक्री पर पूर्ण प्रतिबन्ध का आदेश दिया है। प्रतिबंध के बाद, प्रतिबंध की व्यवहार्यता पर प्रश्न उठाए गये हैं और क्या सरकार द्वारा शराब पर प्रतिबन्ध जिसे कई लोगों द्वारा व्यक्तिगत पसंद का विषय बताया गया है, उस मुद्दे पर हस्तक्षेप करना चाहिए।

(a) इस मामले में हितधारक कौन हैं और प्रतिबंध से वे किस प्रकार प्रभावित हैं?

(b) क्या शराब पर पूर्ण प्रतिबन्ध एक व्यवहार्य कार्रवाई है?

(c) एक सिविल सेवक के रूप में इन प्रतिबंधों को लागू करते समय उत्पन्न होने वाली समस्याओं की पहचान करें और उनसे निपटने हेतु आप क्या कदम उठाएंगे।

(a) The stakeholders & affect on them are as follows :-

- Consumers - Their choice of consuming alcohol has been taken away.
- Owners of legal liquors

shops - Their livelihoods would be lost as their shops would have to shut down. They will suffer losses on existing stock.

- Makers of hooch & illegal alcohol - They will benefit as consumers will turn to them to continue their habit

- Women - They will benefit. As liquor becomes scarce, it will ensure that husbands don't spend their incomes on liquor. It will help reduce alcoholism & limit the impact on families

- Police - will have to become more vigilant. They will have to conduct raids on illegal hooch makers &



increase patrolling

- Health system - may get burdened as people turn to other more dangerous intoxicants or consume ~~spurious~~ spurious liquor.

- (b) Blanket ban is not a feasible option
- people will turn to hooch makers & bootleggers
  - there may be black marketing
  - people may turn to other intoxicants like drugs. Alcoholism will give way to drug addiction
  - There may be increased cases of spurious alcohol consumption
  - There will be difficulty in

enforcement as police will find it difficult to control what people do in the privacy of their home

(vi) Warrants for searching premises <sup>& other processes</sup> will burden the already overburdened police force

(vii) police ~~will~~ attention will get diverted

(C) As a civil servant, issues that will arise are

(i) Black marketing, hooch, illegal alcohol

I will keep strict watch on known offenders & those with past records

(ii) Addiction to drugs &

other intoxicants

I will spread awareness  
& conduct campaigns to  
educate citizens on harmful  
effects.

(ii) Spurious liquor

I will ensure that  
miscreants ~~don't use opportunity~~  
to are unable to transport  
such liquor by maintaining  
strict checking.

(iv) Unemployment of shop  
owners.

I will try to provide them  
with an alternate livelihood,  
~~provide~~ help them to access  
credit to start new  
enterprises.





14. Regulation and procedure of human clinical trials vary from nation to nation. Stem cell research, as an emerging biomedical field, requires approval for human trials and encounters multiple challenges. You are the head of a team of scientists who developed a new Tissue Engineering system, which appears to be a promising means of regenerating heart tissue. Trials of the system have already been conducted on animals and yielded good results. Millions of people suffering from critical heart diseases would benefit immensely if this medication is immediately made available to them. However, you need to conduct human clinical trials before it could be commercialised. It is also known that the stringent regulatory environment in the country will mean that human trials and final approval will take many years before it is made commercially available. On the other hand, regulation of clinical trials in many poor countries is weak and quick approval is possible. Many of your competitors also resort to human trials in these countries, often bribing the officials for getting quick approvals.

Given this situation, answer the following questions:

- Identify the ethical issues which arise during clinical trials.
- Given the above situation, would you prefer to shift human trials to a third country where regulations are lax? Give reasons in support of your choice.
- Suggest a framework of standard procedure to minimise ethical conflicts and speed-up the approval process of new medicines.

25

मानव पर नैदानिक परीक्षण (clinical trials) के विनियम और प्रक्रियाएं राष्ट्र दर राष्ट्र भिन्न हैं। एक उभरते बायोमेडिकल क्षेत्र के रूप में स्टेम सेल शोध के लिए मानवीय परीक्षणों हेतु स्वीकृति की आवश्यकता होती है और इसे चुनौतियों का सामना करना पड़ता है। आप वैज्ञानिकों के एक दल के नेतृत्वकर्ता हैं जिन्होंने एक नई टिशू इंजीनियरिंग सिस्टम विकसित किया है जो हृदय के उत्तको (टिशूज) को पुनः पैदा करने हेतु आशावान साधन नजर आता है। इस सिस्टम का पहले ही जानवरों पर परीक्षण किया जा चुका है और उसके अच्छे परिणाम मिले हैं। गंभीर हृदय रोगों से जूझते लाखों-लाख लोगों को इसे अत्यधिक लाभ होगा यदि यह इलाज उनके लिए शीघ्र उपलब्ध करा दिया जाता है। हालांकि इसके वाणिज्यिकरण से पूर्व मानव पर नैदानिक परीक्षण करने की आवश्यकता होती है। यह भी ज्ञात है कि इसके वाणिज्यिक रूप में (बाजार में) उपलब्ध होने से पूर्व देश में विनियमन संबंधी कठोर वातावरण के कारण मानवीय परीक्षण और अंतिम स्वीकृति में वर्षों लग जाएंगे। वहीं दूसरी ओर बहुत से गरीब राष्ट्रों में नैदानिक परीक्षण सम्बन्धी विनियमन ढीले हैं और शीघ्र स्वीकृति संभव है। आपके बहुत-से प्रतिद्वंद्वी भी नैदानिक परीक्षण हेतु प्रायः ऐसे राष्ट्रों का रुख करते हैं जहां वे अधिकारियों को रिश्वत दे कर शीघ्र स्वीकृति प्राप्त कर लेते हैं।

दी गई परिस्थिति के अनुसार निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों के उत्तर दीजिए:

- नैदानिक परीक्षण के दौरान उभरने वाले नैतिक मुद्दों की पहचान कीजिए।
- दी गई उपर्युक्त परिस्थिति में, क्या आप मानवीय परीक्षणों को किसी तीसरे देश में स्थानांतरित करना पसंद करेंगे जहां विनियमन ढीले हैं? अपने चयन हेतु कारण दीजिए।
- नैतिक संघर्ष को कम करने एवं नई दवाइयों हेतु स्वीकृति की प्रक्रिया को तीव्र करने के लिए मानक प्रक्रिया का एक प्रारूप सुझाइए।

(a) Ethical issue involved is profit versus safety. Researchers spend years often decades in research & donors provide huge amount of funds. Cost ~~for~~ recovery becomes crucial. Delays in trials means loss in edge over competition. It also means delay in cutting ~~on the~~ edge technology that could save lives.

On the other hand, lack of appropriate safeguards for the participants may mean that in case they get experience serious health consequences, they will not be able to redress their grievances. Safety regulations ensure that companies don't undermine health for profit.

(b) No. I would not prefer to shift to a third country.

- safety regulations are meant to ensure that health of participants is not compromised

- All researchers experience similar restrictions so there is no question of losing the edge

- The technology can be patented beforehand to ensure that ~~I can pro~~ competitors don't copy.

- As it is a life saving technology with wide ranging implications, it is my duty to ensure it is 100% safe

- I can appeal to the govt



to take the matter into consideration because of its life saving potential.

(c) In order to resolve the issue, the framework can consist of :

(i) a regulatory body that comprises of experts & scientists ~~only & not~~ & not bureaucrats & politicians

(ii) greater transparency whereby all data relating to animal & human trial will be disclosed

(iii) ensure that participants are aware of risks involved

(iv) ensure that participants are insured & their health care costs are taken care



of in case of any  
serious consequences on  
health.

