



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

RECEIVED

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 873)

Name of Candidate	NANDINI		
Medium Eng./Hindi	ENGLISH	Registration Number	191609
Center	KB	Date	27.9.17

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	25	
14	25	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कांड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are FOURTEEN questions printed in ENGLISH & HINDI
इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं अंग्रेजी और हिन्दी में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory.
सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

Answer the following questions in not more than 150 words each:

1. (a) The more remotely power is exercised from the people, the greater is the distance between authority and accountability. Discuss. 10

(a) जितना लोगों से सत्ता का प्रयोग दूर होगा, उतना ही अधिक प्राधिकारी और जवाबदेही के बीच अंतर होगा। चर्चा कीजिए।

Power is considered most accountable when exercised locally
→ this is the promise of federalism and decentralisation.

When distant authorities exercise power, there is fear of
→ apathy
→ disconnection

Thus the Indian constitutional amendments of 1993, 73rd & 74th, mandate local governance.

The frightful and debilitating impact of colonialism is the a manifestation of problems of remote governance.

During the 2nd World War,
the British powers took away
grain from Bengal to feed
the British Army.

As a result, 3 million people
in Bengal died (Great
Bengal Famine of 1943).

They were not connected with
the plight of Bengalis, and
yet exercised power over them.
The results were catastrophic.

1. (b) "If you want others to be happy, practice compassion. If you want to be happy, practice compassion". In what ways can a compassionate public official be more useful for realizing public service goals? 10

(b) "यदि आप दूसरों को प्रसन्न रखना चाहते हैं, तो करुणावान बनें। यदि आप प्रसन्न रहना चाहते हैं तो करुणा अपनाएं।" किस प्रकार से एक करुणावान लोक सेवक सार्वजनिक सेवा के लक्ष्यों को साकार करने के लिए अधिक उपयोगी हो सकता है?

The penalty for lack of accountability is not very high in the Indian administrative system.

While efforts are ongoing to make accountability necessary, for now the most useful tool to society in an administrator is compassion.

→ Without compassion, the administrator will get away with doing the bare minimum.

→ Even if work can easily be

done to improve situation of people, motivation will be absent to do the work.

Eg → the Nirbhaya Fund, to ensure safety of women in Delhi, is lying unused. A compassionate official would recognize the need for releasing fund immediately.

→ In many scenarios of public administration, like policing, compassion is a necessity.

Eg → ~~where~~ sometimes, the police encourage victims of domestic violence to go back home. Such scenarios would not take place if compassion was built into the system, and instilled in the officials.

2. (a) The recent decision by the government to ban use of red beacons is only a symbolic gesture and a lot more needs to be done to end the VIP culture in India. Critically discuss.

10

(a) लाल बत्ती के प्रयोग पर प्रतिबन्ध सम्बन्धी सरकार का हालिया निर्णय केवल एक प्रतीकात्मक संकेत है और भारत में वीआईपी संस्कृति समाप्त करने के लिए बहुत कुछ किए जाने की आवश्यकता है। आलोचनात्मक रूप से चर्चा कीजिए।

Symbolic gestures are a necessary start to any change.

Thus, while it is true that banning red beacon cars is a symbolic gesture, this is cause for celebration, not concern.

Other steps taken :

→ banning 5 star location for gut. gatherings

→ banning extravagant gifts to state guests.

We can draw inspiration from Mahatma Gandhi, and his frugal lifestyle, simple

clothing, and humble living
in our efforts towards
dismantling VIP culture.

2. (b) To what extent can financial incentives help shape attitude towards social issues? Discuss with relevant examples.

10

(b) किस हद तक आर्थिक प्रोत्साहन सामाजिक मुद्दों के प्रति अभिवृत्ति को आकार देने में सहायता कर सकते हैं? प्रासंगिक उदाहरणों सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

Financial incentives are very powerful, as they give the user absolute freedom of utilizing the award.

Thus, even for social issues, they can play a useful role.

Eg → Girl Child Protection Scheme, which offers incentives for education and late-marriage of girls. This has borne fruit.

However, financial incentives need to be implemented with behavioral change.

Best eg: Swachh Bharat Abhiyan
→ financial reward for creating

toilets

Behavioral change through
advertisement, posters and
setting examples by MPs &
MLAs .

The educational programme
and schooling is also very
effective in raising and
sensitizing people towards
social issues like
discrimination .

3. (a) At times, moral behaviour can be constrained by the complexity of legal system. Explain. In this context, explain the purpose of legal protection for good samaritans in the case of road accidents. 10

(a) कई बार, नैतिक व्यवहार कानूनी प्रणाली की जटिलता के चलते निरुद्ध हो सकता है। व्याख्या कीजिये। इस संदर्भ में, सड़क दुर्घटनाओं के मामलों में संकट के समय सहायता देने वाले अच्छे व्यक्तियों (good samaritans) के लिए कानूनी संरक्षण के उद्देश्य को समझाएं।

Till recently, there was limited legal protection of good samaritans helping road accident victims.

The helpers would find themselves victims of police harassment and court appearances.

This actually discouraged them from doing the morally correct duty of helping fellow human beings.

Now, a law is proposed to

~~to~~ to give good samaritans
rights and protection
→ recognize and award their
positive role.

Such laws can be extended
~~to~~ whistleblowers, and others
who find themselves
constrained by legality in
the exercise of their
morality.

3. (b) Examine the different ethical issues involved in the use of public shaming as a punitive measure. Do you think this is an appropriate measure to address the problem of rising crime rates. 10

- (b) दंडात्मक उपाय के रूप में सार्वजनिक रूप से लज्जित करने (public shaming) जैसे उपायों से जुड़े विभिन्न नैतिक मुद्दों का परीक्षण कीजिए। क्या आप मानते हैं कि बढ़ते अपराध दर की समस्या हल करने के लिए यह उपयुक्त उपाय है।

Public shaming is a dubious method of deterrence.

Positives

→ social standing is very important to human dignity. People will not want to risk it.

→ in a caste-based society, which has used ostracism and boycott as measures to ensure conformity, it is very powerful.

Negative

→ implications for right to privacy.

→ against right to reputation, included in Art 21.

→ promotes social ostracism,
which ~~pr~~ may promote
castes, and is against
International Human Rights
Principles.

Thus, ethically, the favour is
towards refraining from
public shaming. It may
be used for serious crimes
like murder, rape, child
molestation etc.

4. (a) Why did Gunnar Myrdal use the term 'soft state' in the context of South Asia? Do you think such a characterisation is still relevant in the case of India today?

10

(a) गुन्नार मिर्डल ने दक्षिण एशिया के संदर्भ में 'मृदु राज्य' का प्रयोग क्यों किया है? क्या आप मानते हैं कि इस प्रकार का विशेषीकरण आज के भारत के संदर्भ में भी प्रासंगिक है?

'Soft state' refers to indiscipline in South Asia, when compared to modern European states.

This term was used keeping in mind corruption, administrative inefficiency and unsanitary behaviour of S. Asian states and citizens.

on Many accounts, S. Asia has improved → sanitation is better, corruption tackling mechanisms are in place etc. [Eg Swachh Bharat Abhiyan, Demonitization, high HDI of Sri Lanka] But compared to modern

European states, we have a long road ahead. Thus the categorisation is still valid.

India can learn from practices of states like Netherlands and Switzerland which see high accountability of government and civic duties and responsibilities. This will make India a happier and more prosperous, equitable country.

4. (b) Intolerance can be linked both to prejudices and value judgments. Elaborate with relevant examples. Also discuss how intolerance can be countered in a multicultural society like India. 10

(b) असहिष्णुता को पूर्वाग्रह और मूल्यानुमानों (value judgments) दोनों से जोड़ा जा सकता है। प्रासंगिक उदाहरणों के साथ सविस्तार वर्णन कीजिए। साथ ही चर्चा कीजिए कि भारत जैसे बहुसांस्कृतिक समाज में असहिष्णुता का प्रतिकार कैसे किया जा सकता है।

Prejudice refers to inherent, pre-conceived notions for/against certain practices or certain groups of people.

Eg → many people are 'prejudiced' against SCs, believing them to be 'polluted' and 'karmically bankrupt'.

Value judgements categorise certain actions as good or bad.

→ a girl who wears short clothes is a bad girl.

→ who wears sari is a good girl.

Both prejudice & value judgement

overlap and complement each other to create intolerant peoples and societies.

Multiculturalism accepts that no one way of living life is the right way → there are many ways of living well and organising society.

This mindset can root out many prejudices and judgements.

It is enshrined in of Constitution Fundamental Rights (Art 25-30) and DPSP (Part 4).

5. Social attitude towards corruption has become more forgiving with time leading to a view of illegal gains and misappropriation of public assets as a "rightful" individual prerogative. Analyse in the context of India. 10

समय के साथ भ्रष्टाचार के प्रति सामाजिक दृष्टिकोण अधिक क्षम्य बन गया है जिससे "उचित" व्यक्तिगत विशिष्टाधिकार के रूप में गैर-कानूनी लाभों और सार्वजनिक परिसंपत्तियों के दुर्विनियोग का मार्ग प्रशस्त हुआ है। भारत के संदर्भ में विश्लेषण कीजिए।

The notion that people do, and should act in their self-interest offers impunity to acts of corruption.

If someone is in a position of power, why should she give it up? Or not make full use of it? Or dilute it?

This attitude 'normalizes' corruptions, almost as intrinsic to human nature. Thus big Scams have stopped causing public furor in India. Agitation for Lokayukta has

died down.

Calls for police reforms have faded to leave the SC helplessly state 'Police reforms are going on and on, nobody is listening to us.'

The gout is making efforts to refocus on removing corruption

- Demonitization
- Benami Transactions Act
- Money Laundering (Prevention) Act.

Their implementation will only succeed once people realize that corruption props up the status quo, and keeps the underprivileged perennially underprivileged, and is thus antithetical to democracy

6. What are the factors which draw people to public service? Suggest measures to keep public servants motivated. 10

लोगों को लोक सेवा की ओर आकर्षित करने वाले कारक क्या हैं? लोक सेवकों को प्रेरित रखने के उपाय सुझाइए।

Public service in India is a much sought after profession.

1) Job satisfaction → doing good for society is the core objective

2) Job ~~at~~ requirements → vast opportunities for growth
Eg → in the Indian Revenue Service, one can be a teacher at NACEN, a lawyer at CESTAT, a spy at DRI and so on.

3) Job security

4) Perks and privileges.

5) Strong networking opportunities

6) Space in policy implementation

To keep public servants motivated
but must :

1) Root out the non-workers

2) Encourage with incentives
for good work

3) Provide salary at par wth the
private sector → the unskilled
are paid nearly double by
the government, while the
highly skilled are paid
nearly half. While this is
positive keeping economic
redistributive justice in mind,
in reality it is a demotivator.
7th Pay commission was a
good step in this direction.

7. Corporate Governance provides a framework that defines the rights, roles and responsibilities of various groups within an organization. (a) Elaborate the need to incorporate the principles of Corporate Governance to enhance the effectiveness of the public sector enterprises. (b) Identify the challenges specific to the public sector when it comes to the application of good practices of corporate governance.

10

कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस वह ढांचा प्रदान करता है जो संगठन के भीतर विभिन्न समूहों की भूमिकाएं, अधिकार और उत्तरदायित्व परिभाषित करता है। (a) सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र के उद्यमों की प्रभावशीलता बढ़ाने के लिए कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस के सिद्धांतों को समाविष्ट करने की आवश्यकता का सविस्तर वर्णन कीजिए। (b) जब कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस की अच्छी पद्धतियों के अनुप्रयोग की बात आती है तो सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र के लिए विशिष्ट चुनौतियों की पहचान कीजिए।

The struggling nature of public sector enterprises is most evident in public sector banking, which is mixed with the NPA crisis.

Corporate governance would immensely benefit PSBs :

- 1) A group in PSBs can be given the responsibility to conduct strict KYC protocols.
- 2) The responsibility to prevent evergreening of loans can be accountably given.

Many other virtues of corporate governance are useful for public sector enterprises in general. Limitations are

1) Different motives : Eg
Banking pubt $\rightarrow$ profit

Banking public $\rightarrow$ economic
justice, priority sector lending
etc.

2) Ultimate backing of the governments leads to laxness and lack of commitment.

3) Job security also reduces motivation to some extent
(Graph b/w job security and motivation is a hyperbola.)

4) Low expectations of public from pubt. enterprises, which all the PSE's to get away with a lot.

8. Emotions, earlier considered as an irrational factor in decision-making, are now recognised as a critical factor of judgment. In this regard, answer the following questions: (a) How can Emotional Intelligence help in coping with the intense pressure and occupational stress faced by police officers and armed forces in discharge of their duties? (b) What are the some of the concerns in incorporating and assessment of emotional intelligence skills in public service?

10

भावनाओं को, जिन्हें निर्णय लेने में पहले एक अतार्किक कारक माना जाता था, अब निर्णय का महत्वपूर्ण कारक माना जाता है। इस संबंध में, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

(a) अपने कर्तव्यों का निर्वहन में पुलिस कर्मियों और सशस्त्र बलों द्वारा सामना किए जाने वाले तीव्र दबाव और कार्य सम्बन्धी तनाव (occupational stress) का मुकाबला करने में भावात्मक प्रज्ञता (Emotional Intelligence) किस प्रकार सहायता कर सकती है?

(b) लोक सेवा में भावात्मक प्रज्ञता कौशल को समाविष्ट करने और आंकलन सम्बन्धी कुछ चिंताएं क्या हैं?

Emotional intelligence can help high stress workers like police officers & army persons by

1) Mentally separating their job from their personalities, which will help them in keeping a clear head in high stress situations.

Eg → if a police officer reaches a dead end at an important investigation, she can realize that it was not her personal fault. This will help her move

on to the next important investigation.

Problems in incorporating & assessing emotional intelligence skills :

- 1) Very subjective field
- 2) Lack of trained psychologists and other experts
- 3) Lack of standard criteria for assessment.
- 4) EI comes with individuality of every person — how can that be judged?

9. You, a manager in one of the top IT firms in the country, are tasked with hiring new recruits for an upcoming project. You find that the company has given tacit instructions of not hiring female candidates in view of the new maternity law passed by the Government. You find this highly objectionable and lodge a protest with people in the higher management but they are firm as they want to cut down all the unnecessary costs. Based on this information, answer the following questions:

- (a) Identify the stakeholders and their interests in the situation.
- (b) What are the dilemmas that a recruiting manager may face in such a scenario?
- (c) What are the different options available to you? Which one will you pursue and why?

20

आप देश की एक शीर्ष आईटी कंपनी के प्रबंधक हैं। आपको आगामी परियोजना के लिए नई भर्तियां करने का उत्तरदायित्व सौंपा गया है। आप पाते हैं कि सरकार द्वारा पारित किए गए नवीन मातृत्व कानून के आलोक में कंपनी ने महिला अभ्यर्थियों की भर्ती न करने का अकथित निर्देश दिया गया है। आप इसे अत्यधिक आपत्तिजनक पाते हैं और प्रबंधन के उच्च अधिकारियों से विरोध जताते हैं, लेकिन वे दृढ़ हैं क्योंकि वे सभी अनावश्यक व्यय में कमी करना चाहते हैं।

इस जानकारी के आधार पर, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

- (a) इस स्थिति में हितधारकों और उनके हितों की पहचान कीजिए।
- (b) वे धर्मसंकट क्या हैं जिनका ऐसी परिस्थिति में भर्ती प्रबंधक द्वारा सामना किया जा सकता है?
- (c) आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? आप किसका अनुसरण करेंगे और क्यों?

The maternity benefit act entitles women to 46 weeks of paid leave.

Stakeholders

- 1) Women → who will miss out on employment
- 2) The company → restricting its talent pool.
- 3) Families → who lose extra

income that women can
bring

- 4) Men → who are stereotyped into
roles of bread earners .

Dilemmas of the recruiting
manager :

1) Bound by company policy, or
she might lose her/his
job.

2) Manager understands the
unjust and discriminatory
nature of the policy, which
is against the spirit of the
law and the spirit of the
nation .

3) Manager also understands the
companies desire to not spend
extra money on paid leave.

OPTIONS AVAILABLE

- 1) Pursue the policy, and ignore ethical pinches of the conscience
- 2) Follow the policy, and risk being fired / demoted.
- 3) Undertake following steps:
 - a) Encourage management to set up crèche facilities in the company premises.
 - b) Make the management familiar with UN Women Studies that show better performance by parents to ~~the~~ who get adequate maternity / paternity leave.

Similar studies have been done in Sweden and Canada.

- c) Appeal to the management to consider advantages of

paternity leave as well.

We'll a similar petition to the government.

d) Assess the overall representative women in the upper administration of the company.
Contact them and request them to create pressure for reconsidering the policy.

4) Resign from job, or refuse myself from recruitment duties.

I would follow the third step fully, to its maximum extent. If the company does not reconsider the policy, I will try to look for a

job elsewhere .

10. There has been a perceptible rise in the cost of healthcare services provided by private hospitals. In absence of adequate and quality government hospitals, people are forced to opt for private hospitals, especially for life threatening diseases and injuries. You recently visit one of your friends admitted in a famous private hospital. You found out that the hospital is charging a huge amount of money, which seems to be unreasonable. You confront the staff and ask them to explain the rationale behind such high charges.

Their response is that the charges are fair for the kind of services they are providing.

- (a) What are the ethical issues involved in this situation?
- (b) Given how other professions price their services, discuss the feasibility of capping the amount of fees charged by doctors and private hospitals.
- (c) How can the provision of quality services and need for profit be reconciled with society's interests in this case? 20

निजी अस्पतालों द्वारा प्रदान की जाने वाली स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं की लागत में सुस्पष्ट वृद्धि हुई है। पर्याप्त और गुणवत्ता पूर्ण सरकारी अस्पतालों के अभाव में, लोग निजी अस्पतालों का विकल्प चुनने के लिए विवश हैं, विशेषकर जीवन के लिए खतरनाक बीमारियों और चोटों हेतु। आप हाल ही में एक प्रसिद्ध निजी अस्पताल में भर्ती अपने मित्र से मिलने जाते हैं। आपको पता चलता है कि अस्पताल बड़ी धनराशि वसूल रहा है जो आपको अनुचित या आवश्यकता से अधिक प्रतीत होता है। आप कर्मचारियों से बातचीत करते हैं और उनसे इस प्रकार के उच्च शुल्क के पीछे का तर्क समझाने के लिए कहते हैं। उनकी प्रतिक्रिया यह है कि उनके द्वारा जिस प्रकार की सेवाएँ प्रदान की जाती हैं उसके लिए यह शुल्क उचित है।

- (a) इस स्थिति से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं?
- (b) यह देखते हुए कि अन्य व्यवसाय अपनी सेवाओं का मूल्य कैसे तय करते हैं, चिकित्सकों और निजी अस्पतालों द्वारा आरोपित शुल्क की राशि पर सीमा निर्धारित करने की व्यवहार्यता पर चर्चा कीजिए।
- (c) इस प्रकरण में गुणवत्ता परक सेवाओं के प्रबंध और लाभ की आवश्यकता का समाज के हितों के साथ सामंजस्य कैसे स्थापित किया जा सकता है?

Ethical issues in providing very expensive medication :

- 1) Doctors take an oath to save lives → to refuse on grounds of finances is defrauding the oath.
- 2) Healthcare is a non-negotiable service — those who need it cannot forgo it.
Extravagant prices leave the patient no choice, thus they are an abuse of power by healthcare providers.
- 3) If a healthcare provider leaves someone to die because s/he is not able to pay, or to suffer, the provider is violating

Principles of natural justice

A just society would make refusal of healthcare criminally punishable, and access to healthcare a fundamental right.

- 4) Government failure to meet its obligations to society.

Capping amount of services will have the following impacts:

Pros

- 1) Affordable to people
- 2) Ethically sound move.

Cons

- 1) Will discourage pub. hospitals from providing the service
- 2) Will discourage manufacturers from creating required instruments.

Thus, will affect accessibility

To reconcile profit motives with societies interests, we can

- 1) Create a deeply penetrating insurance mechanism, especially govt. insurance. Current it only reaches 12% of the population.

This method is followed in USA.

- 2) Subsidize essential healthcare instruments.
- 3) Create generic drugs, which will reduce post-diagnosis costs.
- 4) NITI Aayog's PPP model for district hospitals can be leverage.

✕ — ✕

✕ — ✕

11. You are the District Magistrate in a district where a significant number of transgenders reside. While discrimination against the community is well known, commuters increasingly complain of harassment at their hands, especially at traffic junctions where transgenders are mostly involved in begging. This, at times, also leads to traffic management issues. You have received a number of complaints in this regard and have to act quickly to resolve it. However, a group of transgender associations argue that begging is their only source of livelihood.

Given the situation, answer the following questions:

(a) Describe the ethical issues involved in this case. Discuss the attitude of people towards transgenders in general and reasons for the same.

(b) What possible courses of action can be undertaken in such situations? Discuss their merits and demerits. 20

आप ऐसे जिले में जिला मजिस्ट्रेट हैं जहां ट्रांसजेंडर की बड़ी संख्या रहती है। यद्यपि इस समुदाय के विरुद्ध भेदभाव सुविदित है, तथापि यात्री उनके हाथों, विशेषकर यातायात जंक्शनों पर अधिकाधिक उत्पीड़न की शिकायत करते हैं, जहां ट्रांसजेंडर अधिकांशतः भीख मांगने में शामिल होते हैं। कभी-कभी, इससे यातायात प्रबंधन की समस्या भी पैदा होती है। इस संबंध में आपको कई शिकायतें मिली हैं और इसे हल करने के लिए शीघ्र कार्रवाई करनी है। हालांकि, ट्रांसजेंडर संघ के एक समूह का कहना है कि भीख मांगना उनकी आजीविका का एकमात्र स्रोत है।

इस स्थिति को देखते हुए, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

(a) इस प्रकरण से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दों का वर्णन कीजिए। ट्रांसजेंडर लोगों के प्रति जनसामान्य के सामान्य दृष्टिकोण और उसके कारणों पर चर्चा कीजिए।

(b) ऐसी स्थिति में क्या संभव कार्रवाई की जा सकती है? उनके गुणों और अवगुणों पर चर्चा कीजिए।

Transgenders are some of the most disadvantaged, persecuted and misunderstood groups in society.

The ethical issues involved in the above situation are:

1) Dilemma: ^{to} place social security (traffic issues) above rights of communities or vice versa?

2) ~~To~~ Social reality: mistrust and fear of transgenders.

Also Social reality: ~~also~~ lack of alternative livelihoods for transgenders.

Reconciling the two creates problems: which community to favour? How to balance the two communities? How to dispel notions of fear & mistrust? How to create social acceptance of transgenders?

People's attitudes towards transgenders:

1) Othering: they are not seen as

part of a community, or citizens of the same nation. But as something 'different'.

2) Violence → transgenders are attacked for the slightest provocations.

3) Fear, mistrust, disgust.

Reasons : 1) Patriarchal mindset, which divides the world into gender binaries. Anyone who doesn't fit into stereotypical definitions of 'men' & 'woman' cannot fit into a 'patriarchal' society, premised on division between ~~men~~ and women only.

2) Behavior of transgenders, who are so ostracised and discriminated against, that sometimes they take extreme steps to be noticed and to earn a living.

Courses of Action:

1) ~~Promoting~~ IMMEDIATE

1) Mandate state ^{traffic} police to monitor begging → if it becomes offensive and aggravated, then put a stop to it. Every situation handled independently.

2) If possible, hire a transgender in a vacant post, to increase representation, and acceptability of transgenders.

LONG TERM

1) Create alternate livelihood opportunities for transgenders, perhaps using the National Skilling Mission.

2) Sensitize people to the importance of transgenders in India's history → eg: Lord Krishna took

form of a woman to fulfil a dying king's wish for marriage.

3) Raise awareness about rights of transgenders.

4) Organise talks, seminars and mukhad nataks to raise awareness.

The merits may not be available immediately. Mindsets cannot be changed overnight. Thus the immediate steps may leave both parties dissatisfied, but that is the best course of action to uphold rights of all stakeholders involved.

The long term measure should not only solve the problem, but also create a more tolerant and inclusive society.

12. Mr. X is the head of an NGO working in the field of environment conservation and protection. He is in dire need of funds for the NGO's operations and payments to his staff. He is approached by an official of a large infrastructure company, who is ready to provide the required funding for the NGO. But, in a quid pro quo, he asks Mr. X to raise objections over the bypassing of Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) norms in an ongoing PPP project through his NGO. This project is being implemented by a rival infrastructure company. Mr. X knows that there have been instances of high level corruption in the process of granting EIA to mega projects and the information provided by the official seems to be authentic. Hence, he accepts the money and agrees to raise the objection.

(a) Considering the circumstances of the case, is Mr. X correct in accepting the money? Give appropriate reasons for your answer.

(b) If you were in place of Mr. X, what would have been your course of action? Give reasons for it.

20

श्री एक्स पर्यावरण संरक्षण और सुरक्षा के क्षेत्र में कार्यरत एक NGO (नैर सरकारी संगठन) के प्रमुख हैं। उन्हें NGO के संचालन और कर्मचारियों को भुगतान करने हेतु धन की अत्यन्त आवश्यकता है। एक बड़ी इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर कंपनी का एक अधिकारी उनसे संपर्क करता है। कंपनी NGO के लिए आवश्यक फंड उपलब्ध कराने को तैयार है। लेकिन उसके बदले वह कंपनी यह चाहती है कि श्री एक्स अपने NGO के माध्यम से चल रही PPP परियोजना में पर्यावरण प्रभाव आकलन (EIA) मानदंडों की अवहेलना पर आपत्तियां उठाएं। यह परियोजना प्रतिद्वंद्वी इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर कंपनी द्वारा कार्यान्वित की जा रही है। श्री एक्स को पता है कि बड़े प्रोजेक्ट्स के लिए EIA प्रदान करने की प्रक्रिया में उच्च स्तरीय भ्रष्टाचार के मामले सामने आए हैं और अधिकारियों द्वारा दी गई जानकारी प्रामाणिक प्रतीत होती है। इसलिए, वह धन स्वीकार कर लेते हैं और आपत्ति उठाने के लिए सहमत हो जाते हैं।

(a) प्रकरण की परिस्थितियों को ध्यान में रखते हुए, क्या श्री एक्स का धन स्वीकार करना सही है? अपने उत्तर के लिए उचित कारण दीजिए।

(b) यदि आप श्री एक्स के स्थान पर होते, तो आप क्या कदम उठाते? इसके कारण बताइए।

Mr. X is ~~caught~~ caught in an ethical dilemma → no course of action seems 'correct' or 'incorrect'.

Thus, Mr X chose the option that yielded best results for the environment.

→ His NGO's work continued with the money he accepted. Thus all projects which his NGO was working on to conserve and protect the environment continued.

→ The other PPP company, that was violating EIA norms, would now have to follow them (if Mr X is successful in his campaign). The positive externalities of following EIA

are immense and multifold.

Mr X. saw no good coming of rejecting the money and allowing the EIA violation to continue.

For, once the benefactor had brought the EIA violation to Mr X's attention, Mr. X would have raised an objection irrespective of the money granted or not.

Thus, Mr. X's acceptance seems correct, provided he does not try to hide the exchange.

If I were in Mr. X's position, I would

1) Assure the benefactor that the

'quid-pro-quo' wasn't
necessary. EIA violations
should be stopped.

2) Be clear ~~to~~ about the
transaction → update it on
my website, and inform
my staff.

3) Inform the benefactor that
the conflict of interest
could harm the authenticity
of any case I may lodge
against the EIA violative
company.

4) In case an objection is
raised about conflict of
interest once I begin pursuing
the case, I would try to find
another ~~party~~ NGO or concerned

citizen to pursue the case
instead of me.

13. You are a civil servant posted in a state where elections were recently held. The newly elected Chief Minister had promised to ban alcohol in several of his election campaigns as well as his election manifesto, which was widely praised and supported by women of the state. Fulfilling his electoral promise, the Chief Minister has ordered a blanket ban on the sale of alcohol in the state. Following the ban, concerns have been raised about the feasibility of the ban and whether the government should interfere in what is considered by many to be a matter of personal choice.

(a) Who are the stakeholders in this case and how are they affected by the ban?

(b) Is blanket ban on alcohol a feasible action?

(c) Identify the issues that may arise while enforcing the ban and the steps you will take to handle them, as a civil servant. 25

आप एक ऐसे राज्य में सिविल सेवक के रूप में तैनात हैं जहां हाल ही में चुनाव हुए थे। नव निर्वाचित मुख्यमंत्री ने अपने कई चुनावी अभियानों के साथ-साथ चुनाव घोषणापत्र में शराब पर प्रतिबंध लगाने का वादा किया था, जिसकी राज्य की महिलाओं ने व्यापक रूप से प्रशंसा की थी और समर्थन दिया था। अपने चुनावी वादे को पूरा करते हुए, मुख्यमंत्री ने राज्य में शराब की बिक्री पर पूर्ण प्रतिबन्ध का आदेश दिया है। प्रतिबंध के बाद, प्रतिबंध की व्यवहार्यता पर प्रश्न उठाए गये हैं और क्या सरकार द्वारा शराब पर प्रतिबन्ध जिसे कई लोगों द्वारा व्यक्तिगत पसंद का विषय बताया गया है, उस मुद्दे पर हस्तक्षेप करना चाहिए।

(a) इस मामले में हितधारक कौन हैं और प्रतिबंध से वे किस प्रकार प्रभावित हैं?

(b) क्या शराब पर पूर्ण प्रतिबन्ध एक व्यवहार्य कार्रवाई है?

(c) एक सिविल सेवक के रूप में इन प्रतिबंधों को लागू करते समय उत्पन्न होने वाली समस्याओं की पहचान करें और उनसे निपटने हेतु आप क्या कदम उठाएंगे।

STAKEHOLDERS

→ Political party - ban makes it look accountable, and like it fulfills its election promises

→ Women affected by alcoholism - they find relief from

intoxicated husbands, perhaps
relief from domestic violence.

→ LIQUOR COMPANIES and PLACES
SELLING LIQUOR → adversely
affected, lose profits. Many
might lose employment as an
entire industry is shut.

→ STATE FINANCES → lose out on
excise on manufacture of
alcohol and sales taxes!

→ ALCOHOL ADDICTS → forced into
cold turkey rehab.

May improve, or may
react violently, fall into
depression etc may turn to
illegal drugs.

→ PEOPLE WHO ENJOY LIQUOR IN
MODERATION → their right to
~~life~~ choose and right to
freedom is impinged upon.

FEASIBILITY OF BAN

- It is possible → eg Gujarat, Bihar.
- But the drawbacks → Corporate interests, small shops interests, fundamental rights, loss to public exchequer seem far too extreme.
- Women's problem may not be solved. — PATRIARCHY is root of the problem; and the ban does not address it at all. Alcohol induced violence and irresponsibility are likely to manifest in other ways.

ISSUES WHILE IMPOSING THE BAN:

- 1) Outcry by powerful corporate lobby
- 2) Resentment ~~write~~ by general public which enjoys alcohol.

- 3) Loss in tourism revenues,
business conference revenues
(as experienced by Bihar)
- 4) Increase in smuggling,
creation of a black market

As a civil servant, I will

- 1) ~~to~~ Ensure proper implementation
of the law.
- 2) Raise awareness of the
benefits of the law, of its
relevance to DPSP and
Gandhi's dream.
- 3) Undertake staff training to
deal with smuggling &
black markets.
- 4) Stay alert for efforts to
circumvent the law, and put
a stop to such efforts.

14. Regulation and procedure of human clinical trials vary from nation to nation. Stem cell research, as an emerging biomedical field, requires approval for human trials and encounters multiple challenges. You are the head of a team of scientists who developed a new Tissue Engineering system, which appears to be a promising means of regenerating heart tissue. Trials of the system have already been conducted on animals and yielded good results. Millions of people suffering from critical heart diseases would benefit immensely if this medication is immediately made available to them. However, you need to conduct human clinical trials before it could be commercialised. It is also known that the stringent regulatory environment in the country will mean that human trials and final approval will take many years before it is made commercially available. On the other hand, regulation of clinical trials in many poor countries is weak and quick approval is possible. Many of your competitors also resort to human trials in these countries, often bribing the officials for getting quick approvals.

Given this situation, answer the following questions:

- (a) Identify the ethical issues which arise during clinical trials.
(b) Given the above situation, would you prefer to shift human trials to a third country where regulations are lax? Give reasons in support of your choice.
(c) Suggest a framework of standard procedure to minimise ethical conflicts and speed-up the approval process of new medicines.

25

मानव पर नैदानिक परीक्षण (clinical trials) के विनियम और प्रक्रियाएं राष्ट्र दर राष्ट्र भिन्न हैं। एक उभरते बायोमेडिकल क्षेत्र के रूप में स्टेम सेल शोध के लिए मानवीय परीक्षणों हेतु स्वीकृति की आवश्यकता होती है और इसे चुनौतियों का सामना करना पड़ता है। आप वैज्ञानिकों के एक दल के नेतृत्वकर्ता हैं जिन्होंने एक नई टिशू इंजीनियरिंग सिस्टम विकसित किया है जो हृदय के उत्तकों (टिशूज) को पुनः पैदा करने हेतु आशावान माध्यम नजर आता है। इस सिस्टम का पहले ही जानवरों पर परीक्षण किया जा चुका है और उसके अच्छे परिणाम मिले हैं। गंभीर हृदय रोगों से जूझते लाखों-लाख लोगों को इसे अत्यधिक लाभ होगा यदि यह इलाज उनके लिए शीघ्र उपलब्ध करा दिया जाता है। हालांकि इसके वाणिज्यीकरण से पूर्व मानव पर नैदानिक परीक्षण करने की आवश्यकता होती है। यह भी ज्ञात है कि इसके वाणिज्यिक रूप में (बाजार में) उपलब्ध होने से पूर्व देश में विनियमन संबंधी कठोर वातावरण के कारण मानवीय परीक्षण और अंतिम स्वीकृति में वर्षों लग जाएंगे। वहीं दूसरी ओर बहुत से गरीब राष्ट्रों में नैदानिक परीक्षण सम्बन्धी विनियमन ढीले हैं और शीघ्र स्वीकृति संभव है। आपके बहुत-से प्रतिद्वंदी भी नैदानिक परीक्षण हेतु प्रायः ऐसे राष्ट्रों का रुख करते हैं जहां वे अधिकारियों को रिश्वत दे कर शीघ्र स्वीकृति प्राप्त कर लेते हैं।

दी गई परिस्थिति के अनुसार निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों के उत्तर दीजिए:

- (a) नैदानिक परीक्षण के दौरान उभरने वाले नैतिक मुद्दों की पहचान कीजिए।
(b) दी गई उपर्युक्त परिस्थिति में, क्या आप मानवीय परीक्षणों को किसी तीसरे देश में स्थानांतरित करना पसंद करेंगे जहां विनियमन ढीले हैं? अपने चयन हेतु कारण दीजिए।
(c) नैतिक संघर्ष को कम करने एवं नई दवाइयों हेतु स्वीकृति की प्रक्रिया को तीव्र करने के लिए मानक प्रक्रिया का एक प्रारूप सुझाइए।

ISSUES IN CLINICAL TRIALS

→ Some patients have to be given placebo, even though a cure to their condition is possibly available.

→ Side effects of the medication are not known, thus patients are put in unknown danger.

Long term effects are also not known.

→ Some companies reward clinical trial patients financially - this compromises right to choice → no one should be compelled, even economically, to participate in a clinical trial.

→ Clarity on when a drug can be declared effective is not there. If declared too early, it

can be dangerous. If declared too late, deprives people who need it.

→ Approvals and clearances for clinical trials do not have strict and fair regulations everywhere, which compromises patient safety and the quality of the trials.

If I had to conduct a trial, I would try to find a country where the process is fair, efficient and clean. If not found, I would stay in the country with the very strict environment as

1) My product will have greater market value & prestige.

2) Lax security in the third country could compromise the conduct of my scientists, and thus the quality of my product.

3) Lax regulations may endanger the trial patient, and if the drug is approved, then the final users.

FRAMEWORK FOR STANDARD PROCEDURE FOR CLINICAL TRIALS :

1) Compulsory listing of every possible side effect.

2) compensation in case of loss of life / extreme deficits.

By the govt, not the company, as it may discourage new

research.]

3) No financial reward for participation in the trial.
Only those patients who need it will participate.

4) International medical community should come together and create standards for :

1) approvals and clearances

2) Time period before a drug is accepted or rejected

3) Time period to monitor long term effects.

5) Stringent-punishment for wilfully delaying administrative requirements of clinical trials.

These components can come

together and create a
robust regime that
ensures safe medication
availability at the
earliest.